

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE RIOTS AT
SOWETO AND OTHER PLACES IN SOUTH AFRICA.

WHOLE SESSION:

18th FEBRUARY, 1977.

VOLUME 109

(Pages 5 179 - 5 290)

COMMISSION RESUMES ON 18/2/1977.

DR. YUTAR: May it please Your Lordship. My first two witnesses for this morning will be the chairlady and the vice-chairlady of the African Self Help Association, a registered welfare organisation of Johannesburg. I hand in to Your Lordship the two memoranda.

CHAIRMAN: Yes?

MARY LESTER DAWN HAGGIE, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: Mrs. Haggie, you are the Chairlady of the African Self Help Association. --- Yes. (10

A welfare organisation duly registered in Johannesburg?

--- Yes.

With offices at Johannesburg? --- Yes.

You have in response to an invitation by the Chairman of the Commission drawn up a memorandum which you have submitted to the Secretary? --- Yes.

And you have a copy in front of you? --- I have.

And I would like you to read it to His Lordship please.

--- Thank you. African Self Help is a charitable organisation which has been operating in Soweto since 1946. I have been (20
a member of the Association all that time and have been its
Chairman for 20 years. Throughout this period I have visited
Soweto regularly several times a month and have known some of
the residents for a generation. I and my committee are personally
acquainted with many of their problems. The original aim of
this Association was to help urban African women to establish
and run their own social services in whatever form these were
most needed. However, it soon became apparent that for the majority
of the women there was one need which out-stripped all others -
that for Day Nurseries or crèches. (30

Now Mrs. Haggie, now is it correct to say that the purpose
of/..

of this Association was confined then to the nurseries and crèches? --- Yes.

And it was assisting only the Black workers? --- I beg your pardon?

Assisting only the Black women? --- Yes, we have in fact two youth clubs and a number of small youth clubs that are run by these same women.

Same women. --- In the same premises.

Right. --- African Self Help has built 31 Day Nurseries and now cares for 3,500 children, more than half the number of (10 children in registered crèches in Soweto. In recent riots none of these institutions was damaged in any way and they are running as before. Soweto residents value the Day Nurseries and are fully aware of the desperate need for more. I feel very strongly as does my Executive Committee, that the provision of more crèches in Soweto would do much to prevent juvenile delinquency, malnutrition and the frustration and bitterness of many parents.

Would you stop there for a moment. Now these crèches are run for the welfare of the Black women and their children without any cost to them? --- No, the parents pay a monthly fee of (20 R5.

A monthly fee. --- Which goes towards the running. It does not of course in any way cover the costs, not even half the costs.

Yes. And the brunt of the costs of running these Day Nurseries and crèches is borne by? --- We get a grant from the West Rand Board, we used to get an even larger grant from the City Council.

Yes. --- And we..well it is now the West Rand Board grant has now caught up a bit and the rest is done through fund (30 raising both in Johannesburg and in Soweto, the White committees raises /..

raises funds in Johannesburg to assist because otherwise we could not possibly manage but the Black women do fund-raising themselves in Soweto.

And these crèches are supervised by yourself and your colleagues? --- Yes, they are staffed of course obviously by Black women and each one has a Black Service Committee, a group of local African women who help run it but we supervise the overall operation and the finances.

Are the Black women trained in this work? --- I beg your pardon? (10

The Black women are they trained in this work? --- Some of them are, some of them..there is no longer..there has not been for many years any official training for nursery school teachers for Black women and some of them were trained many years ago and just recently there has been some training available for them in Soweto.

Yes. Now on the two occasions that the Commission visited Soweto we noticed at these Day Nurseries and crèches that little children are beautifully dressed, cleanly dressed in their uniforms and play away very happily there on all sorts of games which (20 are provided for them. --- Yes.

And that of course continued right throughout the unfortunate riot period. I think there was one day when because there was such general unrest that they were closed but there was no damage of any kind done to the crèches. Might I just enlarge a little bit here?

Surely. --- We as I have said here, we look after 3,500 children and there are probably..these figures are mostly not accurate because nobody knows but as far as it can be estimated there are probably 95,000 children of this age group, under (30 school age, between 2 and 7 who are not able to find a place in/..

in any registered day nursery or crèche in Soweto and who are therefore left to their own devices while their parents go to work and this is a source of great worry, particularly to the mothers because they are either playing in the streets unsupervised or locked into the houses where they have to remain all day while their mothers are at work and we know from our own experience that this is a very great worry to young mothers who have to leave home early in the morning and leave their children with no adequate care. Our Day Nurseries follow a strict nursery school routine and the children are trained and kept clean. They (10 are also fed, they give them three meals a day and they are disciplined and by the time they are ready to go to school they are very orderly, well-behaved little people and the primary schools fall over themselves to take them, they want them so badly, rather than the children who have grown up in the streets.

CHAIRMAN: What are the ages of the children in the crèches?

--- From 2 to 7 officially My Lord, they mostly leave a bit younger than 7 but we only take them from 2.

DR. YUTAR: Mrs. Haggie, you and your colleagues, do you attend these nurseries daily? --- No. (20

How often? --- Well, before the unrest in Soweto they were visited once a week mainly by various members of the committee and people who went out to give assistance, to help over the bookkeeping and to see that they were being properly run, to take vegetables and do things like that.

They alternate so that at least there is a White person there every day? --- No, they were run well and by themselves most of the time by the Black women.

And then after..from the 16th of June onwards, the visitation, was that regular or not? --- No, we have had very little visiting since then. We have now reversed the process in/.. (30

in a way and the supervisors of the crèches come into town where we have a meeting with them every fortnight and assist them as far as we can with their problems and with their books and so on but of course it is not as satisfactory.

And what is your reason for not..for the White colleagues of yours going there to the crèches and..(intervenes). --- Well, immediately after the riots and until last week or so, we were not..we obviously have to have permits.

Yes. --- To go in which are issued to us from 8 in the morning until 4 in the afternoon but those permits were not (10 being issued, until a couple of weeks ago and we were discouraged by the Board for our own safety's sake, from going in.

Was Mrs.Carruthers one of your colleagues? --- No.

She wasn't. Now she did do this sort of work there too? --- No, she went out I think only on one occasion on that day rather unfortunately.

It was her second visit to Soweto? --- Yes, and she went with one of our regular helpers but she has never been in any way associated with us.

You know of course what happened to them on that journey? (20 --- Yes, I do.

All right, would you continue please, the fourth paragraph.

--- I would like to stress again that none of our Day Nurseries was affected during the recent unrest. Some of the parents have sent their children away to relatives for safety, but they are mostly paying their fees in order to keep their places open. Throughout this unhappy period the Supervisors and staff have continued to do their work faithfully and as well as they could in the face of great difficulties and some danger. Of approximately 200 African women employed by the Association, over half (30 have worked in the crèches for more than 5 years and some for over/..

over twenty. The women in charge have nearly all been there from 10 to 20 years. They are a responsible and mature body of people. In the early days of the Association many of them worked voluntarily and they are all concerned with building a stable community for themselves and their children. Over the years we on the Committee have become conversant with the problems of everyday life in Soweto as seen by these women. There are several which recur and which have become more pressing recently. In this regard we have heard it said frequently in the past few years that the young people were no longer prepared (1) to put up with things as they are and that they felt that life would not be worth living for them unless changes were made in the laws affecting Blacks. The greatest number of complaints which we hear, relate to (1) Housing, (2) Education, (3) Influx Control and (4) Job Reservation.

Right. Now Mrs. Haggie, as I told you in the course of our short consultation the one omission there which struck me very forcibly is the absence of a complaint about transport. Has that never been mentioned to you? --- Well, not as much. and I think you see the people that I deal with certainly (20) either live in Soweto and do not go in and out to work or are talking about their children to whom the transport has not been I don't think, one of the major problems. It is as we all know a problem for the adults coming in to work in the town but I personally didn't think it was one of the main problems. There is another one that perhaps comes in on that and that of course is Group Areas that people complain that they have to live so far from their work and therefore their transport is excessively difficult.

Well, we will confine ourselves now to the four you have (30) mentioned and we deal first with housing. --- Shall I go on reading?/..

reading?

Would you please. --- The shortage of housing which causes young families to go on living in very cramped conditions with their parents is doubly resented because of the restrictions on building and home ownership. Ethnic grouping is also unpopular. A cause of great worry is the fact that children who happen to have been born "at home with Granny" have difficulty in getting onto house permits. Should I enlarge on that one?

Would you please? --- Very often if a girl is going to have a baby she goes home or not home, but goes back to the country to have this baby because it is much easier for her than to have it in the very crowded conditions in Soweto. Then she is not allowed to bring that child..it may stay with the grandmother for a little while until it is a little bit older and then if it wants to come back to live with its mother in Soweto there is no way that it can be allowed onto the house permit. This is a great problem. Also if children are sent away for their own good when they are small because it easier for them to be looked after by somebody in the country then it is very difficult for them to get back onto the house permit. (10 (20

But now what is the objection to having the baby born to reside with the parents? --- Well I think several difficulties. If the house is as crowded as it usually is, it is very difficult to have a birth going on as well. There are children trying to do their schoolwork, there are young married couples living there, it is sometimes easier to go somewhere else to have the baby.

Yes, no I was talking after the baby has been born and looked after a little while, what is the difficulty of bringing that child back to the..(intervenes). --- Well then it doesn't get permission to live in Soweto because it wasn't actually born in/.. (30

in Soweto.

And who raises that objection? --- The mother who wants the child to live with her.

Yes, but now how doesn't allow that? --- Well, it is not allowed on the permit, this is influx control.

Right. --- I think the difficulty in the housing of course also if I could just say this, is very deeply felt by young children working for exams or working at all because they nearly all have to share a bedroom with four or five other people who are maybe working and want to put the candle out at night and don't want the child to work, that is another housing problem. (10

Oh, I just wanted to know whether it was officialdom that was preventing this child coming back? --- Well, because every householder has to have permission for the people who are living in that house to live there and if the baby was not actually born in Soweto it would not get permission to come and live with its mother and father in that house.

Right. --- (2) All aspects of Bantu Education appear to be bitterly resented. It is felt to be an inferior system designed to keep Africans only partly educated. Specific complaints have often been made about the teaching of some subjects in Afrikaans and also the enforced use of the vernacular in lower primary schools which makes it doubly difficult for pupils to adapt suddenly into English in high schools. The provision of subjects called by different names from those in White schools is regarded with suspicion; e.g. environmental studies, agricultural science. The main complaint of course is against the lack of schools, crowded classrooms and the fact that Black children have to pay for their school books. (30

Would you like to enlarge on that? --- I don't think so unless/..

unless you want me to.

No. I think the question of school books, that has been rectified now. --- Yes, I believe so, it hasn't quite gone into operation. (3) The young people catered for in the Association's Youth Clubs are very bitter about the fact that they are not allowed to look for jobs where they wish and cannot sell their labour in the best market. They resent most deeply having to take what is offered by the authorities for fear of being endorsed out of Soweto if they turn down more than three jobs, however unsuitable. I think this is a very great source of frustration that they can't go and look for work where they want it and that you know, they have to take whatever is given them. (4) The same young people and their parents become increasingly frustrated by the fact that however hard they work at school and however many sacrifices are made to pay for their education young Black people find the only jobs available to them are inferior to those easily acquired by young White people with the same or less education. This they sort of joke about themselves the young Black people and say: I don't know why you are bothering to take your matric, you will end up in a messenger's uniform anyway. This is felt very deeply that there are very few openings available to them and that they can't get there. It is our experience with the women who work for us that they will make enormous sacrifices at any time to get their children educated, they spend a lot of their money on education and they go on with grown-up children trying to get them through to matric and then when at the end of it say at 24 the boy matriculates and he still ends up as a messenger, then he gets very annoyed. In our opinion the ordinary Black man and woman in Soweto are not seeking violent means of affecting change. However, they are becoming more and more frustrated/..

(10

(20

(30

frustration and the older generation is regarded with contempt by the younger because they have put up with so much for so long. We feel that it is possible to make changes immediately within the framework of the present system which will greatly alleviate the rising bitterness and despair. Finally, I would like to say that the women employed by this Association did not anticipate any trouble on June the 16th. This is borne out by the fact that they all turned up for a meeting in Phefeni on that day. They are now coming into town for meetings of the Association and they tell us their impressions. They feel (10 that the original manifestations were genuine and spontaneous expressions of the children's grievances. Thereafter, as violence escalated, the tsotsi and other elements took over and now no one knows what is happening or why. They just wish it would stop. This was written in September of course things have changed a little bit since then.

CHAIRMAN: I am not quite clear when you speak of the women employed by the Association, whether you are referring to the Black women..(intervenes). --- Black women entirely, yes.

Phefeni..is the station quite close to Orlando-West High (20 School, is that correct? --- Yes.

Yes, within about a kilometer of that.. --- Would you say..yes, I suppose..yes it is very near the railway line, it is near..just near the Pumelong Station.

That is correct, it is Pumelong Station. --- Pumelong Station, yes.

It is closer to it than Phefeni. --- Yes.

DR. YUTAR: And none of them breathe a word of any rioting since they..(intervenes). --- No. This is..I was not in the country on the 16th of June, and Mrs. Newton Thompson took the meeting (30 and she would be able to tell you much more detail of the day,

but/..

but none of them..and afterwards they said they had no idea that it was going to happen.

Is there anything else you would like to say, Mrs. Haggie?
--- I don't think so, thank you.

Well, this was written as you say in September. ---
When I returned from overseas and I met them all again, they were very frightened and very worried and they didn't know what was happening and here again I think Mrs. Newton Thompson can probably elaborate more than I can. There was an unfortunate general fear of the police at that stage and they..when I got (10
back and we said you know, what is happening, what is wrong, they said the police must just stop shooting our children, they kept on saying that. Mrs. Newton Thompson was here and she would be able to give you more first-hand information.

All right. I have no further questions. --- Thank you.

CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

DR. YUTAR: I now call Mrs. Philippa Newton Thompson.

PHILIPPA NEWTON THOMPSON, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: Mrs. Newton Thompson, you are the Vice Chairlady (20
of the Association of which the last witness is the chairlady?
--- That is correct.

You likewise have submitted a short and pertinent memorandum regarding the riots that broke out at Soweto and you have submitted it to the Commission. --- Yes.

And you would like to read it out. Would you do so please? --- I would like to submit a memorandum for the Commission now sitting to inquire into the Soweto trouble. On June 16th the African Self Help Association held its monthly meeting at the Ikwezi Club, Phefeni. Our Chairman was away (30
and as Vice Chairman of the Association I took the meeting. I
personally/..

personally am also involved in the control of building extensions to four day nurseries run by the Association and the building of a youth club. All the work is being done on a labour and material basis with African contractors. The West Rand Board were unable to undertake the work. Early on the morning of June, the 16th, I visited some of the building work and was driving from Senoaone on the main road which runs past the Urban Bantu Council building at about 9.30 a.m. I met a demonstration by hundreds of children marching towards Molapo. The children were all good humoured and obviously enjoying their demonstration. (10

A boy of about 15 or 16 took it upon himself to guide my car slowly through the oncoming children but after a few minutes when the wave of children seemed endless he suggested I drive onto the parking area of a garage at Moletsane outside which I had then arrived. This I did. The children continued to march past waving banners about the abolition of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction. After a further 5 or 10 minutes a rather older youth came up to me and said: You must go in that direction, indicating a side road, and that is an order. As I was beginning to be concerned about the 10 a.m. start of our meeting I didn't (20

hesitate and found my way through Tladi and back onto the road. I went to the building operations at Mofolo North leaving a message for the builder that I would return at 12.30. I had had a previous meeting..date with him at 10.30 I think it was.

None of the responsible workmen or carpenters suggested that I might not be able to keep the appointment. From there, I drove straight to the Club at the back of Phefeni station where we held our meeting. The meeting was over at about 11.30 and again although the Supervisors of our 31 day nurseries and several of our European helpers had met with demonstrating children, no (30

one was concerned and the Supervisors had no knowledge that anything

other than the children marching peacefully was in the wind. One helper who planned to drive the Supervisor of the crèche to which she is attached back to the crèche, came back shortly after the meeting ended and told the people remaining in the Clubhouse that she had been informed by the police that all Whites must be out of the township as soon as possible. Trouble was expected.

What time..Oh, that was at 11.30? --- That was at about.. well, about 20 to 12 I should imagine. I had meetings scheduled with the Painter/Foreman of the West Rand Board and also with (10 a representative of Plascon Evans. I drove to Nancefield to use the telephone to cancel the Plascon Evans appointment and also that with the West Rand Board official. Remarkably the crèches have continued with minor interruptions since June and with varying degrees of attendance. The Association now meets with its Supervisors twice a month at a venue in Johannesburg. The building operations have also continued quietly and steadily and the contractors have been eminently responsible and reliable, meeting with me once or twice a week at Uncle Charlie's or some pre-arranged place on the Baragwanath road. Of course I have (20 also been into Soweto during last year with West Rand Board officials and with the knowledge of the various people concerned in the building programmes in Soweto and this year there has been no problem about going in. But it has been very essential really to go and see what is happening to the building operations in these various jobs. I have however been considerably depressed about the number of reports of collusion by the Police with the hostel dwellers. I realise that the Police have an unenviable job and a difficult one but it is obviously becoming a fact that the inhabitants of Soweto have no respect for the impartiality (30 of the Police. We have been regaled by numerous eye-witness accounts/..

accounts by responsible and sober citizens of Soweto and in this connection I feel that it was a great tragedy that the Police authorities did not immediately say that any such reports would be investigated instead of denying these reports. Also the people of Soweto believe that the Police are trigger happy and are inclined to shoot even at small children who through bravado might walk past them giving a Black Power salute. I recognise the provocative nature of such actions but would hope that this could have been allowed to burn itself out without over-reaction. (10

Mrs. Newton Thompson, these people who make these reports do you know them? --- Yes, they were Supervisors of the.. of various day nurseries, people in responsible positions and also the various builders with whom I have been working. I have had four eminently responsible building contractors and they have given all sorts of really horrifying reports of particularly during the time when the hostel dwellers revolted, of police being seen carting hostel dwellers round to a particular area and then sort of allowing them out of the trucks to seemingly sort of start up another confrontation somewhere else and at the one youth club which we finished at the end of last year at Senoaone the children started to come and to use this building until one of the policecars was seen cruising round the building and the children were completely intimidated and this building has been lying idle until really very recently the children have been frightened to use the building, which seems very sad. (20

According to these reports that you have received, how many children were killed by shooting on the part of the police? --- Well I think we have only had two reports of children who were allegedly shot. (30

Wouldn't/..

Wouldn't you ask these people who made the reports to you..(intervenes).. --- Well, I think..(intervenes).

To come forward and testify, they have the protection of the Commission, they can testify in private. --- I think they were investigated, I think they were investigated by Brig. Visser.

Yes. --- I think they were.

But now those who spoke of police brutality to you.. --- Not to me.

Not to you? --- Not to me at all. (10

Who did they speak to then? --- I'm afraid I didn't hear.

Who made these reports to you? --- The supervisors made the reports to me, there was no police brutality to me, but supervisors made the reports to me and well..to the Association to our meetings which we held subsequently at this venue in Johannesburg and very often the supervisors would get up and tell, and Mrs. Haggie in those meetings would say: Now I don't want to hear any sort of hearsay, I only want to hear a report of somebody who has had..has actually seen an incident. And (20 then we had three or four people who got up and told of a particular incident, I have rather forgotten the actual incidents because one..at the time one didn't really quite know what to do about it or how to deal with the situation, one could just express sympathy and say that this Commission was..we did try and persuade some of our women to give evidence, but I think they were all afraid.

Well, would you try and speak to them again and assure them they have no reason to be afraid because they can testify here anonymously and they can even speak to His Lordship in the (30 privacy of his office. --- Yes, well we can certainly put that

to/..

to them.

We want to get down to the basis of it and..(intervenes).

--- No, we can certainly..(intervenes).

To have it rectified if it is true and if it is false then to have the denial made. --- Yes, we could certainly do that.

Right. --- Being involved in Soweto with our Youth Club at Phefeni we were all aware of the talking point of the enforcement of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction. One gathered that the children were unable to grasp subjects in Afrikaans and (10 many teachers were unable to teach their subjects in Afrikaans. Everyone was extremely unhappy about this point, and even now we hear that parents are not keen for their children to sing songs at the crèches in the vernacular as it is thought that this is the start of a Bantu Education. Obviously we discourage this idea firmly and vocally, for all pre-school institutions do not set out to teach anything but hygiene, manners and discipline. I believe that the African Self Help Association provides a marvellous service to the community of Soweto and it is well respected by all. I very much hope that we will be able to (20 continue to provide the back-up service as before.

And you are in fact doing so, aren't you? --- And we are in fact doing so.

Is there anything else you would like to say by way of explanation or additional information? --- I don't think so. I think that's all.

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

DR. YUTAR: My Lord, the next witness..the next witnesses are a number of four and it was arranged that they would come at (30 11.30. I am able to continue with the witness of the Quakers but/..

but that will be long. I was just wondering whether..M'Lord I could start with Miss Gibson right away but then again I have got to attend to these four witnesses at 11.30 sharp. I wonder whether perhaps it wouldn't be advisable to take the adjournment now and start with these four witnesses at 11.30 because Miss Gibson is going to be very long.

CHAIRMAN: Well, in case they arrive before..(intervenes).

DR. YUTAR: If they arrive before then we can start before.

CHAIRMAN: Yes, I think that would be the best.

COMMISSION ADJOURNS FOR TEA.

(10

COMMISSION RESUMES.

DR. YUTAR: My Lord, I have promised to call Dr. Rabinovitz at 11.30 and I am glad to say it is 11.30 sharp. Right.

DR. EMMANUEL RABINOVITZ, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: Dr. Rabinovitz, you are by profession a medical man? --- Yes.

And you hold the degrees of M.B., B.Ch. and D.P.M. --- Yes.

D.P.M. Standing for? --- Diploma of Psychological Medicine.

(20

And you are the Medical Director of the Johannesburg Child Guidance Clinic with offices at Johannesburg? --- Yes.

You have prepared with the assistance of Mrs. Stewart, the next witness and others, a short memorandum for placing before this Commission? --- Yes.

Do you have a copy of it in front of you? Would you be so kind as to read it please. Has Your Lordship got a copy?

CHAIRMAN: No, I haven't. It doesn't matter.

DR. YUTAR: Doctor, would you be so kind as to read it please?

--- Thank you. A feature of the recent disturbances in

(30

Black areas has been the breakdown in communication, not only

between/..

between Black and White communities, but between parents and children within the Black communities. The Johannesburg Child Guidance Clinic would like to submit a most serious comment on the nature of this breakdown, its origins and its effects. It is in the experience of family life that children learn to internalise morality. The injunctions of parents are gradually absorbed by the young child. In families which are secure and content the education of children will take place in an atmosphere of patience and affection and the children will modify their aggression and selfish impulses out of love for the parents (10 upon whom they are emotionally dependent. In families which are insecure and discontented the education of children will take place in an atmosphere of impatience or hostility and the children will therefore modify their aggression and selfish impulses out of fear of the parents. But whatever type of family supplies the upbringing the child in a family gradually internalises some sort of morality which allows certain behaviours and disallows others. In other words, family life provides social values. Where family life itself is broken up by social or economic stress, the upbringing of children is interfered with (20 and serious, negative social consequences follow. This, it is suggested, is the nature of the present breakdown between parents and children in the Black areas of the country. Ongoing, stable, secure relationships between parents and between parents and children are rare. Generations of children grow up without parental affection, care or discipline. The origins of the problem can be found in the country's economic and social history. Black family life has been negatively affected partly by economic pressures which force women to work while children are still very young. It has also been undermined by laws that (30 have political objectives which disregard basic, psychological and/..

and emotional realities. Such as the Group Areas legislation, influx control, job reservation and the Immorality Act, etc. All these are examples of laws..(intervenes)

CHAIRMAN: I presume that you mean Section 16 of the Immorality Act? Because the rest of the Act deals with matters completely different to Section 16. --- This would refer to Section 16, My Lord.

They refer to children under 16, the other sections and all the other protections which society needs. --- All these are examples of laws which disrupt and undermine Black family (10 life. Now the effects of family breakdown are manifest in social disruption. Parents have lost their authority. They are no longer respected by their children who have internalised values from outside the home, values learned in the street, in delinquency gangs, in the actions of power groups rather than through identification with the establishment. The normal rewards are missing. The necessary security is lacking. Black parents have no status in the eyes of society and can therefore offer their children little by way of example of worthwhile goals. The politics of envy then operate instead. Young Black children (20 and students regard the material benefits of society not as rewards that they may reach through training and effort but as treasures to be coveted and stolen if necessary from the Whites who possess them. Children who are witness to the subjugated condition of their parents, to their lack of status and loss of dignity, will resort to violence in order to restore the dignity of the parental images whose roles as authority figures have been diminished by deprivation of their ordinary rights. It needs to be borne in mind that children are influenced by current historical changes and these will be passed on to their(30 descendants. It is therefore in society's interest - both in the/..

the long term and short term - to remove the laws which are obstacles in the way of the child's normal development into a responsible adult. The law abiding parent is an essential pillar of any stable community, Black or White. His status and his value should be clearly recognisable to the growing child in terms of the rewards society offers him. It should be clear to all that the good parent enjoys comfortable living, educational opportunities for his children, prestige in his neighbourhood. These are the signs which act as incentives and motivation for the young, and which protect the stable maintenance of social values over time. It would seem that the primary objective of restoring and protecting the dignity of Black family life should be regarded as a priority in order to safeguard social stability. This My Lord, concludes my memorandum. (10

May I say that I am extremely grateful to you for..you dealt with this particular problem and how it arises and what its effects are. Now, do you think that there has in the present situation come a rebellion of the child against the parent?

--- I would say yes, My Lord. (20

Which would look in some instances the fight which the child has won? Or don't you think it has gone as far as that?

--- May I say respectfully My Lord, it is a case which the parent has lost.

Has lost? --- Yes.

When therefore the parent remarks about..makes remarks about his children and he says: Do not ask me what the reasons are, ask the children, he is in fact admitting that he has lost this battle? --- I think the Black parent feels he has lost his authority and his dignity. This is something that a normal child is unable to tolerate, it is very difficult for (30

a Black child to see a parent who is undignified, has no authority, and is no longer the man in his own home.

Is it principally in his own home where the child senses this difficulty? --- Not only in his home, but in the.. outside the home as well.

You see another attitude..(radio interference)..

DR. YUTAR: Do we have breakdowns not only in the family life but even in..(radio interference).

CHAIRMAN: It has been said to the Commission that the children have intimated that they are impatient and that as their parents (10 had not obtained what they should have obtained, in life, they the children will take over now and see that..obtained by different methods and that is by the methods of violence or unrest in the way in which they have tried to do. Now, would you say that that indicates a complete breakdown of family life? --- I would say it is a most significant contribution to the breakdown of family life.

Now you would then be left with a new generation of youngsters whose parents are these very people who have now been separated from their families. What could the effect of that (20 fact be on the new family? --- I think this would compel the child to look for some kind of way to repair the original structure of the family, in other words, to restore their parents to their rightful position because as pointed out in the memorandum, values are learned, certain values are learned within the structure of family life, the sense of right and wrong. If there is no authoritarian father, a dignified authoritarian father, to teach these values, the child will resort to rebellion against society in order to look for some kind of substitute control so the natural tendency of the child (30 is to try and repair a broken situation in this case the broken situation/..

situation being family life.

Now what would you say of the suggestion that as the this is apart from family life now, that where those who have rioted have found some satisfaction in concessions that have been made to them, that that is for the worse? In other words that they..they would then merely ask for further and perhaps..remedies or changes which they would not be entitled to? Because something has been granted to them, be it for example a change in the education? --- Concessions by themselves are not enough to allay their grievances. As I said before that (10 the root of the problem lies in the disturbance of family life.

So that you think the concessions as such may not have an escalation of the violence? --- If concessions can bring about a repair in the structure of a family, I think many of the grievances that lead to violence would perhaps in some ways be alleviated.

DR. YUTAR: I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, doctor. --- Thank you.

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

DR. YUTAR: I call as my next witness Mrs. Stewart. (20

JEAN McDONALD STEWART, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: Mrs. Stewart, you hold the degrees of Bachelors of Social Studies, M.A. Social Work. --- Social Work, yes.

Obtained at the local university? --- At Wits, yes.

Yes, well of course we are in Pretoria now, at Wits.

--- Yes.

And you together with the last witness as well as Mesdames Steyn, Gordon Wynberg drew up this memorandum which Dr. Rabinovitz has just read to the Commission? --- Yes.

Now, is there anything else you would like to say in (30 addition to what Dr. Rabinovitz has said? Or would you like

to/..

to deal with any of the posers posed by His Lordship? ---
I would like if I may to try and elaborate on the points
that you raised just now, could I do that?

CHAIRMAN: By all means. --- I think that the point that
we were trying to make was that the authority of the parents
is in the interests of society that we can't really govern
without parents, they are the ones who imbue the child with
a respect for law and order and really, the difficulty is that
if the parents and the state are not converging on that, that
seems to me to be where the difficulty lies. If the parents (10
can feel that what they are teaching the child is what society
is also teaching the child then I think there is automatically
a preservation of law and order. It is where there is a difference
and that is perhaps what we meant by the breakdown. That you
know, that the parents are saying one thing but society is
saying another and this causes the conflict I think. They don't
then believe the parents any more.

DR. YUTAR: When you speak of society I take it you include
also Government policy as interpreted and applied by society?
--- I do yes. (20

And your point is that there should be a convergence of
points of view. --- Yes, if these were congruent, there would
be no double message then it would all follow.

Is there anything else you would like to say? --- I
think that is all thank you.

CHAIRMAN: May I put another question to you, Mrs. Stewart. It
has been said that parents in many instances have shrugged their
shoulders and have done nothing to stop the violence, just to
put it bluntly and that that is because they are in fact secretly
condoning it for the purpose for which it is applied. Now what (30
would you say to that, is that possible? --- I think it could
very/..

very well be. Because they must feel that what they are trying to do as parents, is not something that is supported in their own interests from outside, you know that what they are trying to teach and what they have to get themselves as parents is quite different. There is an impossible dilemma for the parents. He can't say to his child: This is what is right in society because he himself feels he is not getting that. So I think it might well be as you suggest.

DR. YUTAR: I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

(10

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS

DR. YUTAR: My Lord, Mrs. Newton Thompson would like to come back to the witness stand, she omitted a certain aspect of her evidence and she would like to elaborate on it.

CHAIRMAN: She may return.

PHILIPPA NEWTON THOMPSON (recalled):

DR. YUTAR: You would like to bring to the notice of His Lordship a certain aspect which you omitted to deal with when you testified earlier. --- Yes, it was of particular interest and there is somebody in the court who is prepared to substantiate (20 it and therefore I felt perhaps it was important that I should come back and just tell of this instance. I did actually mention that I am involved in building operations and I meet with the builders every week and have done so since June 16th and they have never once let me down. On a certain day when we had arranged to meet at Uncle Charlie's, it was thought prudent to meet there rather than further along the Baragwanath road, the builder..one of the builders, his motor car had broken down and he had taken the trouble to get a Minister, one of the local Ministers from Phenowani to bring him to our meeting. And they (30 were very anxious to get back to Soweto because in fact it was the/..

the day that Dr. Kissinger had arrived in this country and the children of the Sekonontoa High School where the Minister's child was at school were demonstrating. I think that at that stage the children were very keen to demonstrate on any occasion and they had in fact so they told me, locked themselves into the school grounds on that day. Well, that was that, we had our meeting and they went off fairly early and when I met with the builder the following week I said I hope that all was well and that they had got back safely and found everything all right. Yes, he said that they had, that the children were all right but the desperate thing that had happened at the school when the children had locked themselves into the school the police had come and shot the locks off the gates of the school which I felt was really very uncalled for and that was the incident that I felt that I hadn't made mention of and I.. (intervenues). (10)

CHAIRMAN: Shot the lock on the..(intervenues). --- On the gates. The children had locked themselves into the school and the police had shot the locks off the gates. I don't know what the children were actually demonstrating but as I say there is somebody in the court whose child was also at that school and it was only on learning that fact that I felt that it was a pity that I hadn't mentioned this particular instance. (20)

DR. YUTAR: What school was it? --- This is the Sekonontoa High School in Senoane.

Do you know who called for the police? --- I don't know.

And do you know why the police came there at all? --- I don't know, I don't know the facts of that.

Well, perhaps the gentleman you referred to, may be able to tell us? --- He might be able to tell one. (30)

All right then.

CHAIRMAN/..

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS

DR. YUTAR: My Lord, it looks as if we are going to have an American field day because the next witness is Mr. Columbus Malebo to be followed by the Quakers.

COLUMBUS MALEBO, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: You arrived here this morning in the company of the group of people known as the Quakers, who are coming to give evidence this morning, is that right? --- That's right.

Yes, and what is your position in that organisation? --- (10
I am a member in the committee, sir.

A member of the committee? --- Yes.

And what is your position or your calling? --- I am a Medical Technologist, sir.

Working at? --- Medical Research, the South African Institute for Medical Research.

In Johannesburg. --- In Johannesburg.

Right. Now you had a meeting with Mrs. Newton Thompson during the tea interval and she mentioned this incident? ---
That is right. (20

And you are able to give us direct evidence with regard to that incident? --- Indirect sir. This is a report from my child.

I beg your pardon, a report from your child. --- Yes.

Now, would you tell His Lordship what was the report you received from your child? --- One afternoon when I got back from work, my first-born who is 12 years old was very frightened and this was the second time during the time of upheavals that I had found her so frightened. She told me that they had been in the school grounds at Sekonontoa with the gates locked up (30
and that the children were demonstrating round the school building/..

building with their placards on the fence, saying they do not want Dr. Kissinger. Then the police came, and I don't know where from, they shot off the lock from the gate and entered the school yard. The teachers, some of them, most of them males and females, ran into the classrooms into the principal's office and locked themselves up, leaving the children to the mercy of the police who terrorised them, and they ripped off the police that is, ripped off the placards and took them away with them.

CHAIRMAN: Now in what way do you say "terrorised" them? --- (10
I beg your pardon Your Lordship?

In what way did they terrorise, did the police terrorise the children? --- They were shooting at them, sir.

Shooting at the children? --- They were shooting at the children according to the report.

DR. YUTAR: Were any children hit? --- None.

And none were hit and none were killed? --- None were hit, none were killed.

Well, they must be very bad shots the police then if they were in fact shooting at the children? --- Well, it does look (20
like they were merely frightening them, sir. But the mere shooting itself had a terrible effect on the children.

Yes. --- Because even days after as it was already the case, children were frightened of getting..were very afraid to get to school, they had seen a lot of shooting and actual killing.

But let us confine ourselves to this day and this report. Do you know what the children were doing, were they inside the school grounds or inside the school buildings? --- They were inside of the school grounds, sir and rounding up the school buildings. (30

And do you know who is the principal of that school?
--- I don't know the principal, sir.

Do you know whether the principal had in fact sent for the police? --- I have no idea.

Do you know who locked the gates? --- I have no idea sir.

Yes, and you don't know why the police came there? --- I have no idea, sir.

You see I am going to have this investigated. What is the name of the school please? --- Sekonontoa.

And what day was this more or less? --- S-e-k-o-n-o-n-t-o-a.

What is it, a primary school? --- It is a high school. (10

A high school. --- Secondary school.

And do you remember the date? --- I don't remember the date.

You don't remember the date. Do you remember the month? --- I am not very sure of the month.

Was that the day Dr. Kissinger arrived in this country? --- That's right.

Well, we will be able to establish the date. --- It was the day Dr. Kissinger was around.

Do you know who locked the gates? --- I don't know who (20 locked the gates.

You don't know, but you do know that no child was hit? --- No child was hit, no child was killed.

All right. I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: Thank you. --- Thank you, sir.

NO FURTHER QUESTIONS.

SELMA BROWDE, sworn states:

DR. YUTAR: Dr. Browde, you have prepared a memorandum and annexures for submission to this Commission? --- Yes.

I think details of your career are stated in the introduction, so let us get to it straight away and ask you to read that/.. (30

that please, will you? --- I first entered politics in 1972 when I was elected as the first Progressive Party member of the Johannesburg City Council. Until then I had worked exclusively in my profession as a medical doctor and after specialising in 1967 as a Consultant in Therapeutic Radiology in the Cancer Department of the Johannesburg General Hospital. When I took up my duties as a City Councillor in 1972 I was totally unprepared for the deluge of requests for assistance from all sections of the Black community. Until this time my knowledge of Soweto was minimal. As a result of contact (10 with housewives, office workers, unskilled labourers, nurses, teachers, youths belonging to church groups, residents' associations etc. I gained an insight into problems and difficulties of the daily lives of the residents of Soweto. My approach to these problems was mainly on a humanitarian level. I worked mainly behind the scenes. I contacted officials at all levels in order to obtain satisfaction for the people who were in distress. Of the many hundreds of cases that came through my private office which is a converted garage in my backyard, very few did I bring to the attention of the Press or public. May I just (20 comment at that stage?

Certainly. --- The reason why I put this in specifically was that I had been accused some time or other of using these cases and so on for publicity and the files in my office bear testimony to the fact that 99.9% of my work was never known about. As a result of my realisation that the problems of these individuals were in fact caused by the unsatisfactory structure and management of the whole of Soweto, I began making both public statements and private appeals to Government authorities in the conditions in Soweto. Solving individual problems was not even (30 scratching the surface and it became clear to me that unless

major/..

major steps were taken to ensure that Soweto residents could improve their quality of life, in an environment of a secure, settled community it would be courting disaster. Over the past three years I became strongly conscious of a deterioration in the conditions in Soweto as well as in the mood of the people. I believe this too has been the result of the take-over by the West Rand Administration Board. The events in the neighbouring states such as the independence of Mozambique and the war in Angola was also an important contributory factor to the changing mood. My opinion that the take-over by the W.R.A.B. is the more (10 important factor, is based on the fact that the majority of people who have become more bitter in their attitude towards their hardships, have been those who appear to be not in the least politically conscious or aware. In fact, I solicited a wide range of Black opinion which confirmed my view that this mood of bitterness of the urban African could be defused if, as a matter of urgency, it was made possible for them to lead a normal, secure family life in a stable community, with all the facilities and amenities that contribute to this state of affairs. Although the specific grievance which sparked off the demonstra- (20 tions was an important cause of dissatisfaction, I believe that this in itself would not have been enough to spark off the major rioting which occurred. It merely ignited a situation already made explosive by existing conditions. I have been warning for over a year that violence of some kind or another was inevitable unless urgent steps were taken to relieve causes of dissatisfaction. In this memorandum I will document various areas of grievance in Alexandra Township as well as in Soweto as I believe that it is important to recognise certain problems specific to Alexandra Township which are relevant when considering the riots in Alexandra. (3

Right, now Dr. Browdie, having dealt with that introduction

and/..

and read it in detail, I think when we come to the next subject of housing, we can just give a summary because we have dealt with the problems of the..(intervenes). --- Yes

As recently as yesterday and almost ad infinitum. --- Yes.

Would you then just summarise the points that you make about housing? --- Well, you know if I may Mr. Prosecutor, I feel that the important thing is to..if you read some of those letters, you know I feel that giving evidence on behalf of other people can never have the same impact as when the people give it themselves and the point I would really like to make (10 about the housing because I know I believe that one has had in full detail all these questions of the housing but it is only when one actually comes across the individual families and the individual people with their problems that the enormity of the whole of the situation actually strikes one. When one reads it coldly either from a memorandum or for the third person it doesn't have the same impact that is why I have a few of those letters and I think that they express far better than I do, of the desire of the people of Soweto to have the normal amenities.

I hand in these 11 letters, which you referred to as (20 EXHIBIT A.1 to 11 as EXHIBIT 268. Now just a summary, what is their complaint about housing? --- The complaint about housing firstly there is not sufficient housing.

Right? --- The overcrowding - I don't need to go into the numbers of people. Secondly the quality of the housing. Thirdly which I think is relevant if I may refer to something that I heard you ask a few days ago is the question of illegals and I would like to specifically mention this because it disturbs me when one talks about illegals because it is important to define what is "illegal", and many of the cases that I have come across (30 would technically be illegal but I would not consider them illegal

in/..

in a normal context. And what I am trying to put across I think is the danger of seeing Soweto as a normal place, as a normal residential area because sometimes one hears people saying well, you do get such overcrowding or slums elsewhere in the world. Well, I would like to emphasise that in my view Soweto is not a slum. Nor is it..there is no analogy really for Soweto it is in my view an enormous ghetto, because it is not a question of have's or have not's, there are have not's all over the world. And all over the world have not's I presume have certain opportunities, certainly in a free enterprise society to get themselves out it if they can but dissatisfaction in Soweto is on so many levels because you get the have not's who are just dissatisfied because the minimum is not available in just the minimum kind of housing which they would be satisfied with. You get the have's who are dissatisfied because they have earned and have used initiative and would like to develop and cannot live according to the standards which they are able to financially, they would like to from their social development point of view. So it is very complex to talk..you know I am afraid that one would..must not I am afraid that one must not view Soweto as having problems such as any other area has, it is not a normal situation. In getting back to the illegals what worries me is that the cases that I have come across personally - of course I have only had a limited number but I know that they are representative of many others. Often a wife is illegal if she is living with her husband. Now I don't consider it illegal for a wife to live with her husband so there are many so-called illegal residents who are wives, because they have not been born in the area and because they haven't managed to get the kind of employment or not able to for various reasons to get the kind of employment that would qualify them to be legal/..

(10

(20

(30

legal, they are classified illegal. There is another point I would like to make about children. A lot of children are classified as illegal. Now I also cannot accept that it is illegal for children to live with their parents at home and I don't know whether you have already heard this so please if I am..this is repetition, stop me, because I wouldn't like to take up your time, but the point that struck me about the children, the parents often send their children out of Soweto to school if they can because of the unsatisfactory schooling and for various other reasons, they send them to any school that (10 they can get in a rural area, whether it is private or non-private to boarding school very often. When these children reach the age of..I think it is 16, 16 or 17 they are required to take a pass, they are required to become registered. Now often the parents in Soweto are unaware that in order to become registered as a Soweto person, seeing that they were born there they should come back home to Soweto and take out their registration. They don't do this, they get their registration at school. When these children have finished school and come back home, they are illegal. Now I personally have had great difficulty (20 in getting several children whose mother was a domestic servant who had three children who had been born in Soweto, once again I must emphasise the difficulty of this because many of the parents don't have birth certificates, because when the children were born, they were either ignorant, didn't know how to set about it and didn't realise it was necessary, it is not compulsory. So that they didn't apply, perhaps at the correct time, because the children didn't have birth certificates, they were afraid there was something wrong, so the children have been living in houses in Soweto since birth, but because they didn't have (30 birth certificates, they haven't been put onto the house register and/.

and as you know, if one isn't on a house register, a child is not legally there, so I feel that when one talks about illegal, it requires deep investigation before one uses that as evidence that there are people in Soweto who should not be there.

However, your first point then is on the question of housing as you have put in the last three sentences. The present situation is such that many families are broken up for no other reason other than that they cannot get accommodation as a unit. --- Yes.

And you speak of the inadequacy of housing. --- Yes, (10 where the father sleeps in one house, the mother in another the children somewhere else and the families are..and of course it affects the children from a psychological..(intervenes).

The next topic you deal with on page 5 is allocation of new houses. Would you summarise that, and by the way feel free to read any portion of your memorandum if you want to, but if you can summarise it, because His Lordship will be reading this memorandum as well as the rest of the 7,000 pages of record.

--- Well with the allocation of new houses, the one point that I found very striking is that the houses are being used for re- (20 settlement of people who actually have homes and I feel that to put people into a new house in Soweto and taking them from another area in the name of an ideology or whatever the reason is is impractical at a time when people are so desperately short of houses. And the one example that I did mention here which I feel is an important example, because it ended up in a Court of law with so much bitterness and unpleasantness was the case of the George Goch people. I don't know if Your Lordship is aware of it..of the George Goch..?

CHAIRMAN: Would you tell me about it? --- There was a township (30 at George Goch which was a very, very settled community and they/..

they decided that it had to be removed because..the reasons were a little obscure, some people said, some officials said it was because it was in a White area and others said it was because a road had to be built there. But for whichever reason it was, it was a community that had been for many years I mean 50 years or more, a very settled community. They then allocated an area called Molapo Ext. No. 2 in Soweto to move these people, who didn't want to be moved. So there were two aspects here: While the people of Soweto were so short, they built this whole township, a little suburb of houses for people who already had houses and were happy. Also it was a very..an area which had relatively little crime and the..a whole group about 25 people arrived at my house one day that is how I knew about it and asked me if there was anything I could do, and so we took this matter up but there was nothing we could do and eventually some of them moved and others had to be removed by force and ended up in Courts of law being fined and so on. Now I felt that those people could have still been living there because I don't think anything was done in that particular place..(intervenes) (10

Doesn't it depend on what the reason was? --- No, it doesn't because nothing has been done and why I don't believe.. (intervenes). (20

I don't know, how long ago was this? --- I think about two years, or three years, but..(intervenes).

The financial position has changed somewhat in the last three years, to do whatever you wanted to do. --- No, but as far as the George Goch people were concerned, when you have a whole township of settled people, for example if it is in a White area, I think the urgency of moving people from what is zoned in fact it was an industrial area, so the urgency of removing people/.. (30

people from an area because it is zoned for Whites I think the solution would either be to re-zone that area for Blacks and leave them where they are or not to consider it a priority because the priority is the houses of people who are living in this desperate state in Soweto, so in other words one would be aggravating the housing shortage.

DR. YUTAR: You refer in your memorandum to the residents who had..some of them had to be removed by force. --- Yes.

I seem to recall that..the Blacks were also happily settled in Sophiatown and (inaudible) township and they didn't want to leave those townships. --- That is true. (10

And had to be removed by force but they were sent to Meadowlands which I think you must concede is far cleaner and far better than the old Sophiatown. --- Dr. Yutar I am afraid if I may disagree with you there.

CHAIRMAN: Well, then you must convince me too because I have also got that impression. --- You see it is very important to distinguish between cleanness and an area which is suitable for living. Now I think while we are talking about Sophiatown we can use exactly the same argument for Alexandra Township. (20
If Sophiatown or Alexandra Township had been cleaned up, you will find that the actual quality of the basic housing in Sophiatown and certainly in Alexandra Township is far far superior to the houses in Meadowlands. What has happened in Alexandra.. (intervenes).

DR. YUTAR: You are not serious, are you? --- I am absolutely serious.

Because when I together with His Lordship and other members of the Commission visited Sophiatown I came home that night feeling absolutely sick..(intervenes). --- Correct. (30

At what I saw. --- Correct. May I just explain?

Alexandra?/..

Alexandra? --- Alexandra. May I just explain? The basic houses in Alexandra many of the basic houses are very good houses indeed. What has happened is that in every yard, as it is called, garden or yard of every house has been used to house people in appalling conditions with tremendous overcrowding. So that one is..the view of the house itself is obscured, and the impression one gets certainly even some years ago was that it was a slum. Now from experience in other countries and from basic principles of townplanning and so on it is not difficult to do a slum clearance, in other words, if the back yard shanties, the little rooms in the back yards had been removed and had the general area been cleaned up you would have found remaining houses of a far better standard and quality. Now in order to prove this..I'm sorry I didn't have the opportunity of accompanying Your Lordship when you did this trip because when I was involved just recently with the removal of Alexandra township people who have owned their houses for many years, the people who have houses which they are very proud of, they pointed out to me that Alexandra township had become a slum. And they said: It is not a slum because we made it a slum, it is a slum because nothing has been done, it was zoned as an area to be removed some many years ago therefore nothing was done to maintain the area. The streets that you have seen in Alexandra are cesspools, there are running gutters running down, unmade.. you know, the roads are not made and the waste and the rubbish is lying in the streets and they said that when they got the notice that their houses were going to be demolished, they stopped maintaining the houses outside. Because nobody is going to spend that kind of money when you know that you are under threat of expropriation. But if you went into the house and this has been the problem with those people who didn't want to

move/..

move, you found that they had bathrooms, kitchens with running water, they had reasonable sized bedrooms and certainly reasonable sized lounges and dining-rooms. Now some of the major problems which we have come across, people who have complained in moving from Alexandra was that how were they to get their expensive furniture which they had paid off for years and took great pride in, into a matchbox house in Soweto? How could they possibly be expected to live in a place with no running water in the house, with no bathroom in the house. So I think if one gets a false impression if you look at Alexandra (10 as it is today from the outside and I believe that Alexandra should have been a slum clearance project, a project for urban renewal such as they are going to do in Doornfontein, because quite apart from the fact that people are happier in Alexandra than in Soweto, there is no doubt about that, depending on the conditions in which they live in but those who own and live in the houses, it is also very difficult for people who work in the north-eastern suburbs and north-western suburbs to get to work from Soweto. So one needs a residential area for convenience in the north, very badly. (20

Or better transport. --- Well, I believe that people White or Black should be able to choose for themselves if they would like to spend an hour in a bus or whether they would like to choose to live somewhere nearer their work for various reasons.

It is a pity you weren't here yesterday afternoon, you would have heard an expert from the Anglo American telling His Lordship of a new area that had been set aside for slum dwellers in another area to move over into this beautiful area and to build their own houses, and do you know what a good many of them did? They took their shanties over and planted their shanties in these (30 beautiful open spaces. --- Well, there maybe a reason for that

because/..

because I actually have so much evidence, Dr. Yutar, so much evidence of people who would welcome more than welcome to have the ability to move over and build and quite apart from that if a person can't afford to build a house, then I still believe that living in a kind of shanty is preferable to living in the conditions, overcrowded conditions where perhaps it looks from the outside that it is not a slum and the example for that is a housing scheme in Kenia which was presented at the Institute of Architects last year there was an exhibition and people came from all over the world and showed the most fabulous housing schemes which were impractical because they are too expensive and this Kenian man showed where they had taken a slum and upgraded it by giving the people materials to help themselves and just bulldozing a few down to make roads and they had made roads provided facilities, provided amenities and they converted these houses with the use of plants and paint and some simple materials into a most charming and delightful family area. (10

One other question, Dr. Browde, these people that you say that bought expensive articles of furniture and they were forced to move from Alexandra, is there anything to stop them moving into the Houghton of Soweto? Today? --- Yes. (20

What? --- Firstly there is nothing available, secondly these people couldn't afford it. You see, that brings my to the end of the memorandum, is the question of Alexandra, I don't know if I should discuss it now?

No, no we will come to that. --- Oh. Because it is a question of how the expropriation was done and the injustice which was done to these people.

Yes, we will deal with that presently. There is one other aspect about housing, about the allocation of new houses. (30

You/..

You mention it in your last paragraph. That has been dealt with by other witnesses, namely when a breadwinner dies, the widows and the children are very often served with a notice of eviction. --- Yes.

Right. Now before we go on to raids by police I think you had better deal with the lower paragraph: Quality of housing, .. you could summarise that quite easily. --- Yes, well I have already mentioned the lack of running water and no ceilings.

You have nothing further to add? --- No electricity which I ..actually was an omission because I dealt with electricity (10 as a separate topic. But I don't know whether everyone is aware that when they do get these houses, these matchbox houses, they have to go to the expense themselves of plastering the insides and filling up the gaps between the roof and the walls which are open with something and those who can't afford it, use mud and those who can afford it have to go to the expense of using concrete. So they have to go expenses, even though they are only tenants of a rented house.

Yes. And also we were told yesterday that they were not provided with ceilings? --- No ceilings, no. (20

And the floors were of cement. --- Cement floors.

Right. --- And no doors.

I think logically we should deal now with insecurity of tenure. --- Yes.

That is at the bottom of page 6. --- Well, I said that they can never own it nor obtain a long lease. Well of course since then, leasehold, the introduction of leasehold which they really welcome, was brought in, but it seems to have brought so many problems and this is something that I find a little disturbing in that what ought to have been a rather an urgent (30 measure to have been brought in rapidly, has taken so long and has/..

has been fraught with so many unhappinesses. I mean first one's leasehold was tied to Homeland citizenship in the beginning. This created an unbelievable amount of bitterness because the urban African does not consider himself tribal in any way or belonging to any specific ethnic group and an example of this is one person who pointed out that in a certain row were so-called Zulu housing set aside for Zulu housing. In that one row of houses, not one man who was so-called classified a Zulu was married to a woman who was of Zulu origin. This was pointed out because I think it possibly has been mentioned that the ethnic grouping of houses has also caused a lot of unhappiness with the housing problem. It also leads to a feeling of resentment when people don't understand that housing goes according to ethnic groups. For example, a man belonging to a certain ethnic group will be told that he has to wait for seven years. I have people on a housing list since 1969 because they belong to a group and there is a shortage of housing. Other people who belong to an ethnic group where there is a lesser waiting-list might get a house within a year or two, now the others not realising this, cannot understand how they with their large family have been waiting for seven or eight years for a house while somebody who is perhaps newly married has got a house because they don't see themselves as different in any way. So that is the one point and the other thing about security of tenure is that..I am sure you have heard many times, is about allowing people to feel permanent and having a stake in the society because it is obvious that the majority of Soweto are permanent residents.

(10

(20

Now let us go back now to page 6 and deal very briefly with raids by police. We can sum that up. --- Many complaints from people who say that the raidings which take place at four or five/..

(30

five in the morning..the people who have been complaining are often people who are visiting friends or family in another part of Soweto. Now it is dangerous and also impossible to travel back at night if you go visiting and people who visit very often sleep over and then if there happens to be a raid these people are arrested for having visited a cousin or a girlfriend or whoever it is. The other raid complaints that I have had about raiding are people who are in fact lodgers, looking for a house and one finds that their permit, their lodgers' permit for some reason or other they are not satisfied or the people ask them to leave because of their own domestic problems, and you find many, many cases of a young family, a man, his wife and child legally in Soweto. I have one letter that I have actually handed in of one such case where because they sleep in different houses at different times, wherever they manage to find a room for a few weeks, I have had..this is a very..there are some very desperate letters, they complain that when they get raided because they are not on that house's permit, they have to pay R20, they get fined. That is R10 a time and this has caused tremendous bitterness, upsets and so on. Now I did complain as I have said here to the Board and I was told that the police patrols and raids had been requested by residents because of the large criminal element. Well, I mean even in our suburbs I know that in my area, the constituency that I represent, the residents..there are a few isolated incidents and residents ask for police protection. I don't think that in asking for police protection the residents would have then of my area, welcomed the police knocking on the doors at 5 in the morning and finding out who is sleeping in the house. I just feel that one mustn't have those kind of double standards. If people need protection on the one hand, fair enough from genuine/..

(10

(20

(30

genuine criminals but it is I think fairly easy to see that a man who is living in a house with his wife and child, and has a very stable job at the university was the one case and there are many others, that to arrest these people because they have been asked by residents for protection, I think is..(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: Yes, but this is the protection that you make..that you go through the whole area and find out how many..in the broad sense, how do you give protection? You try and remove the criminal elements in the area. And you do that by going (10 around and finding out where they are. --- Yes, but with respect if you are looking for criminals and you find in a house a man and his wife and his child and the man is working at the university or wherever it is, in a full-time job..(intervenes).

It may be that you find something else happening there.
--- No, but this is the majority of people.

..I don't know the majority of people, that I don't know but I don't know how you can say that this system of finding people..I don't like it, I wouldn't like to be called so early in the morning to see what is happening but if this is the way (20 then well how can you say that when you ask for protection they mustn't do this sort of thing? --- Well, I think it is important that one uses discretion. I think it is important that one doesn't humiliate law-abiding citizens and..(intervenes).

Of course..but what is the point there. --- No, but it is very much to the point because I don't think protection..if a person has asked for protection, it doesn't mean indiscriminately knocking on every single door in the neighbourhood.

If that is the way in which you protect a particular area, I can't see that it is so drastically wrong. --- Well, (30 I feel that..(intervenes).

How/..

How else do you..if you don't do that and they see well, now look you don't go around and the house next door to me has got 10 criminals living in there, why don't you go there. Now how must they use their discretion,^{to}/find out whether the criminals are there and then not go to this house but go to the next one? --- Well, there are two answers to that. Firstly is when you do go into a house and you are knocked up at four in the morning, then you can accept that maybe you are knocked up for a genuine cause but once the policeman who has raided has satisfied himself that they are not criminals, what I am (10 suggesting is that they should not arrest people who are living in that house such as the families I have described, that they should use their discretion in the arrest, because some people have been paying R20 every couple of months. So all I am saying is that even if they do knock them up, they shouldn't arrest.. but what they are doing is arresting everybody who is a so-called illegal in that house and what I am suggesting is that the definition of illegal is wrong and that it is wrong to arrest a man when you have satisfied yourself that he is not a criminal. That is what I am suggesting because that creates..I mean if (20 I may put it this way: We are trying to find the causes of people being bitter, frustrated and of turning to violence, and we are trying to find the cause. I am suggesting that if one listens to the people and one hears the things that they have to say then these are the causes for bitterness.

Yes, but what I object to and what I am asking you is this: You are blaming a system of trying to eradicate people, you were given the excuse that these people were knocked up in the morning because they had asked for protection or the area had asked for protection. That fact and the fact that they are (30 protecting, isn't the cause of this trouble, the cause of it is the/..

the manner in which the people have been knocked up and arrested during the night. This is something completely different.

--- Well, yes..not completely but I am with Your Lordship yes, it is different in that it is the manner in which it is done.

Correct. --- Yes, but now may I go one step further:

So your answer when they have told you that this was for protection, your answer should have been: Yes, but look how you do it. --- Well, that was my answer, and I was offered to go..that they would take me around with them one morning.

Yes. --- On a patrol to see but it is no good going (10
with people to visit because actually when you have visitors then obviously things are done differently from when there is nobody around, so I didn't think that would be any proof. But the other thing is that if you are asking for protection, I believe and that will come under crime, that I don't believe that that is the way you deal with the whole problem, people who require protection. I think it is the whole matter of dealing I am not in favour of the system in which you use police as a method of dealing with crime only, you need to get right down to the prevention of crime. And that is why I say that it is (20
the system that bothers me. Because it is a matter of...but I think that does come in a later paragraph.

DR. YUTAR: Yes, I think we can deal before we come to crime, we can deal very briefly with influx control because we have dealt with that already. --- Yes.

Page 7. --- Well of course influx control is possibly one of the most important areas where we find reason for bitterness. And here with influx control if I may try and be a little more specific, having learnt from this last question is that it is a matter of the method in which it is applied as well as the (30
influx control itself. Here I believe that there are two elements.

CHAIRMAN: Isn't it perhaps some various instances of influx control? For example that the wife can't come, for example if the children can't come in. These..I think you have referred to some. --- Well, I think if one says it is various instances it doesn't..(intervenes).

Or various factors..(intervenes). --- Various factors. I think in fact then one might lose sight of the fact of the real disease of influx control itself. If I may use an analogy with this whole situation, it is so difficult because it is so complex. But if one looks at something and one says yes, well (10 perhaps there are a few cases here and there are some instances there, then one might see it as ways in which one could use this system but improve it here or improve it there or hardships in one area. I don't see it that way. I see it as fundamentally the system in which the Black people of South Africa, of Soweto the whole system under which they have to live, with influx control and all the other laws, is such that one cannot just take one small aspect and say there are factors because right from the root, from the bottom, the system is causing bitterness and therefore one needs a fundamental change. (20

Although I am not a sociologist, I don't know about these things, very much about these things, but isn't it so that if South Africa had an influx control during the great depression years, we might not have had a poor White problem, which was a problem under which this country laboured for many many years? I don't know. --- Well, I think it would have been tragic, if we had have had an influx control in those years My Lord, we would not have probably have built up the technology and the systems... that we have, because these people who were poor Whites did show that they could in fact harness their own (30 energies, use their initiative, their motivations and so on, and they/..

they did come out of it, they did develop.

I must say Dr. Browde, that was not what I had seen in those years but again I have no great knowledge of these things. --- I think that influx control, instead of influx control an alternative is to create job employment and to allow mobility of labour because you are never ever really going to be able to control anything by law. All that happens is that one fills one's prisons. I believe the figure was something like 700 offences a day under the pass laws, 700 a day in the Courts. Now to me that doesn't warrant the application of influx control such as it is. If you are going to apply a kind of movement... of people because of job opportunities and so on then it should apply to the whole population, it should apply to everybody, but once one brings in laws of this kind it opens everything to abuse, it opens the way to discrimination and hardship and I don't think with respect that there is any point saying: There are the factors of the wives not coming and the factors of the children because this is in fact a logical extension of an influx control law. Once you have rigid laws which say: Who may and who may not live there and the qualification of 15 years in an area before they qualify under the influx control laws. To me the whole..that system of law will never ever will you find a satisfied population or community living under this system. I mean if you use an analogy of Johannesburg, let us say that there is a Government in power that hates Johannesburg, how would we feel, how would we feel if we were told: Johannesburg people are not permitted to move, are not permitted to take jobs elsewhere so that if our children go out to schools, to Bloemfontein for example and they come to school they are foreigners if they come back. That all the laws that apply to Soweto will apply to us. I am trying/..

(10

(20

(30

trying to imagine what we would do and how we would react and I think it is very important..what worries me, if I may say so about this whole question of discussing and memoranda and evidence that is given: It is almost as if we are discussing inanimate objects, it is almost as if we are discussing the movement of labour units. It is not as if we are discussing what it means to the individual person and what I find is that we are categorising people. We are saying: The urban, the rural, the Blacks, the something else, this ethnic group. We are putting them into categories: The illegal. Now once you put them(10 into a category you dehumanise people and this is what I find so hard to put across in a situation such as this because the whole population of 1½ million is made up of so many little families so it is each family unit and how it affects them and where there are criminals it is very sad for those parents who have got children who are criminals, terribly sad and it is the conditions that makes those children criminals, so therefore I feel as if we are starting from the wrong way around. I feel that really one should take a sociological attitude and start from the bottom. If I may just use one analogy..(inter- (20 venes).

Well, perhaps I was at fault in asking you the questions I did because that took us from what you had intended to something else and that is what are the causes of the recent unrest. --- Well, influx control is a cause.

Yes. --- Influx control is a cause.

Its value is really at this stage not so important or rather I shouldn't have asked you the questions about it as I did because if that is the cause or a cause, if that is a cause, whether it is good or bad. --- That's right. (30

DR. YUTAR: Just one other point that you mention on page 8 and

I think we can take the adjournment at this stage before we come to crime, which will take some time. You there refer to a child born of parents living in Soweto and the child is born, the grandmother in Koster or somewhere else and that child cannot be allowed to live with its parents at a later stage.

--- Well this particular case was in fact a man working in Soweto, and married a woman who lived in Koster and they had had a child that was born while she was in Koster. She lived with her sister, her sister died, she had nowhere to go so she came to join her husband in Soweto and there she was classified (10 as illegal and they paid fines for her, she was arrested so they came to me and I managed to find a sympathetic official who very kindly made her legal so that she could live with her husband and her child of eight. But another child had been born in the meantime who was 2 years old by the time they came to me but was born of course in Soweto and they were very happy and about eight months later I found them at my house..and I have never seen people so distressed. This man was sobbing uncontrollably because the police had come to evict the eight year old child because the mother was now legal because I had had her (20 legalised but what I hadn't thought of myself was to legalise the child of eight who was born in Koster and the child was actually served with an eviction order and when I phoned the superintendent he was very sympathetic and he said that it was the last thing he wanted to do but he had orders. So he told me to phone the B.A.B. the official in charge there because he said all these cases get sent to the Bantu Administration Board in town where they have..every morning they get a list of these and he said there was nothing he could do and when I phoned that official about this child he said: I have so many cases to deal (30 with every day you cannot expect me to deal with each one

individually/..

individually because of this removal from the situation. Now I haven't heard since what happened but I know that it is not an isolated case.

CHAIRMAN: It is not my..(intervenes - speaking simultaneously).

--- I beg your pardon? It is not isolated, I have heard of other children who have been called illegal and told that they must be sent..many other children sent back to a home even though they have got nobody there.

Yes. Have you heard of other instances where they have said that they cannot deal with the case individually and.. (10 (intervenes). --- No, that is my only..well that is my..(intervenes).

In your experience. --- In my experience.

Your own experience. --- Yes.

Have you heard of other incidents of that sort of approach?

--- Well, I have heard of many incidents from women who have been very unsympathetically received by officials but as I said under officials there are two kinds of officials, officials and officials.

DR. YUTAR: My Lord, would this be a convenient stage to take (20 the adjournment?

CHAIRMAN: Yes, the Commission will adjourn until 2 o'clock.

COMMISSION ADJOURNS / COMMISSION RESUMES

DR. YUTAR: Dr. Browde, in this short interval during the lunch adjournment you asked me about this instance I quoted to you that Mr. du Toit of Anglo American mentioned yesterday and you said you were also in South America. --- Yes.

And did you observe the various locations over there?

--- Very much so.

How do they compare with..(intervenes). --- It is (30 interesting that you should ask that Dr. Yutar because I specially/..

specially went to look at them they are called favela's.

That's right. --- The point is they are terrible, terrible slums, that are situated in the most beautiful part of Rio de Janeiro. Absolutely exquisite, you know on the mountain side next to the sea and we actually went down comparing, you know with our situation and in a way, although their actual slum, the housing conditions are worse, their human conditions are better because they do have freedom, more freedom of movement, they also have more recreation, they have built basketball courts all the way along the sea front and of course you (10) have this magnificent ocean and sea within walking distance. Now I couldn't understand that a city would allow its most affluent area which is there, on the Copa Cabana right behind the most affluent areas are these most appalling slums on the hillside behind and then they took me out into the country, right into the sort of heart of the land, away from the sea, where they have built..what we would call Council flats for these people and every time they move them out, they move back again because they would far rather be next to the sea and next to the basketball courts. Another interesting thing and they have (20) not expropriated them and they haven't forced them to move.

Well..(intervenes). --- So that I found..(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: Do they break down what they have evacuated or not?

--- Well, I didn't go into that but it didn't look as if they did you know, and I mean they are very undesirable dwellings but at the same time because the people can have the freedom of movement and if anybody does manage to get out of that situation of course he can get out of that situation, if they can..so it was a total difference. In other words, that is real slum.

DR. YUTAR: And he added the rather interesting observation that (30) they were built on what was refuse dumps. --- And they have got grass/..

grass and trees..

Well, that is the one he says where they are allowed now to have ownership and they have converted their little huts into nice houses according to their own needs but in other places where they haven't got security of tenure, the conditions are hopeless and in a third place, where they were transferred to..these unisex buildings we have at Alexandra.

--- Yes?

There he says that at regular intervals you could tell first the windows would be broken, then the doors and the places (10 are delapidated beyond description. --- Yes.

However that is by the way. Dr. Browdie before we pass from influx control, may I ask you this: Are you..you say over here at page 7 - "I believe this needs re-evaluation with regard to both its structure and its implementation. Herein lies the root cause of many grievances". Are you in favour of a repeal of the influx control legislation? --- Yes, I am but I cannot give you that answer in isolation. It would be foolish it would be almost ridiculous to say: I am in favour of the repealing of one law, if you don't do all kinds of other things (20 with it.

Because I don't think you are going to suggest, despite your political affiliations that this law was passed arbitrarily without some good reason for it. --- No, I am sure that originally the law was an attempt to stop people from flocking to cities for job opportunities.

Right. --- But I believe that it hasn't worked and that the law has become too complicated, too many laws are involved, too many..there are too much detail in this law. It doesn't really..it is not doing what it set out to do. (30

Well now supposing it was repealed.. --- Yes.

And/..

And the Blacks were allowed - and I am referring to them as human beings, not as units as you suggest, far from it - and they were to come into Soweto, what would be the effect on the housing problem in Soweto if they were allowed to come in theory? --- Well, this is why I wanted to make it quite clear that you don't talk about just removing influx control. You can immediately start by changing the influx control, immediately, but you can't remove it overnight without removing certain other laws as well, for example, you have got to leave certain other restrictions. It is no good saying (10 we will remove influx control if at the same time you don't allow people to develop and expand, to build homes, to build businesses to become entrepreneurs, to create employment. You don't remove influx control without taking into consideration movement of labour, which what it is basically about over the whole country without having structured an organisation to direct people, not by force, but by saying: Here are jobs available, there are jobs available. There is where you can build houses. The minute you allow people to have freedom of opportunities, to develop, they develop and they do things so it would be wrong (20 to say we will do nothing else but tomorrow we will remove influx control but everything else remains as it is.

Yes. Because you do appreciate that if you remove.. repeal influx control, you are going to make the housing position more acute than it is at the moment, and you are going to cause perhaps even more unemployment. --- But you know the answer to the problem..you see..sorry..what I want to say..it is like you are saying when did you stop beating your husband..(LAUGHTER).

However, may I put it to you, I have got it on very reliable authority that the Department of Bantu Administration is aware of (30 some of the hardships caused by influx control and they are presently/..

presently engaged on considering ways and means to remove those hardships that you refer to and others that have been referred to by other witnesses but leaving basically, influx control. I don't think you can have any objection to that. --- Well, anything that relieves it I will welcome, it is just a matter of whether it goes far enough.

We come now to page 8, the question of crime and I think far from putting in this one exhibit B which you referred to as B, it will become EXHIBIT 268..269. Would you be so kind as to summarise what you here say about it. --- Well, I (10 think the important thing I said first was that the crime is a most important factor in contributing to tensions of township life, but it is no good only increasing the policeforce, it must..the root causes must be tackled and here I feel it is worth emphasising something that really disturbs me and people who have studied from a medical aspect of what is going on we are breeding a psychopathic population in Soweto. This is a frightening thing. You see when you have conditions such as these young children are being brought up in, it is not a political factor, these children are not able to think politically(20 the psychopaths are just..have no idea of what is right and what is wrong due to the causes surrounding their environment and their births and so, and the obvious factors. Now once you have this population you cannot cure it. You know the one thing that psychiatrists find impossible to deal with are psychopaths, people who just don't know the difference between right and wrong and I found it very frightening because everybody is a victim of psychopaths. You know, they don't know the difference between.. the victims are their own parents, their own family. It is not a question of politics or White or Black or anything else. (30 So that if we don't do something about what is going on in the sociological/..

sociological structure of these children, the socio-economic structure and giving the children not only education, because you see, stealing is one thing, but there are many other things that one gets from a stable home. You have got to get values Now the interesting thing is this that..I don't know if you want me to go on to the question of recreation which comes into this.

Yes, well that is one of the reasons for tears, by all means. --- Yes. Now, I was disturbed about this and so when I became a councillor in 1972 one of the first things I (10) decided because of my profession I didn't feel myself politically competent, never having been in politics, but having been a doctor I felt the need for health and that is the orbit in which I felt competent in, I decided that the best thing to do was to try and get recreation schemes in Soweto and so I did a lot of research and came up with a mobile recreation scheme. Now quite by coincidence a couple of Black people arrived at my house one day and he said, this one man, he said: You know, I am very worried about our people in Soweto, they are not getting the right values, we have lost the values that we used to have many (20) years ago because of this break-up of family life and we have got to give our children something because the mothers are out to work from early in the morning until late at night, the children are on the streets, you know, many of them are left sitting at home, babies, with keys around their necks all day. They...there are not sufficient by any means, day care centres crèches and so on, and we felt if we didn't..they didn't do something, Soweto..this crime situation was going to get worse and the children are growing up with no values, no spiritual or cultural values and he said: I have got a horse and cart (30) and it suddenly struck me, couldn't we start going round the streets/..

streets with my horse and cart and try to gather the children. And I said: What an extraordinary coincidence, I have just come up with a mobile recreation scheme with trucks, but of course we will need personnel and so we got together with a couple of people and we..this scheme was born and what really is going to..with the crime story links up with the next chapter which is what I call "evidence of lack of competence of W.R.A.B.", which maybe a little bit presumptuous of me and perhaps a little strongly put but it links up because we started this idea of this recreation and I found people streaming from all sides of Soweto, you know, individuals keen to do something whether it was in their garage or anywhere for these children and I immediately sent a memorandum to Mr. Punt Jansen who was then the Deputy Minister of Bantu Affairs. He was very excited he actually telephoned me from Pretoria and he said this seems like a wonderful scheme and..as soon as I can get through this enormous pile on my desk, he evidently had a pile like that I'll come back to you because obviously I had to have permission. Anyway, he didn't come back and I then went to see the City Council and then the West Rand Board took over and when the West Rand Board took over I went immediately to their recreation department and I spoke to the late Dr. Melville Edelstein. He was in charge of recreation and he brought in a couple of other people from his office and we had a meeting and he was very excited about it and he said: It is too imaginative a scheme for my Board but it is essential to have done. Please go ahead and do it, see if you can get private people to help you because you know, it really requires a lot of staff and so on which we can't do. If we can give you any help we will but we cannot give you staff and he said: I wish you luck. And so we went on. Well, to cut a long story short, I was blocked at every

single/ ..

single turn and the end of it was, the final..I won't bore you with the details but it went over years and the amount of work that went into it and the people who were just waiting, they used to phone me every couple of months and say: When are we starting, when are we starting. The final thing was that I went to Anglo American and they offered..and this will come later on but it is relevant now. They offered R40,000, not only to me to this mobile scheme but to an art project combined with a group called A.M.D.A. who wanted to start an art school in a certain area in Soweto and they said we should combine, (10 you know, build a little building for the art studio which could be also the base for the beginning of a couple of trucks. And they would support the two together, which was a good idea we thought.

What does A.M.D.A. stand for by the way? --- A.M.D.A. is African Music and Drama Association.

Thank you. --- And they desperately needed accommodation in Soweto because their accommodation in Eloff Street, Dorker House is totally inadequate and it is very hard for the people to get there and they had somebody who was prepared to go out (20 and teach there and we were very excited about this and Anglo then said we must get permission from the Board of course, although we don't want anything from them but permission, so I said sure, and I applied. A.M.D.A. actually wrote, this young lady wrote and we were waiting, and then Anglo said well, you had better let us know soon because the financial year is coming to an end. I went to see Mr. de Villiers and I wrote urgently to the Board and they said we will let you know soon, and then she got a reply saying: Refusing us permission because they said we already have the facilities, we already provide such facilities. Well, (30 they do have one art centre, there are a million and a half people/..

people in Soweto, they do have one art centre and there were reasons why these particular artists didn't want to go to that art centre because they were learning a different form with A.M.D.A. already. Secondly I mean there is always room for more. This is the one side-stepping in a way because it comes under the next section, but this is the frustration of trying, that we have been trying, many people have been trying to improve the lot of the children, who had no outlets. Now the reason I have told you this is that I think perhaps it is important to know that the Soweto people themselves are so aware of their lack of facilities, their lack of opportunities for kids to harness their energy into anything but crime. At the age of 3 and 4 they are playing dice on the streets, they get into gangs and now there was a group that started music at the Orlando High School on a Saturday morning and I went out one morning to see them. They started off I think with about 15 or 20 children, every week it doubled until they had hundreds..crammed in, little ones from 6 years old to you know, 17, 18 year olds. Crammed in all day into these little tight desks where somebody taught them musical appreciation and then some would play the violin and others would play a wind instrument and when one watched these children, the looks on their faces and you realised no child could get into a gang or get into crime if he was involved in something like this and the people are very aware of it. So what I am saying is that I feel it is terribly important that along with the other things, to get to the root cause of the crime which is the quality of living, the upbringing of the children. I am going on too long but I can't stress it enough. (10) (20)

No, well you know the Commission toured Soweto twice and speaking for myself, I was amazed when I saw the number of sporting facilities provided for them in the shape of tennis courts/.. (30)

courts, soccer fields, swimming baths, I think I even saw an open air amphitheatre and obviously there are not sufficient but there is a move in that direction. --- Well, with respect Dr. Yutar in fact the move is far, far from adequate.

It is..(intervenes). --- Now the move has been with private enterprise, you know there is a whole tennis scheme being put up by Owen Williams I believe. I have tried to get a performing arts centre built in Soweto. Everything we have tried to do has been turned down. Now when one recognises that there are inadequate facilities you know, a million and a half (10 people is twice the size of Port Elizabeth, would one say to the Whites of Port Elizabeth that what they have in Soweto is sufficient? It is not sufficient for a small community, therefore why is it that when one really tries with private enterprise to get things done that one is actually prevented? We lost that R40,000 from Anglo American because the year was up. All these things we have tried to do have actually been turned down. At the moment I am busy trying to get a whole series of basketball courts with an African who is on his own, going around, setting up basketball all over Soweto. We are appealing for funds, I (20 have actually asked American Congressmen who were here, I asked them if they couldn't send out one of their best basketball players to help us raise funds. There is so much that can be done and we are actually prevented from doing these things.

Well, that is one of the complaints that the Bantu Administration Board will have to answer when they come to give evidence, but I want to put this to you: You speak about the crime rate in Soweto. Now I have not been to America but I have heard something about Harlem. How does it compare with the crime rate in Harlem? --- Well, I think it is worse. (30

Worse? --- I think it is worse in Soweto I think so,
the/..

the rate, because the statistics that they gave of murders, of murders a day or a week-end but the point that..you know whether it is worse or not worse I don't think is really relevant, the crime as we know in New York is terrible.

Yes, but I am speaking..crime, isn't the increase in crime something global? --- There is a global increase in crime.

Even in Russia. --- But what I want..to put this point is very important. You see, if we start comparing then one tends..may tend, I am not suggesting for one moment that you do but other people listening or reading this, may tend to think: (10
Well, there is crime in New York, there is crime in Cleveland or Detroit, I don't know which one it is which is this terrible place, there is crime everywhere, so there is crime in Soweto. In other words, we tend not to see how in fact in Soweto, being a special area, we don't need to have that kind of crime. You see I think one has to analyse each place on its own. Now when you..(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: No, but isn't it relevant to know that there is also crime and perhaps even worse crime in other places, so as to be able to, if you combat it, you must know that you are not only (20
dealing with a phenomenon of the particular area that you are concerned with, but you are dealing with a world phenomenon namely the increase in crime. There may be particular reasons here which are local reasons, but isn't this the same all the world over, there must also be reasons probably which are of a more general nature, and unless we know that, you can't really combat the crime in the one area. --- M'Lord, I think in Soweto it would be the other way around that one would first deal with the local problems which we know are causing crime the special problems and then if it is still found that you had (30
a lot of crime, then you could say well, now we have dealt with
all/..

all those problems, it is a global problem, there must be other factors because this little township of George Goch that I told you about, in fact was relatively crime-free. I don't see why we in South Africa don't have the same pressures and tensions that you have in New York. You know New York is such a vast city and so crowded and with the hot summers, there are many other reasons that you..I don't think it is an analogy I think that it could be dangerous, dangerous to be allowed into this feeling..(intervenes).

No, but I think I was putting my point of view that you can't ignore it. --- No, you can't ignore it, but I think.. (10

That is right. --- Yes, but I do think it would be the other way around, to first deal with our local problems before you think about what is a global..(intervenes).

No, but don't you think of them together really? --- Well, I don't see Soweto's problems as being part of any global manifestation at all. Because there are many things..you know, we are behind the world in many things..(intervenes).

DR. YUTAR: Well, may I..(intervenes). --- We had all our various crises, you know the Women's Lib only hit us years after it hit America. Maybe we haven't yet hit our global crime. I think the crime in Soweto is a very different thing, I really do. (20

May I in associating myself with what...of His Lordship and just refer to one global phenomenon which has struck the whole world and that is youth and drugs. Now that is worldwide. --- Yes.

And one follows the..(intervenes). --- But if I..youth and drugs, but if one analyses youth and drugs it is a very complicated issue but you find in a child from a stable home nearly always, from a good background, by good I don't mean affluent/.. (30

affluent, I mean from a home in which there has been a good relationship and good values instilled, you find that if the child does experiment with drugs because it is the thing to do, very rarely does that child go on to become an addict or anything in a dangerous way.

Well, Dr. Browde, you maybe a medical man, I have been associated with crime for 42 years and you would be surprised some of the homes, some of the good homes which have produced not willingly, youths addicted to drugs and liquor. It has been very pathetic. --- Yes, but there maybe something wrong in the relationship. (10

Well, the one other thing I want to put to you and that is this: I know for a fact that visitors to this country are very proudly taken through Soweto. I have not heard of visitors being taken through Harlem and other areas on the ground that it is dangerous for a White person to go into that area, even in a motor car unless the doors are locked and the windows are closed. --- The fact that the American Black was much more hostile..very much more hostile than the South African Black now, that I not only concede, it is a point that I have often made and this is why I say that we are behind the rest of the world. The American Black was striving for his recognition long before the South African Black has done so because the South African Black for many years had accepted his situation for one reason or another. We have now reached the point where - he has caught up in a global thing from that point of view, where the South African Black only now is starting to resent it and if you heard the comments made in the last year and a half about..from the people of Soweto, what they feel about watching these people coming through in the buses, they feel like animals in a zoo being looked at and it is only because I think these/.. (30

these people are remarkable in their..they have not got a violent temperament in that there haven't been any incidents when these buses go through Soweto. Now in America I was there two years ago and the hostility was absolutely extraordinary. I mean here we have never felt anything like the hostility that one felt there. This time I was there three months ago I couldn't believe it that the change..that hostility had changed completely and I thought maybe I was being sheltered from it because I was on an American Government invitation and I thought maybe I am being meeting special people and yet I was going a lot on my own. When I got back I spoke to American Diplomats Black ones and White and I spoke to several people, political people from departments of political..politics in America and they said: Yes, they had seen a change because the revolution is over. We are now entering into a period of reconciliation. So it is very interesting watching that phenomenon, because things have in a sense improved so much in the aspirations... are gradually being met of the American Black, so that although Harlem is still a dangerous ghetto area, it is not in the same sense, because people from Harlem can move and that is why I say the analogy between Harlem and Soweto I cannot accept as an analogy.

All right. Let us go to..let us get a little more light on the subject as we turn to electricity. --- Yes.

Page 10. I think that we can briefly summarise. --- Well, I think that we all really stand..should stand with our heads bowed in shame, all of us, and I am not blaming this Government, I am not blaming anyone personally, I blame from the day that Soweto was really established, whoever it was who was responsible, how anybody could live in Johannesburg while 10 miles away was a residential area of our whole working population

non-electrified and I don't think that one needs to go..I am sure that everybody is in agreement that electricity is essential and what I do feel is that the money should have been found because when I originally started fighting for electricity, they only needed something like R16 million. Of course it was a much simpler electrification programme, but that is all they needed and I have been working very closely with the City Council Department of Electricity who is terribly keen and it was always a matter of no funds and I don't accept that that was a good enough reason. What I believe is the reason, is (10
in a sense our political..I don't mean our Government, our local political system. If people are dependent for their seats in their local councils or wherever it is, on voters, they would do something for the voters and if we had only had a couple of Johannesburg City Councillors who depended for their seats on Soweto, believe me Soweto would have had the facilities that other every suburb has got.

Well, I can only express the hope that you leave Houghton and go to Soweto. --- I would love to.

Right. We hand in on that score EXHIBIT 270, a series (20
of letters dealing with this question of electricity and I think these letters speak for themselves. --- The letters are heartbreaking.

Heartbreaking, I have read some of them. --- They really are and the letters give much more than the electricity and there is one point I would like to make about those letters.

Please do. --- If Your Lordship would please when you read them, note that most of the letters, I don't know whether those..because I had so many, I just selected the first ones I could come across, but most of the letters nearly all, (30
the point is they thank me for asking and I would just like to
point/..

point out that all I asked was in a tiny little column, really a very small column that I put in the Township Mail, I just said: Would you prefer coal stoves or electric stoves because the Johannesburg City Council was then thinking of putting in smokeless stoves and I said..instead of sending in they were asking, actually asking for a loan of a million Rand a year to subsidise smokeless stoves and I said at the Health & Amenities Committee meeting, it seems silly, why not use that money for reticulation for electricity because then you are doing so much more and they said: No, the people of Soweto (10 don't want electricity, which I couldn't believe my ears, but there were one or two people who genuinely believed this, so I said..I am positive it is not true, can't we do a survey and they said well, do it yourself - we can't do a survey, so I put this little notice in the Township Mail saying: If you had a choice, please let me know, and I got hundreds of replies. And the replies firstly thanked me for asking, they felt so pleased that finally somebody was actually consulting with them asking them their opinion, that was the first point and the second point these letters do explain the quality of their lives (20 much more..you know, it is just more than not having electricity because if you analyse a person's day without electricity, they explain that they have to get up at 4 in the morning or half-past three to make the fire to get a cup of tea or to iron..if you want to iron a shirt so that you can look decent to go to work you have got to make a stove, in order to heat the iron, so in other words, it starts right from half-past three in the mornings, every single aspect of their day, and when they come home at night tired from work, they still have to make the fire before they can start cooking to start eating and the cost.. (30 I think you might find one or two of those letters and I analysed this/..

this with the Electrical Engineer of the City Council. It costs a Soweto resident much, much more than it would cost people in a similar establishment, a White man, for his coal, paraffin, his candles, his matches and his paper because firstly it costs more without electricity to do all these things. You know with the price of coal that has gone up, and wood, but secondly, things are more expensive in Soweto. We did a survey comparative cost and a Soweto man pays more for coal than we do. They pay more for many things for two reasons, firstly because people charge more for delivering to Soweto. Secondly because there are no supermarkets allowed or no big wholesalers allowed in Soweto, they pay retail prices for everything and thirdly I think it is an established fact and this is universal that whenever there is a shortage people take advantage and prices go up, that is how a market works, or if there is a tremendous demand, prices go up. So you find that it actually costs a Soweto resident more to live whether it is meat or groceries or coal, whatever it is, it costs them more to use. So the electricity would actually give them a cheaper..lower their cost of living. (10

If I can add to what you have said, the absence of electricity denies them in the evening a certain measure of entertainment that comes via the radio and now with television. --- Yes. (20

Well, now we come to evidence of lack of competence of W.R.A.B. and then you are going to deal with the transfer from.. of the authority from the City Council to the West Rand Administration Board and how your hopes in the beginning were dashed for two important reasons: --- Yes.

Would you just deal with that very briefly please. --- (30
Well, when the City Council had controlled Soweto, they gave

a grant of two million Rand a year..I think it actually worked out to more, but I am safe if I say R2 million in addition to whatever revenue they collected. They had to put in R2 million a year. When the Board was created, this R2 million immediately obviously fell away although I believed myself that we should still have given it and I actually brought a motion into the City Council asking that we give that money still for the use of Soweto. The reply in refusing it was that the money would probably go..you know, for bureaucratic..for the bureaucratic structure and not for the benefit of the people of Soweto and (10 this is where we come to the point I wish to make. When the Board took over Soweto, it had to create its whole infra-structure which is very expensive. The City Council already had an infra-structure that was going, so if you were going to deal with electricity in Soweto, you already had your department of electricity, you had your department of sewerage for garbage, you had your department of engineers to do anything for roads, when the Board took over they had to build up..I mean they didn't start with every department but gradually they increased now this required an enormous amount of money so that when the (20 Board said..was told that they had to make themselves start sufficient, this is what they were told, I think therein lies the crux of the tremendous deterioration in Soweto. Now I wouldn't like to give the impression that I am personally criticising any members of the Board in their personal capacity, I am not saying for one moment that the Board didn't try its best, what I am saying is that there was no way, no way in which any Board could satisfactorily administer a million and a half people who are a dormitory suburb, a suburb with no sources of revenue with no commerce and industry, there is no real taxation and (30 in order to get money from these people, they literally have

to/..

to squeeze it out of the people of Soweto by raising house rents raising site rents, turning people..children of families into lodgers. I saw it myself so this is my opinion - as a desperate measure of finding every possible way of getting revenue, This is why I went to see Mr. Mulder himself because I was so disturbed about the housing situation and when he actually said to me that they had to be self-sufficient and I said it is not possible and I believe that the Government should be either criticised or strongly urged I said to give you the money. How can a Government create a Board, to look after a city without.. (10 like this without giving it the necessary finance, and he even said well, it is a challenge and I said well, it can't be... I mean it is no challenge, one can't really make something out of nothing it is not a challenge, you can't get money when it isn't there, you can't literally get blood out of a stone and then he said something to the effect that well, it is not easy to get finance and so on. I didn't press it because I didn't want to embarrass him but it became obvious to me that he must be aware they didn't have the finance so this is why I feel that if a Board realises that they haven't got the (20 finance and the where withal it would have been far better for them to say we cannot cope. What I am concerned about is..and I am not blaming him, because it is human nature, it is human nature to try and do the best you can and then to defend what you have done, so that if the Board had to do things which not out of a..for no malice, not for malicious reasons, I don't for one moment believe they were sitting there thinking how can we be nasty to the people of Soweto, not at all, I believe that they were forced into a position to get more revenue. They couldn't build more houses, they were forced to resettle people, (30 even if they had wanted not to resettle them, they were forced to.

So/..

So they had to give their houses to resettlement. Here this terrible home problem is escalating, what did they do, they evict people, much more quickly than used to be because if you evict somebody, whose husband has just died, you have got a house to give to the next person on the waiting-list so your waiting-list looks as if it is coming down, what is happening is you are creating more homeless people who are not legally on a list but they are still homeless people. So the misery and the quality of life deteriorated because the Board I think was forced to do things for its own survival because it had (10 no finance available.

One would have thought that the central government would have made more than two million available, which was the amount made available by the City Council. --- The exact figure that the central government had made available - I wasn't able to establish but I was able to establish that it wasn't sufficient because when the City Council made two million extra available it wasn't enough but..they didn't have to build up their infrastructure. You know, the employment of the West Rand Board, everybody has to have his job, his salary his motorcar his office(20 every office has to have staff and we all know what it costs to staff an office today, the City Council already had this, it didn't need to build up that whole big West Rand Administrative building..(intervenenes).

Yes, no you have made that point. --- So the Government may have given more than two million Rand but it wasn't sufficient. And then the most important thing - not the most - but another very important factor is one of their only sources of real revenue is Bantu beer. Now you know..I have heard..you have heard it before described as a booze economy. (30

Yes? --- Now this in fact has caused..it is such a bitter point/..

point with the people of Soweto. The women and children particularly. You see the men of Soweto, and this is another factor in this whole tragic situation of Soweto, because I see Soweto as one of the real (inaudible) .. tragedies of life, that whole set up. To me it comes across that way if you analyse the..each human being and what has happened to them as a result of this sort of structure of living. The men have been emasculated really because the men don't have any longer that real pride of head of the family and the pride of being the provider and having a proper family around him. The women have had to take over to a large extent. Now the men when they come back from work and when they realise what they are going back to and there are very little outlets and very little..even if they are earning a good salary there is nothing they can spend that money on. They want to build on, if they are allowed to, not even your..nobody is keen to build on to a rented house and as they get off the train, so they see there is always a bottle store on one side of the station and a beerhall on the other. Now this has been encouraged by the West Rand Board because most of the new things that you see that they have actually erected, since they have taken over, are bottle stores and beerhalls. They do it because they need the revenue but it has the opposite effect in Soweto because the men drink more than they would drink otherwise. Now again we can talk about drinking and drunkenness being a global thing: Sure. But it is a special situation in Soweto. I am confident that there would be far less drinking in Soweto if there were different conditions, if there were more normal outlets if there was a better family life. The women are terribly angry about it and you know how many families are headed by women, how many men.. you know, the break-up, because of this drinking and the children/..

(10

(20

(30

children resent it so much. If you have ever driven into Soweto on a Saturday afternoon, you will see little children of 6 and 7 years old pulling these..you know these little box cars on wheels, where they attach a soap box on wheels to another one and another one, pulling three or four such boxes loaded with beer, and they pull them home and I have seen in through the open doors, because on summer afternoons you can actually see through the open doors, people settling down for the weekend, because there is nothing else for them to do, they are afraid to go out at night, there isn't enough in any case available for them and so the drinking is tremendous and these children who broke up bottle stores, a lot of them, were saying: They give us drunken parents, is a very real factor.

(10)

Just one point I want to mention here, and that is that unlike the City Council, the central government does provide the money for the building of houses. And that runs into an enormous amount of money. Oh, I am told that the Government has always provided the money for the building of houses. --- Yes, but..the Department of Community Development.

Yes. --- They do provide money for the building of houses but there is another problem in Soweto. First of all we know that the number of houses that have been provided is sadly inadequate.

(20)

Yes. --- That is the..secondly, there is the question of land. Now, what I don't understand is that there is so much land around and they always say there is a shortage of land. Why, if the Government is short of money and can't provide enough money for sufficient houses, I couldn't see why they didn't just make the land available and say: Build your own homes, those of you who can. I spoke to Mr. Mulder about this and he said because the mining companies who own the land, charge

(30)

the/..

the most exorbitant prices, they charge the prices of a stand in Eloff Street. Now, doesn't the Government have powers of expropriation? I mean if a Government needs land for housing that is lying unused, and the prices are so high, I mean we expropriate in the City Council for a road, surely it is more important to expropriate for a very very vital cause like this, so that although the Government does provide that amount of money I think that it is the wrong thing to expect a Government to provide money for every single member of the Black population to rent a house. It is not normal. We are a free enterprise society and they should be able to build their houses and give them the land. (10

All right, page 12 Mrs..Dr. Browde. I think you have covered that interview with Mr. Manie Mulder. --- Yes, I think so.

Would you go on then to page 13, the interview with Mr. Cruywagen, he is a Deputy Minister, of Bantu Administration or..(intervenes). --- Yes, I went to see Mr. Cruywagen at the time when I suddenly felt that there was going to be trouble in Soweto and this was perhaps a year before actually the riots broke out..I didn't know when anything was going to happen but I was utterly and absolutely convinced that something was going to happen. Because in the two years that I had been in close contact with the people of Soweto, I had noticed a change of mood and their frustrations were getting worse and that is why I say that since the Board took over, whether it was not their fault isn't the point, but things had deteriorated and so.. when I brought the housing motion into the City Council, Councillor Venter... who is the Vice-Chairman of the West Rand Board actually argued with me on two points. He argued with me on the number of people on the waiting-list for housing, and he argued/.. (20 (30

argued with me about the fact that the high-mast lighting in Soweto had stopped. These were two pieces of information that I had obtained, I knew that the high-mast lighting had stopped through lack of funds, I knew that his figure for the housing was wrong, so I became concerned that if the Vice-Chairman of the West Rand Board doesn't know the facts, who does know the facts? When I spoke to Mr. Mulder about the housing shortage, he also gave me a figure for housing which was not accurate, he didn't seem to be aware of the urgency. So I felt..I apologised to Mr. Cruywagen and said I hoped I wasn't being presumptuous (10 but because I felt that the mood in Soweto had changed, that the situation was critical and urgent, that..could he please get it through to the right authorities that something must be done very very urgently in Soweto and I went to see him, and I spent about an hour and a half. He took copious notes and thanked me for coming and he in fact told me that that he had been taken by..he was new, he had only been in the office a couple of months, he is learning about Soweto and he said he had been told there was something like 8,000 houses necessary and I said I am afraid that figure is inaccurate and it disturbed me and I said (20 it is very important that you know the true situation and so I gave him in a lot of detail, the situation as I saw it from the point of view of Black people's perception which I think is the important perception and nothing was ever done, nothing was ever done, so whether or not he..you know, I am not for one moment suggesting that Mr. Cruywagen didn't try, it may be that the other channels..there were other channels through which he had to go, I really don't know, but they never came back to me.

Now, you hand in now EXHIBIT 271, that is the motion (30 which you had introduced into the..bottom of page 13, that
you/..

you had introduced to the City Council and..setting out also your reasons for the awareness of the change in mood in Soweto. --- Yes.

This speaks for itself and we proceed now..(intervenes).

--- May I make this one point?

Surely. --- You know, facts often, as I have said before, facts often when you see them cold, you don't get the true impression and what I would like to say is that what really is important sometimes is not so much the fact because two people can see the same situation differently, you know the Rusherman's (10 story where two people dealing with the same thing, each have a different feeling about it, a different interpretation, a different significance. The point I would like to make is that the perception of the Black man in Soweto and what his situation is, is the relevant one to this, I submit, to this Commission not necessarily the perception of the people say of the West Rand Board, who maybe terribly sincere. They really maybe think that they are doing the right thing and the reason I say this is that when I read those letters out to the City Council, the electricity letters, to me they had had a tremendous impact (20 and Councillor Venter actually said, and this was published in the newspapers, so I am not saying anything new, he actually said: I know where those letters came from, they were not written by any Bantu, they were written in your office and when I sort of..you know shocked at this and said: How can you say such a thing, he said: You can see obviously here by the language and by the way they are expressed that they are not written by any Bantu. Now I am making this point only because it seems to me that there is a tremendous gap between people in..not everybody, I don't want to generalise, but certain people in (30 the administration in the West Rand Board, there is a tremendous gap/..

gap between their perception of what life is like and what the Soweto people are like and what they need and the people themselves and it would be dangerous if we did not take the people's own perception, because that is the root cause, not the other side.

Yes, well one gets it from the two previous exhibits that you have put in, those letters about the electricity and housing. --- Yes.

We come to page 14, your personal involvement in the language question which precipitated the Soweto riots. Would you care to summarise that briefly? --- Yes. About a couple of months before the riots, the Tswana School Board phoned up a member of the School Board phoned, and asked if they could come and see me and just that day in the newspaper I had read that there was a certain amount of trouble about the use of Afrikaans and two members had been dismissed. When they arrived at my house about 12 members of the Board, they said that the children at school, at this particular school, were in danger of failing Matric because they had to write Maths and Social Studies through the medium of Afrikaans and apart from the fact that it was difficult for them to write through the medium of two languages at Matric level, the teaching in Afrikaans, because the teachers who were teaching Maths were not capable of teaching them in Afrikaans and their only concern was that these children would fail, they locally brought this up at a school board meeting with the local inspector and the result of their bringing it up was that two of them were dismissed. The two men in charge were dismissed. (10 (20

It was in May, wasn't it? --- It was about May.

Yes. --- In April or May because it was a month or two before the riots. They then asked if I could help. Now (30

I think the reason they came to me was that a couple of years ago I managed to get the Std. VI exam changed for..there was a very very dangerous situation with the Std. VI exams, they were having a system of marking which meant a lot of children were failing Std. VI who shouldn't fail and there was the same sort of turbulent mood about this and I went to see..I can't remember his name, it was Dr. Steenkamp and he died..the Secretary for Bantu Education..Dr. van Zyl, a very charming man, I went to see him, he was very ill at the time and he actually took notice..you know I am not used to help..he (10) actually took notice and he changed the system of marking for Std. VI and there was tremendous excitement and then that whole situation subsided. So they came to see me, thinking that maybe we could get this Afrikaans thing changed and I said: Certainly, I will go immediately and see..and make an appointment to see the Secretary of Bantu Education. They then telephoned me the next day, they said Chief Mangope was in town it was such an important issue that they felt although they, being urban and not being tribal, didn't acknowledge that Chief Mangope was in fact their leader, but because they knew that (20) the Government was more likely to listen to a Homeland leader than to them, they thought it was such an important issue that they would ask hom, seeing it was a Tswana school to intercede on their behalf, which they did and I said certainly, I won't do anything about it at all. Which I didn't, and I saw in the newspaper that Chief Mangope had in fact interceded and they phoned to tell me that he was taking up the case. Now this is something that I feel is significant M'Lord, because if a Homeland leader took it up as well as the people themselves and still nothing was done, and then the next thing was that (30) the children came out on strike on this very issue and I kept watching/..

watching the newspapers and the odd person that I would see from Soweto saying, what is happening? And I found it very hard to believe that absolutely nothing was done for a whole month, children were on strike for a month and nothing was done. And then we heard in evidence last week about Rene de Villiers who actually sent telegrams to the Minister or the Deputy Minister, Mr. Treurnicht and nothing was done, so that is how I knew right from May that this was an important non-political issue and then when they had this demonstration it was..I am sure that by now it has been established without (10 any doubt that it was a peaceable demonstration in which they were marching with placards because they couldn't..I mean for a month they were on strike and nothing had been done, so the next step was to have a protest march and then we know what happened after that.

Well, you know, I must tell you two things that emerged from the evidence. First of all that the children were incited and some of them, and some schools were under pain of threat of personal injury and destruction of their school, to take part in this march, and those who incited them were taking (20 advantage of this obvious and genuine grievance. Secondly far from it being peaceful we had evidence on..led, it is on record that they resorted to stone throwing and attacking Europeans burning cars long before the police even arrived on the scene. We had an official, a Mr. Smit who was stoned to death..was injured rather at half-past eight in the morning. We had a case of a social worker from Pretoria, shortly thereafter who had to be rescued by a Black woman, who took her into the residence of some Minister of Religion and saved her from a mob of children who wanted to stone her to death, and that is (30 long before the police arrived on the scene. --- Dr. Yutar it/..

it maybe. Our information you know, from all the eyewitnesses.. we had was that it was a peaceful march until the policeman shot..but it maybe, because I wouldn't even argue about that. Because I don't think it is relevant or important. You see, (intervenenes).

Well, no the only reason I mention it..I feel absolutely impartial. --- Yes.

You say it was going to be a peaceful demonstration and I am trying to tell you that the evidence led is that certain people including Mashonini took advantage of this genuine grievance and coerced the children, even children of schools where Afrikaans had not been used as a medium of instruction at all, and said if you don't join, we are going to burn your school down with you in it, and then the next day these two incidents, long before the police arrived on the scene. --- You know, I think we are actually onto..perhaps a terribly important topic, because when you talk about people intimidating or agitating or inciting is the word, I think this is such an important thing to get clear. You see, when people have genuine grievances there are two things that can happen: Either they can continue in their state of feeling that they have got grievances sort of..you know, indefinitely because they feel there is no hope of ever having anything done about it, which is unusual but it can happen in certain incidents in the history you find for many years, for many years people have lived under terrible, terrible conditions before finally they do something about it. But when you get to a position where people have reached the situation where they feel they have got grievances and those grievances are not being listened to, then you are going to get people who are going to say: Let us do something about it. So I think before we get onto what actually happened there/..

(10)

(20)

(30)

there, one had got to start by defining what is an inciter what is an agitator. If I am agitated about the fact that there are not sufficient houses and people are living terribly and I am agitating about it and I am saying: We have got to build more houses, let us get together with commerce and industry let us do something about it, people must realise, am I an agitator? Yes, I suppose I am, technically I am an agitator. Now what worries me about this whole question of agitation is that it is doing harm to the cause of South Africa I believe. It is doing harm because the word "intimidator", "agitator" (10 and "inciter" has taken on a connotation and no distinction is being drawn in the minds of many lay people, many ordinary people in the community. When they think of the riots, they immediately say: Ah! There were agitators! Now, why I say this is dangerous is that..(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: Nobody has ever suggested to this Commission that it should do that. --- No, no, no, but there are people with respect M'Lord..(intervenes).

Well, I am not concerned with what other people do, I am only concerned with what I have got to do. --- Well, it is (20 relevant in the sense that Dr. Yutar did say that there were people-inciters, and all I am saying is that if you feel you have got a terrible grievance, and this could be children anywhere of any colour and any situation, who have got a terrible grievance you are always going to get people who are going to be the ones who lead the others.

Yes. --- Right. So if the ones who lead the others.. (intervenes).

Although that is not even what he suggested to you. He said that there were people who took advantage of the fact.. (30 --- Right.

That/..

That there were grievances. --- Now, well I am coming to that. So you are going to get some people who are leaders they are saying: We are going to lead the protest. When you get such a situation, there will always be some people for other causes who might take advantage and where we have got to be careful of drawing a distinction is that the main protest and the main body of people who are involved in these things, don't have ulterior motives, there are always people, everywhere who take advantage of any situation of unrest or disquiet for their ulterior motives. And the danger here is that people don't draw a distinction, and could I just use the example of Buffalo, you know in New York State, In Buffalo with this terrible snow storm and all these people had been buried under snow in the most ghastly conditions. Well, in Buffalo there had been terrible lootings and muggings and lootings and violence and so on going on. These were people who took advantage of a situation. Now had that situation not been a natural act which was a snow storm, then you might have found people getting confused with who was the cause of it all. In this case the snow storm was the cause and the few people doing the muggings and lootings were only incidental and here it is the same thing. The cause of Soweto was the grievances against the system, the few inciters who were taking advantage of the situation were incidental, they were there, but they wouldn't be there if the causes..(intervenes). (10) (20)

You say they were incidental to the whole country flaring up, for the flare-up in the whole country? --- I believe that there was spontaneous flaring-up..(intervenes).

Spontaneous - what do you mean by spontaneous? --- I'll tell you what I mean by spontaneous. I mean that when somebody sees...for example, let us say that we have a whole lot of classrooms/.. (30)

classrooms, where we all are at school and we all feel we are very badly treated by the headmaster. And nobody does anything for years and one day one class, somebody just..that spark, and they start something, throwing eggs, whatever you like.

Do you think that is what happened here? --- Every single classroom..I'll tell you why..may I just explain why..

Yes. --- I am not saying I am correct because obviously I haven't done a personal survey but I will give you my evidence for this. When the riots happened a member of the Coloured.. (10 either a management committee or one of our Coloured ad-hoc committees happened to be in the City Council at our next meeting which was in July and he said: How lucky it was that the Coloured children at Cape Town were on holiday when this happened in Soweto. I said why? He said because you would have seen worse rioting in Cape Town. I said: Really? I was very surprised. Why do you say that? He said: Because they are so bitter the Coloured people in Cape Town, that this would have in sympathy, it would have set them off. Now I happened to be at the University of the North at Turfloop when the riots broke (20 out, I happened to be there and I can give you my personal experience to show you why I say it was spontaneous. I went with..(intervenes).

Spontaneous..spontaneous surely means unplanned? All that you mean by spontaneous is that it was something which happened because of the whole situation? --- No, what I mean is that there wasn't one person who went from Soweto to Cape Town, to Turfloop to Guguletu..(intervenes).

Would it surprise you to learn that there were motorcars going from place to place? --- No, I wouldn't be..(intervenes).(30

That the people at the Western University were up in

Johannesburg/..

Johannesburg, that the complaints about the people in Natal are that it happened when people from Soweto came there? --- I wouldn't be surprised to hear anything because I have just said that there are always people who take advantage of a situation, but what I am trying to say is that if the people hadn't been ready, absolutely ready, had people not travelled I believe there still would have been, because a Homeland chief's wife, not one of the..you know, one of the prime ministers but one of the chiefs in the Homeland came down to see me shortly after the riots because of a group of 20 women whom she had found employment for in Rustenburg because they live just over the border of Rustenburg who were starving and she found the jobs for these 20 people in a little factory and they were not allowed to work in Rustenburg because it was in the Republic where their home was in the Homeland and she said: If these people riot they will then say they are agitators. In other words, once it started, people then suddenly realised, this is something that we can do, if we have grievances. But what I am trying to say is that there might have been isolated incidents of agitators or even in numbers I don't know how many but that is a red herring, if one is looking for the fundamental causes. (10 (20

But I informed you before this Commission has not been told by anybody that it must pay attention to the red herring or to the..it has been told that these are the circumstances, and in these circumstances the following things happened. --- Yes. Right.

And nobody has even suggested to me that I should say: This all happened through agitators. Nobody has suggested that. --- My Lord, perhaps I am not making myself clear. I am not suggesting that this is what you are finding. The reason I am labouring this point is that the action of the police has been to/.. (30

to try and round up all the so-called leaders, as many as they possibly can, who might be leaders and what I am trying to put across is that it doesn't matter how many people they arrest, they will go on, as they arrest so other people will spring up because it is the natural way when you have got grievances, and the only point I am trying to make is that the fundamental causes must be tackled before one starts with the action that is going on among them where they have been arresting particularly that one period about a month ago, when they were arresting so many of the people in Soweto which increased the bitterness and was in fact doing more harm than would have been done had they consulted with the people and said: Let us sit down and find out what we can do now to ameliorate the situation. (10

DR. YUTAR: I am glad we led the factual evidence first before we lead now opinion evidence. I feel in fairness to both sides I should put this to you as well to complete the picture. That not only were these instigators, inciters and I am not referring to politicians who plead their cause, I am referring to those who coerced by dire threats of bodily harm and injury people to come out on strike but they went further, they so arranged their protest march that they put the young children in front, the more older ones at the back and the elders and also the ringleaders right at the back and they were seeking a confrontation with the police, hoping that the police would shoot and kill some of the children so that they could have a mass funeral thereafter in order to whip up enthusiasm and before you answer let me quote to you on the question of spontaneity that you mention. Here we led evidence of a place near to Pretoria where 2 o'clock in the morning hundreds of young children were lined up in this formation, right in front the elders at the back. Now are you going to suggest that all that was spontaneous/.. (20 (3)

spontaneous and that the children got up at 2 o'clock in the morning in order to indulge in a peaceful protest? --- No, I'm afraid when I use the word spontaneous, I started off by talking about that first day and the fact that all around the country immediately things happened. After that, the fact that there was organisation, doesn't minimise what I am saying, it doesn't detract from the point that I am making. I have said that I admit freely this is a universal thing, wherever there is trouble there will be people who have different means of either taking advantage or people who feel they have got a genuine cause. For example I have known, if one reads the history of strikes, there have been strikes overseas in many instances going back to the 1920's and 1930's where, when people felt they had a genuine grievance they intimidated others to come out on strike. I don't..while I find violence myself terrifying and any form of that kind of coercion I cannot obviously condone, at the same time if one doesn't understand that people living under a certain system which they find intolerable, can..this is what human beings are like..can lead them to behave in such an extreme way because they feel driven to it and they feel that anything is worth it in order to try and get change and this may be the only way they can see change. Now when I was at Turfloop and I spoke to the most militant and I can say that quite openly, because some of the people I spoke to, handed in memorandums to the Snyman Commission and I was invited there by the Rector and I met various people at Turfloop University and the one young lecturer who was one of the most militant of them all, so much so that I didn't think he would interview me and I didn't want to..actually said - he said - Can't you, which was a rather amusing thing to ask me, he said: Can't you do anything to persuade the authorities to/..

9(10

(20

(30

authorities to make some meaningful changes, to give us hope that there will be change in this country. He said: They are driving us into the arms of the Communists where we don't want to go, but the way we feel at the moment it must be better than what we have at the moment.

All right, anyhow, I have put to you the evidence and the evidence that we have led so far is this that far from these riots breaking out spontaneously and far from as you say that the organisation took over then, that planning took place before. --- May I ask you, you mean while that strike was on (10 about that particular Tswana school?

No, no, planning took place before the unrest broke out on the 16th of June. --- Oh, I see, waiting for any incident you mean.

And they took..this question of Afrikaans as the medium it is being conceded by so many witnesses..(intervenes). --- Oh, I have it in my memorandum.

Yes. --- In fact I have said.

I know, yes. --- That any incident could have led to this because the grievances were such that unrest was bound (20 to break out.

All right. Now I think we have done now with your personal involvement in the language question. We go on to page 15 "Officials". We have heard about officials who are sympathetic and unsympathetic. Do you want to add anything to that? --- No, but I think it is just worth saying, repeating what I have said about the sympathetic officials. Every time I.. not every time, on many occasions they have found their jobs intolerable and they have said to me, there very words, I wrote it down at the time that..certain members of the Board and (30 B.A.B. sit in their ivory towers while we have to dispense

the/..

the human tragedy and one man out of Soweto told me that he couldn't sleep at night but that nobody would listen to him and he would probably have to resign and the problem is there with the sympathetic official they lose..if they lose their jobs they don't know what they are going to do about it and I think it is important if one could find officials who would give you their side because they said they are in contact whereas the people who are in the administration section are remote from these problems in Soweto.

Well, we have encountered those officials too who take (10 their time to attend to you and perhaps sit on their chairs with their feet on the desk and speak on their telephones. I think that is also..(intervenes). --- No, I wasn't really meaning that.

Yes. --- I was meaning about..the..with the stamp on a piece of paper I have families broken up, that is what I was meaning.

All right. Health, that is really your baby isn't it?
--- What?

Health, on page 15. --- Yes. (20

At the bottom of page 15. --- Well I didn't really I don't put health down as one of the major causes. There was a certain amount of bitterness created by the overcrowding at Baragwanath. There was a time when they had to close the gates and when people came knocking on the gates at Baragwanath they were turned away unless the person at the gates thought they were literally dying, and they were sent back and this did cause a lot of bitterness and there was a time - this is before the riots, that they threatened..I am not sure if there wasn't some trouble, but actually threatened to storm the gates (30 at Baragwanath because there just is not sufficient facilities for/..

for the population healthwise.

Of course the situation at Baragwanath Hospital was relieved by the creation of a number of clinics in Soweto.

--- Yes.

Wasn't it. --- I have mentioned this, these eight clinics in Soweto do relieve the load to a small extent.

Yes. --- But they are far from adequate for the population size.

Yes, can you explain why those clinics were the target of this vandalism? --- It is very difficult to explain why anyone singles a target because there are more than one reason and more than one kind of person who did the damage. I think that certain things that were seen as symbols of the authority that they loathe, were just blindly..shall I say targets. They lashed out blindly and I think that in a riot situation one must concede that there is a kind of hysteria which doesn't go with logic. That is one thing. The other thing is that there are different theories which I think people of Soweto if they give you evidence in camera will give you various theories as to why certain buildings were in fact burnt and then of course you do get another element and one must take all these elements into consideration and that is the element of these psychopathic..you know, delinquents who would just go crazy when they saw an opportunity, so you find different reasons for these places being burnt, but there is no doubt that if you look at it, very few churches were burnt, very few non-administrative buildings were burnt, but things which symbolize the Board or any administrative authority were targets. I think blindly and hysterically and tragically, very tragically. (10 (20

A new church was burnt by the students of the University of Zululand. --- I mean in Soweto. (30

Oh/..

Oh. --- There seems to be a selectivity in Soweto.
All right. Now turn to Alexandra Township. --- Yes.
I think that you were going to deal with expropriation.
--- Yes. Now the expropriation of Alexandra Township...
(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: That was former hostels? --- Yes.

Now the hostels were a mistake. --- Yes. M'Lord is
conceding that?

No, I am putting this by way of a question. It would
seem to have been a mistake. Are they full? --- I believe (10
the women's hostel is..I am sure they are full because accommoda-
tion is at such a premium but the hostel is full. But the
hostels were a great mistake, a great mistake.

Is there any difficulty about..particularly relevant to
the expropriation? --- Yes.

They were? --- The expropriation of the houses.

Of the houses? --- Yes, very much so.

To make room for the former hostels. --- Yes, and this
is still going on now, or it was..I think it is still going
on now. (20

DR. YUTAR: Yes, is your complaint there that the amount offered
by way of expropriation was far below the value of the houses?

--- Yes, but it was more sinister than that, and I use the
word sinister because if people are being misled to the way
that these people were being misled, it is..and I think..have
a feeling that people didn't know what was going on. You see,
there was a special Board created for the resettlement..(inter-
venes).

CHAIRMAN: Well, just tell me how..why is it sinister, what
happened? --- Because this special Board that was created.. (30

Yes? --- Would send people a little note and say to

them/..

them: We need your house, please tell us what you want, how much you want for it, we are going to have to buy your house, tell us what you want for it, so they went off to an evaluator because they didn't know what they wanted for it they know that they had bought the house 20 years ago or 30 years ago, 10 years ago because they bought it free-hold and a lot of them had spent a lot of money on improvements but of course cash improvements, so there is no way of judging. So they went off and spent money, quite a lot of money to get an evaluator. Now the first thing - why I used the word sinister is because..the first thing was that simple people, not knowing any better, would say: How much? Well, I suppose a thousand Rand or two thousand Rand is quite a lot of money and so the simple old people would ask for that. The house is in fact worth a lot more but they said well, that is what we want. I don't believe that is the way it should have been approached in the first place. (10

How should it have been approached? --- It should have been approached by saying the truth and the truth was this: There is an expropriation formula but people were not informed at all of the method of expropriation they were not informed that in fact that the expropriation formula which, if they had known about, would have given them the minimum, not the maximum but the minimum, so one of the next steps were we will go... know how much to ask for, we will go to an evaluator, so they did, they went to an evaluator, who would come back and I saw some of the valuations, R15,000, R18,000. Then they would send this evaluation in to this Resettlement Board who would then send them back a letter saying: We have sent out our evaluator and your house is worth R4,000. Now why I am saying this is so wrong is that they spent all that money on an evaluator, then they/.. (20 (30

they were given these expectations of R16,000. Then they were offered R4,000 and all this time they didn't know that the Board was working to a formula, then they would go to an attorney then the attorney and there are a lot of people who are to blame in many of these cases, because there were some attorneys, certainly not all, but some attorneys who didn't trouble to find out that there was a formula, so the attorney would say: Well, you have been offered R4,000 and they ask R16,000 let us write to the Board and ask them to give you another thousand or so, and the attorney felt very pleased if he got an offer of R5,000 or R5,500 then he would encourage these people to take it. Now I only first heard about this when a man arrived at my house one day, having gone through this whole procedure and said that he had bought his property right opposite the shops in Alexandra where he had thought that one day it was on a corner, opposite shops, he would get a re-zoning and be able to put up shops and flats as an investment and he had..it was a very nice house with a large bit of ground a quarter of an acre which was worth a lot of money because Alexandra Township if it was opened up, would be a very valuable area, and he wasn't prepared to accept the R4,000 and that is how I, in going into it and talking to the Board and discussing it with them, found out that there were..I don't mean the West Rand Board, I mean the Resettlement Board..found out there was a formula. We then calculated on the formula that he was entitled to R9,500 and at the end of correspondence they finally gave R9,300 which we accepted. So that once this happened, I realised that so many of the others had not known and therefore they hadn't got what they were entitled to and I went to see Mr. Cruywagen about this for two reasons, firstly because people were literally being done out of what they rightfully

deserved/..

deserved according to the formula which they didn't know about and their attorneys didn't know about. Secondly, I then looked up the law of Expropriation and I found that when a White person is expropriated they get according also to a formula but they get something according to market value and for inconvenience and they actually get a very reasonable price. When a Black man is expropriated..(intervenes).

I don't know, there are some people who think that they get a very unreasonable price, in Park Town. --- Yes.

DR. YUTAR: I am thinking of the same...(LAUGHTER). --- Yes, (10
I know who we are thinking of...I think he got an unreasonable price. (LAUGHTER).

CHAIRMAN: Yes. --- But let us take normal expropriations under normal circumstances, the actual law if you look it up, the Law of Expropriation of Whites is quite a reasonable law. The Law of Expropriation of Blacks is very unreasonable. It gives their original purchase price, plus 6% simple interest per year. Now the original purchase price if you can imagine in Alexandra Township was very low, so it is totally unrealistic.. a totally unrealistic price according to this expropriation (20
formula. Now, when we had arguments about market value, they said: Oh, there is no market value in Alexandra, but I think one could argue that because there are industrial properties in Alexandra which are very valuable and/^{if}any of those sites are going to be used for industrial you can work out very quickly what they would be worth. If you take the houses across the road in Kew one could work out what they would be worth. If these houses were put onto open market, so I think that to offer a man R2,000 or R3,000 or R4,000 for a quarter of an acre of his house with the evaluator using as he told me, the (30
evaluator himself..which he thought something shocking..I don't know/..

know how much per square foot, but he used an amount per square foot which was way, way way less than he would in any White suburb and still he reached R16,000 and R18,000 in some places. So what I am saying is that what I brought to the attention of Mr. Cruywagen were two aspects, one was the method of expropriation that the approach to the people was wrong and causing bitterness such as you cannot imagine and the other was that the basic law applying to expropriation should be changed. That you shouldn't have two double standards, two different standards. (10

DR. YUTAR: What did Mr. Cruywagen say in reply? --- Well, he was very sympathetic, very interested and he took down every detail but I never got a reply.

All right, they will all be given an opportunity to reply. I think that concludes your memorandum, is there anything else you would like to add to what you have said, and we have covered certainly a multitude of sins. --- Yes. I don't think so, I would just like to just make one last point about things not being permitted, just to get very briefly back perhaps to a group called the Soweto Home Improvement Group which also (20 wanted to do things in Soweto, purely on a..as a service to help people improve homes and give them advice and this also has been turned down by the West Rand Board and I just feel that if one were to go into the reasons why all attempts that have been made to improve...it is just a final point but what I would like to say is it is not just that I am being critical, I am trying to understand the other side, because you I think will be getting evidence from the West Rand Board which will give their side of the case, obviously, and what I would like to say is this that it is natural when people are trying to do (30 something, that they get paranoid when they think that by private/..

private organisations, other people are doing something it is attempting to show them up, which I feel is understandable in the human context but a mistake and therefore a lot of things will be justified, perhaps they will try and justify instead of perhaps saying: We didn't have the finance, but the reason we refused them..they might find a very good reason.. we were supplying such amenities. I submit that the problem was that people such as these various groups who have been prevented from doing it, was perhaps a mistaken feeling that it was either a deliberate or perhaps it would have been.. (10

the effect would have been an attempt to show up their lack of ability to do things and I just think that this is something that could be gone into and it could be changed, because there is a spirit of co-operation with everybody, if people are allowed to come in and assist, you know, quietly and where they tried, I think this could also go a long way in..my final analogy may I give you an analogy, I can't resist it, it has just occurred to me. I was talking about..you were talking about symptoms when Mr. Moss gave evidence, he spoke about diagnosis remember? And treatment. And it reminded me of what..in (20

this whole context, if you think of a patient with diabetes, that diabetes may be undiagnosed but the evidence of it often is coming out in very ugly boils and carbuncles. Now if a doctor misses a diagnosis, he will treat that patient as each erupts, he treats the boils, he treats carbuncles, they are actually the most hideous things but he has missed the fact that that underlying cause is the diabetes, so each time you have an eruption, it is no point in just treating what..that particular thing with that local cure, you have to cure the underlying disease and that is my only analogy for the situation. (30

I think we get your point, doctor. --- Thank you.

CHAIRMAN/..

CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, doctor. How long will the next witness be?

DR. YUTAR: The next witness My Lord, will take at least an hour and I would perhaps suggest that we take her on Monday because we have had a very long day. I don't know how she feels about it.

CHAIRMAN: I am prepared to sit a little longer than the usual time, if the staff are prepared to..

DR. YUTAR: I call Miss Gibson.

CHAIRMAN: Well, then I would like to..if we are going to (10
sit a little longer, I would like to adjourn for a few moments.

COMMISSION ADJOURNS / COMMISSION RESUMES

CHAIRMAN: Yes, Dr. Yutar.

OLIVE GIBSON (affirms to speak the truth):

DR. YUTAR: Miss Gibson, you are going to give evidence on behalf of the members of the Johannesburg Meeting of the Society of Friends, otherwise known as the Quakers? --- Right.

And for that purpose a report has been drawn up by yourself working together with other members of your working group. This report is now before you, it is complete with annexure and as (20
I said to you in consultation I think the first page we must read out in full. You can perhaps summarise what follows later.

But so will you start reading please the first page? ---

1. We welcome the setting up of this Commission, its wide terms of reference, and the inclusion of an African member.

2. The Advices of our Religious Society on social matters exhort us to seek out root causes of social problems, unrest and injustice, and to strive to live in the life and power which takes away the occasion of all wars and violence. The underlying causes which are triggering off deeper ones. We feel that this (30
is a precept for society as a whole if peace and justice are

to/..

to obtain. We therefore wish to support your Commission in seeking to understand the causes behind the Soweto riots and what is needed to avoid future violence. We are only a small church group, but we have over the years been in close contact with a number of Soweto people, as church members and attenders, Committee members, friends and colleagues, and a great number of social work clients, in addition to more general contacts. I should apologise here for the fact that I was hoping to bring a sister, a nursing sister with me from our committee to the Commission - but she was on leave, we couldn't (10 get her. An African sister. As a church group we are well acquainted with Soweto. From these experiences we have become aware of longer term conditions there, and the build-up of discontent, frustration and tension among Africans, particularly in this last couple of years and some of its causes. More recently of course we have been in touch with people who were there in the riot situation. Conditions during and immediately after the disturbances made it more than usually difficult to keep in touch with our friends and to get..we became rather part of the general alienation and ignorance between White and (20 Black communities so that it was difficult to compile any evidence including the thoughts of our Black members, but recently this has become more normal again and our committee members have been back with us. We also found that many Black people declined to be quoted by name for fear of victimisation. Furthermore, of course none of our White members were in Soweto on the day that the riots broke out and therefore none can submit eyewitness accounts of these events. So it was just by chance I had been out there days before and just on that particular day I was doing something in town instead. 4. We (30 do not in any way put forward these facts and considerations

as/ ...

as a substitute for direct statements by Black people themselves. The following points are made subject to their interpretation of the facts because they have the personal knowledge of the situation and events and what they mean to them. 5. Our aim is to convey how we have understood the Soweto Africans' feelings to have built up at this time, through what we have gathered from our own sources, as well as from reports made available through the news media. As we see it, the cumulative effect of our impressions has certain implications as to why this violence occurred now, and became (10) so serious. Moreover we do not think it can be regarded as over and done with, but rather as something which could again break out in one form or other. Keeping it "under control" by force and fear is no answer and may indeed reinforce its underlying causes and seriously aggravate the course of future events. These underlying resentments and needs must be articulated, heard, and responded to, in new and courageous ways, acceptable to those they concern.

Right. You are now going to make the following submissions under five heads, the actual riots, the underlying frustrations (20) and causes of anger, expansion of certain factors, summary of your suggestions and certain appendices including newspaper articles upon which you rely. Let me say now of course these newspaper articles on which you rely, you cannot vouch for its correctness? You accept them at their face value. --- Yes.

Right. Now, we start then with the actual riots. The focal issue and the flashpoint. Would you summarise that please? --- I don't want to go into it in a too lengthy way into the question of the language issue which I am sure you have heard (30) a great deal about, but I do want to point out the length of time/..

time that this has been building up over. Bantu Education itself was not acceptable to the Blacks and one of the things which was very unacceptable about it was the ethnic grouping of schools which happened a few years back or was in force particularly a few years back and then in the beginning of this particular issue, started in 1972, when Mr. M.C. Botha issued an instruction to be implemented in January, 1975 that in secondary schools the schools could choose either English or Afrikaans throughout or choose to teach the different subjects on a 50/50 basis and whichever language they did not choose to teach in, they had to have the extra time as a subject. The decision was conveyed eventually by Dr. van Zyl, who has been mentioned before, who sent out a circular about it and he stressed that it was better in fact to use only one of the languages and that it might be.. the one dominant in the area. Some of the teachers objected to that because they had various reasons for finding that the English language had more uses for students and if they had to choose one it was better to choose a universal language, a language in which more of their books were available and so on but he was in favour of the one language and therefore he didn't say English or Afrikaans, the people could choose and the school boards were to be in on the choice. After he died, this was overlooked and the controversy arose in which the Regional Director, Mr. Ackermann in South Transvaal and Mr. Erasmus in North Transvaal interpreted this as meaning that this was only the decision until there were sufficient people who could teach adequately in Afrikaans. And they therefore insisted that the 50/50 basis had to be used. Now that started in August 1974 and this is really where this whole thing started to get very hot under the collar. The school boards were

extremely/..

extremely anxious about the children, so were the parents because they felt that the teaching in Afrikaans was going to be very inadequate and the subjects would not be well learned, the children would fail their exams and so on and many representations were made to the officials about this. Orlando Diepkloof Zulu School Board was particularly angry about it and because the school boards had not in fact been consulted about the choice of language as had been laid down by the Minister of Education himself and Dr. van Zyl and because the authorities were just not seeing the point (10 about this at all, and many representations which are all in the appendix there, the truth can be...(intervenues).

Where are you reading from now, Miss Gibson. --- I am sorry, I deviated from the..(intervenues).

Yes, you have. Keep to the main memorandum, I asked for a summary please. --- Well, the summary is that this thing was so neglected and was made even worse by the sacking of school board chairmen so that the people were made more angry and there was even mention of a parents' march to Pretoria to see about it before the children marched. So that there (20 was a real community grievance, sir, felt and accepted by all the people. As the children took over this question, they decided on the strikes and there were as Dr. Browde has said, they were on strike for about 5 weeks with nothing happening to bring this to a head or to resolve it and then the children started what we do believe was intended to be a peaceful demonstration. Many people have quoted to us that they saw the children marching by, they were happy, they were singing and so on and this was to culminate in a formal protest to the person who was in authority in the Department of Bantu (30 Education. As you know it was thwarted by police action.

Aggravation/..

Aggravation prior to the riots..(intervenes).

Let us really summarise that. --- I want to point out here that in the previous ten days there were several incidents at schools where the students were on strike and where police were called to deal with insubordination if you like and their cars were attacked on two occasions, on one occasion tyres were let down and on one occasion a police van was stoned. I mention this because this is all part of the building-up of this thundery sort of attitude and my reaction was that I felt the police should have realised from that that the situation (10 was very dangerous and would need handling in a certain way and the authorities needed to really resolve this problem. In these incidents the police had shown themselves willing to arrest children on school grounds, they had brought vans and dogs and the children were already willing to damage their property and to do the things which were not really normal in the society. I think that in these circumstances, the police tactics when they found this march on their hands, were obviously going to cause a flash. They moved then on the marchers in a display of countering force, they weren't just guarding (20 their property and their installations and our feeling is that had they done this, the children would have had their march, they would have gone to the stadium and the thing would have petered out if they had been able to put their feelings to the appropriate people and nothing further we think would have happened on that particular occasion.

You heard me mention to Dr. Browdie that the children were exhorted to violence long before the police arrived on the scene. Does that alter your view in any way? --- I have only heard in one newspaper report of this case of people who were (30 there in the morning, I don't know what they..(intervenes).

I /..

I am not talking about newspaper reports, I am giving to you the evidence that was led. The evidence led before this Commission was that there were instances where the children rioted, threw stones and attacked European people, a man and a woman just because they were White long before the police arrived on the scene. Do you call that a peaceful demonstration? --- I am sure that the children intended this to be a peaceful demonstration.

And by what authority do you say on page 3, line 4 "in which the police lost out against the students", why do you (10 say that? --- In these incidents which I have mentioned before in the previous ten days the police vehicles were damaged and the students succeeded if you like, in their violence.

You say here "in which the police lost out against the students", why do you say that? --- I should imagine that they felt humiliated by the fact that those things had happened.

Oh, is this your imagination. --- It is my interpretation of what happened.

Right. Students' inexperience of probable effects - do you want to say anything on that beyond what you have (20 written there. --- Sorry, where are you?

Page 3. Students' inexperience of probably effects. --- No, I think this is obvious that the students didn't know.

Right. The flashpoint you have dealt with, the development of violence..do you want to add to that? --- Yes, I think that we still feel convinced that from the moment a single child anywhere in this situation was killed by police fire, serious rioting was almost inevitable. And the killing of young children and young people turned this into serious, long-term rioting. (30

How many young children were killed, do you know? --- I don't/..

don't know.

Have you any idea? --- I know on that particular morning there were supposed to have been two in this first incident.

Right. Page 4, lack of attempt to communicate. --- In Soweto we have heard of no point at which the police tried to break through this role-situation in which there was a little war there between the students and themselves, and to get through to them or talk to them. This happened in Pretoria and the East Rand I understand cooling the situation into something which was controllable. (10

Right. Police firing. --- In the first confused days we heard several times about seemingly meaningless and reckless shooting as though police were going after people to shoot them especially being concerned about looters. Random people, children and adults were being shot.

Where did you hear all that? --- I heard this from people coming into the office.

From? --- From people coming into the office, who had seen this happen and one of our own (inaudible) young man reported that his mother was shot dead in Potchefstroom road (20 when she was going to fetch the children out of the disturbance because she didn't want them getting into trouble.

CHAIRMAN: Do you know what her name was? --- Yes, she was Sarah Nkosi.

Pardon? --- She was Sarah Nkosi and she was shot on June 17th. Shot in Potchefstroom road.

One moment please.

DR. YUTAR: And shot where? --- Near the shops in Potchefstroom road, near...(intervenes).

When? --- Sorry? (30

What date? --- June 17th.

And who told you this? --- Her son.

Her son. The son's name? --- Johannes Tshabalala.

And where can we contact him, would he be prepared to come and give that evidence? --- I can ask him to, I did try to contact him before this hearing but..(intervenes).

Right, will you invite him to come and give that evidence?

--- Yes.

Right, next. --- Once this situation developed it was very clear that the youngsters became excited and saw this as their role to fight the police and show their fearlessness against bullets. And the tsotsi element joined them and were temporarily welcomed I think as an addition to their power to destroy all the symbols of the administrative rule in which Blacks have no part, which were the WRAB buildings and school board offices and beerhalls. (10

I think you yourself said you don't want to read the whole thing, but that is exactly what you are doing now. I would like you to summarise it. Because this will all be read. Adult anger. --- The adult population although they were very self-controlled about their feelings and they definitely didn't want violence and destruction, it is our impression that the anger vented by the young people was consistent with the feelings of the adult population and their very deep grievances and frustrations and this was now added to by the feeling that.. feelings aroused by the killing of children and the provoking as they felt of children by the police presence, with their guns. They felt this very strongly and they still do. (20

How do you feel about this Miss Carruthers and three other White women who were set upon by a mob of youngsters and brutally assaulted, how do you feel about that? --- You mean the people that went through in a car? (30

Yes./..

Yes. --- I think they were unwise to try and drive through in a car like that..drive through a crowd in a car like that.

They were there to do a charitable job for the young Black children, how do you feel about them being attacked?

-- I think it has been said once you get an excited crowd they do things and I think that although the violence had broken out when this incident happened, I know that it had in fact..(intervenes).

Well, long before the police arrived on the scene there were at least two incidents, one where a man driving a car was attacked and another case where a young European girl was saved from certain death by certain young Black people who restrained others from killing her. Long before the police arrived. What have you to say about that? --- Well, I think this is part of the situation of excitement as part of what I said that the children themselves didn't know how this thing would develop. (10

Oh, part of what you saw of the peaceful demonstration? -- Well, I don't..I can't corroborate or..I don't know about the police not having arrived at that point. (20

Well, I am telling you that is the evidence. --- All my evidence has been that the children did not get angry and did not start throwing stones until somebody attacked them.

That is your evidence? --- Yes.

Did you hear it under oath? --- I don't take oaths from people.

No. --- But this has been a body of opinion from many people, and I personally..(intervenes).

C AIRMAN: You know, Miss Carruthers was the one who was a most killed. --- I heard her..(intervenes). (30

And/..

And Miss Carruthers speaks differently.--I read her evidence.

DR. YUTAR: His Lordship is speaking to you, Miss Gibson.

CHAIRMAN: Yes, Miss Gibson. --- I read her evidence M'Lord and I don't think she was used to Soweto..(intervenes).

She what..? --- I don't think she was used to Soweto I think she had come there as a visitor and I personally would not have dreamt of driving through that crowd.

She wasn't driving, somebody else was driving, somebody else was driving, somebody who came there regularly, who was (10 in fact visiting one of the crèches. --- Yes, but I think they were very unwise to drive through that crowd.

Well, they had to get out somewhere. --- Well, you heard what happened to Mrs. Newton Thompson, she was advised to take side roads. I have had the same advice myself in similar circumstances. Nothing has happened, the people have looked after me and they looked after her.

Well, no the point is this that Mrs. Carruthers seemed to think that the attack on her was before there had been any serious confrontation with the police. She might be out in (20 time, I don't know it hasn't been analysed finally yet, but there are two other incidents which have been mentioned before there was any..before as has been said, the police were on the scene.

DR. YUTAR: Wel, ek het haar gesê.

CHAIRMAN: One happened, but some distance away from Orlando East where a man had been attacked in his car and in fact you know the time when he reported that to the police it was before the police had gone out..well, before the main body of police had gone out. --- Yes. Well, I can only speak of the main body(30 of things that I know.

Well/..

Well, these are the actual hours, the time by minutes.
--- I think there was so much happening in Soweto that morning that it would be difficult to know where the thing did start.

Well, I think you must leave that to me to find out whether it is difficult to decide on these things. --- Yes.

But I shall most certainly have to try. Now if I come to that conclusion, if I should come to the conclusion that that had in fact happened before the first confrontation, that is before the police tried to stop or do anything in connection (10 with the mob, what would your attitude be then? --- I would want to ask a question sir. I would want to know who the people were that made the attack. We don't know that they were school children.

Well, I have got the evidence too but let us stick to this one point: If it becomes clear, I have to find that the attack on the man in the car was some time before the police had appeared on the..on the scene where the first confrontation was, what would you say to that? --- I think I would want to question that particular person and to know how (20 that happened. I would want to know all about that incident.

How what happened? --- How that attack happened.

The attack, the man was driving in his car. --- Yes.

When they attacked his car. --- But we don't know why. Or who did.

This was a part of the procession that passed a particular point, he passed there on his ordinary business. --- Yes.

And his car was attacked. --- Yes. But I have already said that the tsotsi element did attach themselves to this big crowd. (30

At that early hour in the morning? --- I would think so.

Did/..

Did the man say that the particular people who attacked him had school uniforms on or not?

DR. YUTAR: That's right, it was school children. And the evidence is that the tsotsi element only took over late in the afternoon. --- It took over thoroughly later on, I agree with that. But I think they were in the crowd, they joined this crowd no doubt.

CHAIRMAN: Please understand me, I am not saying that you formed a wrong impression, I have to decide in the end and I want to know if I find certain facts what your attitude would be (10 towards the possibility of an attack..of a march which was peaceful from the start but naturally you haven't benefit of the information that I heard in the Commission. --- Well, I have said in this that I think it was a dangerous operation which the children didn't realise all the potentials of.

It was a dangerous operation by the children? --- Yes, they couldn't know all the things that could happen and the difficulty of controlling an enormous crowd which was composed of very many different elements, different sorts of children in different moods and perhaps what was happening in Orlando (20 West and what was happening in Senoane were two completely different things. That in one you would have the cheerful, happy mood and in another somebody might start agitating and make it a much more excitable affair. But everything that I have said of the people who heard the children at the beginning said they were happy, they were singing and everybody thought it was a cheerful thing although they knew about this tension that was going on before, they thought this was a cheerful thing until something started to happen.

Yes?

DR. YUTAR: You want to accept what you heard, but you are not prepared/.. (30

prepared to accept what this Commission has heard under oath, is that the position? --- I don't feel to contradict what I am saying, Dr. Yutar. I am saying that the intention of the march and the march at the beginning was a peaceful march, incidents happened and I have said also that I think that it was almost inevitable that incidents could happen because you see it was too big, you had 10,000 kids and they weren't all school kids.

But now take the second incident, where there were not 10,000 children where there was a crowd of children attacking (10 a car in which there was a young White girl from Pretoria, who was doing social work amongst the Blacks and she was driving in that car with a Black social worker, a woman and she was attacked and they wanted to kill her, that is what the students wanted to do, and it was this Black woman who pleaded with the Black students: Don't kill her and then she was taken into the house of a Minister of Religion and shielded there. That is long before the police arrived on the scene. Now that is the evidence given by the Black person herself. --- Yes. But I don't think this means that the body of those children intended (20 killing anybody.

Although they said expressly, according to this witness: Let's kill her. --- This must have been a few children around this car.

Let us go on, page 5. Underlying frustrations and causes of anger. Would you summarise that please? Have you marked it there Miss Gibson. --- Yes, I was just wondering what it was..

Because I asked you to mark the passages that you would like to read, otherwise you just summarise it briefly. --- I wanted to make a point before that if you don't mind, on the (30 alienation and division at the bottom of page 4. That after this/..

this event there was this alienation between the generations and between Black and White and parents were no longer able to talk to their children, whom they said had lost patience with them because they failed to break out of the state of compulsion by Whites which keeps Blacks helpless and the Whites' refusal to recognise Blacks as adults capable of sharing the running of their own affairs, so that everything was decided for and about them. I think parents have drawn closer to their children since this, because they feel that the children have articulated their grievances and their aspirations. (10

And they have been astonished at the commitment with which they did it, even if they didn't approve of the way that they did it. Underlying frustrations and causes of anger - this probably repeats a good deal of what has been said but it was our impression that these underlying things, unrest and frustration were there and were the real reason why this burst in this way even though the language problem and this other handling had also caused it, had been the immediate cause. This is a community which for generations has been living in indignity and relative hardship under White rule, the rule (20

of another community and have been unable to realise their aspirations and suffered massive interference with their lives and tremendous frustrations at the hands of both the White Government and the White people and in this last couple of years it has sharpened beyond endurance. Rapidly rising standards has a great deal to do with this and expectations and capacity have reached the point where "something has to give": A way of expressing not only grievances but also their wishes creativity and adult responsibility and these cannot longer be denied. I am sure the Government knows this because (30

it knows how many able people there are in the population

not/..

not just house servants and manual workers but it seems that because of their fear of power sharing recently expressed by the Prime Minister, Mr. Botha and Mr. Kruger they have felt unable to respond in the obvious way by providing channels into a share in the initiatives of the..of Government and the alternative offered, the Homeland policy is a deliberate and artificial way of avoiding this through Homeland independence developments to channel off such power and trying to force people into falling in with this plan, even against their will. This is felt by Blacks to constitute a massive interference (10 with the whole community's self-concept and motivation, to which it has not consented. The Status of the Transkei Bill which was..(intervenes).

CHAIRMAN: Aren't you really on the question of politics now, and not on the question of what caused the riots? --- I do think that politics caused the riots, sir.

No, that is what I say: Isn't this a question of politics and policy? --- No, I..(intervenes).

Homeland policy? --- I think this is a matter of the causes of the riots because in the weeks before the riots, (20 there was tremendous anger about the Homeland citizenship, whole discussions and the Status of the Transkei Bill, people didn't want to be uprooted and lose their South African citizenship and become citizens of a Homeland which very many of them hardly know and where they couldn't make a living and so on and they don't want to be regarded as ethnically divided. This is something which they feel they have gone past and which the White authorities seem determined to try and push them back into this and the people felt rejected by this..(intervenes).

Do you say this of the people in the Homelands as well? (30

--- Yes, I suppose that those who have lived there always

will/..

will be quite happy with this although they also want to be able to come to South Africa to work but I think that this is particularly an urban Black attitude, they have grown up in the towns, they have known higher standards..(intervenes).

Yes, but then this..what happens in the Homelands doesn't really concern this particular point of yours, does it? --- Well, except that the citizenship idea was to affect all urban Blacks.

That may be but this, the White authorities determine the lines along which they are to develop, pushing them into (10 what they feel to be outdated and divisive tribalistic patterns which they reject. --- Yes.

Now can you say that in the Homelands, and that is what I asked you, they reject that? That they reject..or that in the Homelands the White authority determines the lines.. pushing them into that? Could you really say that? --- No I wasn't suggesting this about the people who were already living there, I am suggesting this about the people in the South African area, the common area, which..who now have to identify themselves through citizenship cards with..(intervenes). (20

Yes, if that is what you mean. --- Their different Homelands which they do not accept as their Homelands and they don't accept..(intervenes).

Yes, you say that in a later paragraph, you..(intervenes). --- And this was causing very great anger at that time. Similarly ethnic grouping in the townships which is the same idea of dividing everybody up into little tribal groups and tribal schools and so on. Influx control in its present form is considered oppressive and discriminatory and causes a great deal of hardship and unhappiness and of course does stop many people from the (30 rural end who have potential to come to town and to develop and/..

and contribute much more to the economy, they are just absolutely stuck there and my objection to influx control is as I have said that the influx control is based on a person's place of birth and this absolutely fixes the situation for him for his lifetime. And I think that a very much better system of regulating the flow of labour coming to the industrial areas and to the places where there is housing and so on, could be worked out by studying what is done in other places, which would not fix this forever for a particular person. The failure of the community to achieve (10 any remedies for any of these things is seen by the people as due to a lack of representative institutions with any power over these matters which so deeply affect them throughout the Republic.

DR. YUTAR: Would this be a convenient stage to adjourn My Lord, as this witness will be a long time still at the rate she is going.

CHAIRMAN: Would you prefer that we adjourn at this stage? --- I think we are probably all rather tired.

DR. YUTAR: I am not tired, I can..(intervenes). --- I (20 thought you were saying you wanted to.

CHAIRMAN: Well, I leave it entirely to you. Would you like us to adjourn at this stage? --- I think if Dr. Yutar feels we can't do this..(intervenes).

DR. YUTAR: No, no, don't worry about me I am prepared to stay here until tonight if you like, finish your evidence.

CHAIRMAN: It really depends on whether your own..(intervenes). --- I think it would be better if we adjourned, sir, I think we have all had enough.

Yes, it is..if you think it is better if we adjourned (30 now? --- If that suits you.

Yes,/. .

Yes, I think it is getting a bit of a long day. You have been here all day trying to be heard and we haven't been able to fit you in. Would it be convenient for you to come on Monday morning? --- I will come on Monday.

If you can't we can fit in some other time. --- I'll come on Monday morning. I hope I can be heard early.

Pardon? --- I hope I can be heard early.

If you come on Monday morning, obviously you have first choice because you... --- Yes, thank you.

..you still have the floor at this stage. So if I (10
adjourn it to Monday morning will that suit you? --- Thank
you, yes.

COMMISSION ADJOURNS
