SPRO-CAS PUBLICATION NUMBER 5

EDUCATION BEYOND APARTHEID

REPORT OF THE EDUCATION COMMISSION
OF THE STUDY PROJECT ON CHRISTIANITY
IN APARTHEID SOCIETY

JOHANNESBURG 1971

Cover design by Percy Itzler

The South African Council of Churches and the Christian Institute of Southern Africa are deeply grateful to the members of the Education Commission of Spro-cas for their work.

Printed by the Christian Institute of Southern Africa,
305 Dunwell,
35 Jorissen Street,
Braamfontein,
Johannesburg.

EDUCATION BEYOND

APARTHEID

CONTENTS

TABLES

Preamble

THE NATURE AND FUNCTION OF SPRO-CAS

THERE IS A long history of church pronouncements in South Africa condemning racial prejudice and racial discrimination and exhorting the white people of this country to live in love and fellowship with their black compatriots. The Message to the People of South Africa, issued in September 1968 by the Theological Commission of the South African Council of Churches, was one of these. A theological critique of apartheid, the Message denounced the country's racial policies as 'truly hostile to Christianity'. (1).

The Message took a broad theological view. It did not set out to consider the implications of this view in specific aspects of our national life such as economics or education. Nor could it be expected that those reading and studying the Message, including those who accepted its basic premises, would immediately be able to interpret those implications.

Realising the need to work out in detail the implications of the Message for our national life, the South African Council of Churches and the Christian Institute of Southern Africa in 1969 jointly sponsored the Study Project on Christianity in Apartheid Society (SPRO-CAS), as a follow-up to the theological work undertaken by the authors of the Message. Six study commissions were established with the aim of presenting comprehensive reports within two years.

The Message provided the stimulus for Spro-cas; it did not constitute the project's terms of reference. It also provided the basic theological foundation, viz. the Gospel as reconciliation, and as God's victory, his sovereignty, and his opposition to evil. No attempt was made to suggest

that the Message itself was beyond criticism, or that it was a final theological pronouncement.

The commissions were asked to examine the following areas in the light of the Message to the People of South Africa: economics, education, law, politics, society and the church. Their reports are published independently and do not necessarily bind the sponsoring bodies. In this way, it is hoped to achieve the greatest degree of objectivity and open-mindedness. The members of the commissions were selected on the basis of their known ethical concern and their expert knowledge and experience in the different fields of study. Since South Africa is a multi-religious country, and since it would be presumptuous to suggest that only Christians can find solutions to our problems, a number of non-Christians were invited to serve on the commissions.

Finalising the membership of the commissions and formulating their terms of reference took some months, and the first round of meetings took place in the middle of 1969. The commissions met approximately every six months until the first half of 1971, usually for a full week-end at residential venues in Johannesburg, Durban or Cape Town. The discussions were generally based on working papers or draft reports prepared by members or working groups of the commissions. There was also consultation with individuals and groups beyond the immediate membership of the commissions. In this way they had the benefit of viewpoints not sufficiently represented on the commissions themselves.

Spro-cas itself cannot bring about the fundamental changes so urgently required in our society. It faces limitations in terms both of its mandate as a study project and in terms of the obvious difficulties of its findings being accepted and implemented by those in power. We hope, however, that it will help to clarify our problems, specify those aspects of our life which are at variance with the Gospel of Jesus Christ and indicate the course that must be adopted if disaster is to be averted. The reports of the six commissions are obviously inter-related and should be read and considered in conjunction with each other.

Preceding the reports, four Spro-cas Occasional Publications were issued between November 1970 and March 1971. These publications contain selections from the many working documents prepared for the commissions, and their titles are: *Anatomy of Apartheid, South Africa's Minorities, Directions of Change in South African Politics, and Some Implications of Inequality.*

After the six individual reports have been issued, a co-ordinated report drawing on the findings of all the commissions will be compiled and disseminated as widely as possible.

The public debate on the morality of apartheid is never far below the surface and there are indications that it is beginning to resume with vigour. A great many South Africans are perplexed and confused and will welcome new leads based firmly on morally justifiable principles. We hope that such people will find much of value in the reports of the six Spro-cas commissions. It is proposed that an on-going programme of action aimed at implementing the findings of the commissions will be instituted during 1972.

Peter Randall
Director of Spro-cas

1 June, 1971.

Chapter One

INTRODUCTION

1.1. In this report the Commission has interpreted education in three distinct but inter-related ways. The first concerns the process of becoming educated, and involves such concepts as personal growth and the development of individual capacities, attainments and moral social attitudes. The second concerns the society's needs for socializing the child and preparing him to fit as an adult into the society's pattern. The third concerns the institutions, both State and private, which are organized to meet the two previous interpretations of the process of education.

1.2 Comparatively little direct attention has been given to the first interpretation of the educational process, apart from considering the moral education of the child in Chapter 3 and in Appendix i. Nevertheless, all our criticisms and recommendations have been made with the aim of promoting full realisation of the potential of the individual. The realisation of individual freedom must be achieved without encroaching on the rights of others, and must be linked with responsibilities for the welfare of others.

1.3 Our report was governed by the following terms of reference, which the Commission drew up at its first meeting:

In the light of the Message to the People of South Africa

1. to consider and set out briefly an acceptable order of society;
2. to identify current principles and practices in South African education which are unacceptable;
3. to sketch long-term changes in education to accord with 1;
4. to consider what educational steps towards the acceptable order of society may most usefully be taken immediately.

1.4 In considering these terms of reference we have had the benefit of the working papers which other Spro-cas Commissions have produced on matters related to alternative social, economic and political structures for South Africa. We have been aware that our major recommendations are largely dependent upon fundamental changes in other aspects of South African society. In particular, the ideology of apartheid must be abandoned for a new approach stressing co-operation, mutual respect and tolerance, and equality of worth and opportunity. Without this some of the most important educational recommendations cannot be implemented.

1.5 We have given consideration in Chapter 2 to what we feel to be an acceptable order of society (although we recognise that education by itself cannot be the major agent of change). We have also considered the educational policies which would be necessary to promote the development of such a society. In Chapter 3 a brief account is given of the moral implications of educational planning. In Chapters 4, 5, and 6 we present a critical analysis of education in South African society and the institutions which further it, and in Chapter 7 our recommendations are given. At the same time it seemed profitable to suggest policies which could be effected at different stages of the transformation of South African society (see Chapter 8).

1.6 Finally two appendices have been added. The first deals briefly with the treatment of moral education in the curriculum, and the second concerns specific aspects of the theory and practice of Christian National Education.

1.7 *The Education Commission: Notes and Acknowledgements*

The Education Commission held three full meetings, in August 1969, February 1970 and June 1970. These meetings were in Johannesburg and they occupied a week-end in each case. After the third meeting a drafting committee consisting of Mr R. Tunmer, Mr R.K. Muir, Mr F.E. Auerbach and Mr Peter Randall was appointed to compile a draft report on the basis of working papers previously considered by the commission. The drafting committee met many times between July and November 1970 before its first draft was ready for submission to the members of the Commission. After considering the large number of comments received from the members, the drafting committee circulated a revised draft during March 1971. After further revision, this draft was formally approved by the signatories listed at the end of this report.

Many people outside the immediate membership of the Commission have assisted its work, either through preparing papers or through participating in discussion. They include Miss A. Adams, Dr B. Engelbrecht, Mr Steyn Krige, Mr M. Corke, Mrs J. Raikes and Professor J.W.

Macquarrie. The Commission gratefully acknowledges the assistance of these and other people, and also wishes to record its appreciation for the papers and reports produced in the other Spro-cas Commissions. These have been of value to the members of the Education Commission in helping to clarify their thinking.

The Commission also records its appreciation to those former members who for one reason or another were unable to serve for the full life of the Commission: Dr A. Boraine, Professor I.D. MacCrone, Professor F.K. Peters, Mr G.R. Seretlo, Mr D. Thebehali.

Chapter Two

THE ACCEPTABLE SOCIETY: LONG-TERM EDUCATIONAL GOALS

2.1 The Commission recognises the need to indicate in broad terms the kind of society we consider acceptable, since this colours the recommendations we make.

2.2. Our starting point is taken from the Message to the People of South Africa:

> *'The Gospel of Jesus Christ declares that, by this work of Christ, men are being reconciled to God and to each other, and that excluding barriers of ancestry, race, nationality and culture have no rightful place in the inclusive brotherhood of Christ.... the event of Pentecost asserts and demonstrates the power of the Holy Spirit to draw men into one community of disciples in spite of differences of languages and culture and it is thus the way by which the disunity of Babel is healed'.*

2.3 In a Christian society there should be no arbitrary barriers of ancestry, race, nationality, language, culture or religion. A Christian society should work for the removal of such barriers, with the ultimate purpose of creating a community of love and of allowing for the full and unfettered development of the individual. Within a Christian community a person should be enabled to 'respond to love, to make choices, to work as a servant of his fellowmen', and no restraints should be imposed on these creative acts.

2.4 Acceptance of the principle of the freedom of the individual to develop fully implies the furtherance of a social order in which every

person will have the means of attaining such freedom. It is the duty of society to ensure that barriers to full self-realisation are progressively eliminated. Political inequality and arbitrarily imposed economic disparity are two of these barriers, and the acceptable society we ultimately envisage will provide the means for effective participation in government by all citizens, equal economic opportunity for all, and a more equitable sharing of the national product.

2.5 Experience has shown, however, that even in countries like Britain and the United States of America, which are formally committed to equality of opportunity, there are social factors which make its realization through education an ideal difficult to achieve. In these countries programmes of compensatory education are being devised to enable the socially and culturally deprived child to overcome the limitation of his environment. In South Africa the largest number of deprived children are members of the African, Coloured and Indian groups and from this point of view their education must receive special attention. Such factors as malnutrition, with its retarding effects on mental growth, and migratory labour, with its disruptive effects on family life, are directly relevant to the ideal of attaining equal educational opportunity.

2.6 The Commission is *not* advocating a uniform, grey, and faceless mass society in which all potentially enriching differences are eradicated. nor does it feel that the only alternative to dogmatic separatism is a new orthodoxy of dogmatic integration; instead, it foresees 'a dynamic equilibrium based on tolerance and respect for fruitful diversity' (UNESCO: *Towards Equality in Education).* The Commission looks forward to the day when adverse discrimination based on race is eliminated from our society.

2.7 The Commission recognises that the establishment of the kind of society sketched above requires major political and economic change in South Africa. We do not intend to examine these implications in detail, since other Spro-cas Commissions have been engaged on this task.

2.8 Education which helps to realise the potential of every individual plays an important part in creating this acceptable society. Such education serves society by making available to it each person's gifts and labours.

2.9 This implies that every individual must have the maximum freedom to be himself, consistent with the freedom of others. No man may abuse the freedom of others in order to be free himself. Education must be so arranged that the best balance is obtained between individual freedom and the welfare of society.

2.10 Freedom implies a liberal, that is, an unprejudiced and open-

minded, approach to knowledge, the essence of which is to be uncommitted in the search for truth. Commitment to belief in Jesus Christ as the Son of God and our Redeemer is the mark of a Christian, with the result that a Christian is inevitably a committed person. But the nature of this commitment should in no way prevent the believer from testing knowledge by whatever means are available, and from accommodating belief to demonstrated knowledge. A committed Christian can adopt a spirit of free enquiry in the pursuit of truth. This, rather than an authoritarian approach to knowledge and to man, is, we feel, a prime principle of education in a Christian society.

2.11 A further principle is that there should be equality of educational opportunity. This means that every person in society should have equal access to the best education which the state can provide and have available an education which is best suited to his age, ability and aptitude. This does not imply that the same education is suitable for all, nor does it imply that all people have the same capacities. But it does mean that the system of selection for education and the system of differentiation in education must be based on the criteria of ability, talent, quality and hard work of the individual, and on the needs of all the members of society. On the other hand, criteria like colour, race, or creed should be irrelevant in the public educational system (for a more detailed consideration see paragraph 4.10 et seq.).

2.12 In education the needs of the whole society should be considered, This implies that the arbitrary division of education into separate systems on racial lines alone is unacceptable. The Commission endorses the finding of the 1969 Conference on Bantu Education:

> *'Although it is recognised that the immediate social and educational needs of the different groups of the South African people may require, at different times and in different places, variations in educational control, provision and administration, in teaching techniques and in language medium, Conference affirms the thesis that education is ultimately not divisible. Conference therefore looks forward to the time when the administration of education will be on a regional basis, with responsibility for the education of all the people in an area being vested in one authority'. (Report of the 1969 Bantu Education Conference, S.A. Institute of Race Relations).*

2.13 Education is a total and continuing experience, and not merely confined to the school. Educative influences in the home and in society which are incompatible with the ideals listed above need to be opposed and eliminated by individual and group effort; those who have already left

schools, colleges and universities need to be helped by society to make up for the deficiencies of their formal education; the now generally accepted idea that education is a life-long process should be progressively realised in South Africa.

Chapter Three

MORAL EDUCATION

3.1 The religious and moral attitudes that permeate the education system are so important as a means of achieving, or of failing to achieve, an acceptable order of society, that we have felt it advisable to devote a chapter of this report to a consideration of the nature and role of moral education. The moral aspect of education is most important because it is concerned with men's attitudes and behaviour towards others and with their ability to distinguish between good and evil.

> *'The Christian Gospel requires us to assert the truth proclaimed by the first Christians, who discovered that God was creating a new community in which differences of race, language, nation, culture and tradition no longer had power to separate man from man. The most important features of man are not the details of his racial group, but the nature which he has in common with all men and also the gifts and abilities which are given to him as a unique individual by the grace of God; to insist that racial characteristics are more important than these is to reject what is most significant about our own humanity as well as the humanity of others'. (The Message)*

3.2 We recognise and accept that since the majority of South Africans are Christians, public education in this country should be permeated with a Christian spirit which should be tolerant of other religious viewpoints *(2)*.

3.3. We believe that the broad moral principles of Christianity could be acceptable to non-Christians in our society, for example, to Muslims, Jews, Hindus, agnostics, atheists and others. We are convinced that

anyone concerned with the well-being of the individual and of society, irrespective of his own religious convictions, will be willing to accept these principles, and to work for their implementation in our public life and in our educational institutions. The position of private educational institutions catering for specific religious groups is dealt with at other places in this report (see in particular Chapter 6).

3.4 According to these broad moral principles, education should stress the features common to all mankind and not emphasise the differences between groups of men, although we recognise the desirability of allowing men a free choice of association in order to achieve this aim. Thus separate racial and language groups should enjoy the right to continue as separate entities, while at the same time recognising and respecting the rights of all other groups either to do the same or to work for integration with others. Individuals should enjoy the freedom to develop their 'gifts and abilities' to the maximum, either as members of their distinct cultural groups or as persons without particular group affiliations according to their choice.

3.5 In the view of the Commission, it is of prime importance that education should foster at the same time those human attitudes which liberate people from chauvinistic group loyalties and which enable them to view other groups without prejudice, fear and hostility.

3.6 In addition, education should be used to prepare people for the possibilities and the acceptance of change, when this has been shown to be morally justified and necessary. It would not be justified, for example, to exercise the right to maintain a distinct cultural identity which has the effect of entrenching unChristian attitudes towards other groups.

3.7 In what follows we attempt to sketch the minimum requirements of a system of moral education and to indicate the broad ethical approach which we believe is acceptable to Christians of differing denominations and to non-Christians as well. Implicit in our approach is an awareness of the need to safeguard liberty of conscience (in other words, freedom of religion) and to prevent the imposition of a 'specific doctrine or dogma which is distinctive of any particular religious denomination or sect' *(3)* on the public schools in a multi-religious society. At the same time we do not wish to water down the religious content of moral education so that it becomes meaningless.

3.8 In terms of this approach, then, moral education demands more than the inculcation of a set of overt (perhaps conditioned) responses. Men should have the right intentions, reasons and motives. Moral education is concerned with the development of a person's state of mind, from which his reasons and motives - and hence his behaviour - will flow.

3.9 At the same time an authoritarian approach to moral education must be rejected. There are two reasons for this:

(i) In all societies there is a need to examine traditional values and standards critically. Such responsible critical examination of particular beliefs or sets of values is to be encouraged.

(ii) In view of South Africa's cultural pluralism the imposition of any set of values which is particularistic (i.e. relating to a particular and confined cultural setting), as opposed to commonly held values, would be impossible. While we would not oppose any group having its particularistic values and tradition (as, for example, in the case of Muslims), there would have to be an allegiance of all groups to certain universal values which transcend any specific cultural context. Such allegiance is essential in order to ensure a society in which all men will be free to develop their unique gifts and abilities.

3.10 A person who has received an appropriate moral education should be able to recognise other people as individuals with rights similar to his own. He should be aware of other people's feelings. He should have sufficient knowledge of the functioning of society, and of the way individuals behave, to be able to recognise and respect the rights of others. The ideal aim of moral education should be to develop in children, during the course of their school careers, a way of thinking which encompasses other people's interests as well as their own, and a way of acting which allows them to follow their own judgement courageously and, if necessary, independently.

3.11 Such qualities will not be found, nor can they be instilled, in all people to the same extent, but they should be developed as far as possible in each child, and children should be taught to admire them when they find them, and be encouraged to emulate them. Moral education should not be confined to a particular period on a class time-table. The more frequently that moral qualities are noticed in literature and history, in geography and civics, in science and in fine art, the greater will be the children's involvement, and the more effective such education will become *(4)*. (see Recommendation 45 and Appendix i).

3.12 An awareness of the attitudes which have been described in this chapter should be fostered among adults as well (see Recommendation 47).

Chapter Four

PRINCIPLES UNACCEPTABLE IN THE LIGHT OF THE MESSAGE

4.1 The ruling whites in South Africa have abrogated their responsibility to treat the other groups with justice. These other groups have no direct means of influencing Parliament, and in these circumstances the whites have greater responsibilities for acting fairly and justly. All too often South African governments have served the white section of the population in unashamed discrimination and selfishness (see, for example, the differentiation in per capita expenditure on education: Chapter 5, iii). The current policies and practices of apartheid and separate development cannot escape this charge.

> In the words of the Message to the People of South Africa, '*Apartheid is a view of life and a view of man which insists that we find our identity in dissociation and in distinctions from each other. A policy of separate development which is based on this concept therefore involves a rejection of the central belief of the Christian Gospel*'.

4.2 The South African educational system is based upon apartheid, and is orientated to separate development. In aims, content, language medium, organisation and the allocation of resources, education reinforces divisions between groups. In this chapter this proposition is examined, and seven principles are listed. These are either explicit or implicit in South African education policy and we consider them to be unacceptable in the light of the Message to the People of South Africa.

4.3 These seven unacceptable principles have been classified under three headings.

The first concerns *access to educational facilities:*

(i) The denial of access to any existing state educational institution on the grounds of race, religion, culture or language alone.

4.4 The second heading relates to *the allocation of resources:*

(ii) The idea that an economically disadvantaged group provide its own educational facilities largely from its own resources.

4.5 The third heading includes five unacceptable principles concerned with the *aims and content of education.*

(iii) The failure of South Africa's educational system to foster a loyalty and patriotism common to all its peoples.

(v) The use of the educational system to ensure the continuation of existing patterns of sectional loyalities and group division in the South African population, and the retardation of processes of change within these groups.

(vi) The deliberate use of the educational system to indoctrinate children with the belief that apartheid is the only acceptable policy for South Africa.

(vii) The denial of opportunity for representatives of the African, Coloured, and Indian groups to take an effective part in the major decision-making processes of educational policy and administration by which they and South African society as a whole are affected.

Access to educational facilities

4.6 State-supported educational facilities in South Africa are compulsorily segregated on a racial basis, with a few exceptions to this rule at university level. (The matter of compulsory segregation on the basis of language is more fully discussed in Chapter 5).

4.7 As a general rule primary school children and urban high school children attend school where they live. If their residential area is segregated on a racial basis, they will attend schools reflecting that residential 'neighbourhood' pattern.

4.8 In South Africa enforced racial segregation has not always applied at all educational levels. The pattern of allowing children of all races to attend schools, established in the seventeenth century, persisted to a limited extent until well into the twentieth century in some areas in the Cape. At university level the Open Universities, since their inception, accepted non-segregation on academic grounds as a principle,

until forced by law to abandon it in 1959. These Universities remain committed to the principle of admission on academic merit alone.

4.9 In any future pattern, we must distinguish between what is desirable in principle, what can be permitted 'for the time being', and how the principle is ultimately to be implemented in practice. (An attempt to make these distinctions is to be found in Chapter 8).

4.10 The Commission accepts the principle that the racial group of any student should not be the sole reason for debarring him from any state-supported educational institution. The concept of a common society, as accepted by the Commission, and the educational goals it has formulated for that society, make it essential that the policy of admission to educational institutions, while taking educational, geographic, linguistic and social factors into account, be racially colourblind.

4.11 On educational grounds, for instance, it may be desirable to deny a child admission to a school. If, for instance, he has an inadequate command of the language that is used as the medium of instruction at the school, or if he has not reached the educational level necessary for entry to the standard to which he is to be admitted, admission may be denied. When children from widely differing environments are placed together in one class, they require teachers unusually sensitive and competent, and teaching material of unusual variety and flexibility to ensure that all their needs are met.

The matter of 'social acceptability' in the school is more difficult. The likely rejection of a black child in a white school, and possibly vice-versa, must be weighed against the undesirability of allowing racial prejudice to be the dominant factor in sustaining parental and pupils' objections against fellowship with children differing in pigmentation. The Commission recognises and accepts that residential patterns largely determine the racial and socio-economic composition of schools. These patterns are unlikely to be changed in South Africa in the near future, whatever the political and social patterns of the country may be. The Commission does not consider, however, that rejection of a child on the grounds of 'social acceptability' should easily be permitted or long tolerated as an educational disqualification.

4.12 The Commission feels that in view of the factors outlined in 4.10 and 4.11 it cannot recommend enforced admission of children of different racial groups where this would clearly be adverse to them and/or to others educationally. While some separation may be inevitable in practice for years to come, the principle of unrestricted admission should be followed as far as possible. Nevertheless, the Commission foresees a time, after various steps along the road towards the common society have been

taken, when firm action to counter residual discrimination on arbitrary or irrelevant racial lines may be necessary (see paragraph 8.10).

4.13 We recognise that a private school may be founded to reflect a particular religious (e.g. Catholic), educational (e.g. progressive school) or other philosophical orientation, but its policies should not reflect unacceptable principles numbered (iii) to (vii).

4.14 No Church School, or other private school which claims to have a Christian basis, may deny admission to any child on the grounds of his racial classification alone. The question whether non-Christians may establish racially exclusive schools raises difficult ethical problems which revolve primarily around the conflict between the principle of freedom of choice and the principle of freedom of opportunity. The Commission has wrestled for a long time with this problem and recognises that there is no simple clear-cut answer. At the very least, however, a Christian state would actively discourage the establishment of racially exclusive private schools.

4.15 It is therefore suggested that, while bearing in mind 4.11 and with the one partial exception given in 4.13, all educational institutions at all levels should in principle and in the light of Christian ethics be open to members of all ethnic, cultural, linguistic and religious groups.

The allocation of resources

4.16 At present the financing of African education is to a considerable extent dependent upon taxes paid by Africans, whereas white, Coloured and Indian education is financed entirely from General Revenue. As the Africans are economically disadvantaged, their social handicap is reinforced by the policy of financing education. Furthermore, the per capita expenditure on education reveals very great discrepancies between the provision made for different races (see paragraph 5-17). We believe in principle there should be no such discrepancies, and that all finance for education should come from General Revenue (see recommendation 14).

The aims and content of education

4.17 At present the structure of the educational system not only reflects the apartheid society but implies that this is the only possible future for South Africa. Syllabuses and textbooks are all too frequently written from the viewpoint of the white man and in accordance with apartheid *(5)*. Adequate attention is not always given to alternative interpretations of South Africa's history, nor to alternative views of the country's present situation and future development. We believe that controversial issues and opposing views need to be presented to older pupils and that they should be led to realise that truth cannot always be expressed in

absolute terms. Both the aims and content of education should be directed towards the goal of a common South African society (see recommendation 36).

4.18 The aim of South African education at present is to perpetuate separate communities based upon racial divisions. For this purpose the administration of education is separate for each racial group, and this is defended by arguing that each person must be equipped to serve 'his own' group to perpetuate that group's separate culture and values. We believe that education should prepare the ground for legitimate, peaceful and effectual change so that people are educated to serve the whole society.

4.19 In the present administration of the country, major policy decisions on education are taken by the white group, although the implementation of these policies is often delegated to the groups affected by them. We propose that no groups should be excluded from policy-making (see recommendation 43).

Chapter Five

PRACTICES UNACCEPTABLE IN THE LIGHT OF THE MESSAGE

5.1 In this chapter we draw attention to a variety of practices in South African education which flow from the application of the principles just listed, and which we consider unacceptable in the light of Christian ethics. In doing so, we realise that there may be many other features considered unacceptable, and that in our list, inevitably, the largest number of undesirable practices refers to education for Africans. Believing as we do that education should allow for the development of the individual to the best of his capacity in a social environment in which he will be fully accepted as a member of the human family, we have had to concentrate most on the inequalities in educational provision imposed on African children and teachers. We do not claim that our list is exhaustive, but we trust that the practices we have highlighted will show that the South African educational system, as it operates at present, results in gross inequalities which, under present circumstances, are subject to change only when white people so decide.

5.2 For the sake of clarity, we have grouped the unacceptable practices under the same three headings as the unacceptable principles enunciated in Chapter 4, but we present them in the following order:

A. Allocation of resources

B. Access to educational facilities

C. Aims and content of education

since this order best reflects the urgency and the immediacy of the educational problems facing us.

A. ALLOCATION OF RESOURCES

(i) Tardiness in applying compulsory education

5.3 The recognition that effective education demands at least some measure of compulsory school attendance is not new. 'Before the Union of South Africa was brought about in 1910, each of the four provinces had already introduced compulsory school attendance (for whites) though there were slight differences in the age limits laid down by the different provinces' *(6)*.

5.4 In 1920 the Superintendent General of Education wrote in his annual report to the Administrator of the Cape Province, referring to education for Coloured children: 'The element of compulsion is still absent from school attendance. Its desirability is generally acknowledged but the weight of opinion is that its introduction is not practicable at present'.

No progress was, however, made in the implementation of compulsory school attendance for Coloured, Indian and African children apart from a partial exception for Coloured children in Natal (see 5.11).

5.5 In 1946, the Wilks Commission in Natal considered that eight years of compulsory education (i.e. Sub-A to Standard 6) for all Indian children was attainable in the future then foreseeable, and they recommended, as an early interim measure, that every Indian child admitted to school should be compelled to attend until he attained the age of 13 years, or passed Standard 4. As of June 1971, even this interim recommendation has not been carried out.

5.6 In 1951 the Eiselen Commission on Native Education planned for four years of compulsory education for all African children by 1959. Schooling for African children of less than four year's duration represented, in its opinion, wasteful use of resources. The Wilks Commission had expressed a similar opinion about the drop-out situation in Indian schools. The continuing waste in African schools is indicated by the drop-out figures given in sub-section (ii) below.

5.7 In 1956, the Botha Commission in the Cape recommended the enforcement of compulsory education for all Coloured children between the ages of seven and fourteen years, or up to Standard 5, within a ten-year period. As of June 1971, implementation of the recommendation seems a still distant prospect.

5.8 All these Commissions consisted of experienced, practical educationists and administrative officers who were well qualified to make realistic assessments of the needs of the communities investigated and to make financially and administratively practicable recommendations.

The repeated failure to carry out the recommendations reflects the attitude of the politically dominant group towards the education of the subordinate groups.

5.9 This attitude was brought out very clearly in Parliament in 1969 when, in reply to a private member's motion asking for compulsory education for non-white children, the Deputy Minister, Mr G.F. Froneman, stated that 'compulsory education can be extended to Africans only when they themselves ask for it, when they can finance it themselves and when their economy can absorb the increased number of educated people'. This statement assumes that the Africans have an economic system separate from that of the whites, and ignores the fact that South Africa's economy is an integrated one. This kind of thinking would postpone the introduction of compulsory education indefinitely. What is required is a vigorous policy of educational exapansion which will benefit all our people.

5.10 The 1961 Education Panel, in its second (1966) report, *Education and the South African Economy*, concluded that, to meet the needs of South Africa's expanding economy, there should be universal compulsory education for all races up to Standard 6 by 1975. It seems entirely unlikely that that goal will be reached. This failure debars South African-born men and women, because of their colour alone, from advancement to the many new skilled jobs for which white South African recruits are not available, and perpetuates the great disparity between white affluence and non-white indigence.

5.11 A very limited measure of compulsion does exist in Coloured education, which is mentioned here for the sake of completeness. In Natal, where about 3½% of the Coloured people live, education for their children was made compulsory in 1942, on the same basis as then existed for white children. Between 1947 and 1953 education was made compulsory for those Coloured children residing within three miles of a school in six school districts in the Cape, but no further districts have been added since then. Since 1968, however, Coloured children throughout South Africa have been compelled to complete the school-year in which they were enrolled at a school.

See Recommendation 1.

(ii) The high drop-out rate

5.12 The effects of the lack of compulsory school attendance partly account for the high drop-out rate which has been deplored by every Commission investigating the educational provision for any non-white group. In Table 1 the number of pupils in each successive Standard from school entry in 1965 to entry to Standard 3 in 1969 is given. The numbers

show a decrease of more than 25% from 1965 to 1966, and a decrease of more than 50% over the five years from 1965.

Table 1: ENROLMENTS IN AFRICAN SCHOOLS

	Number	Per cent
1965: Sub A:	515449	100
1966: Sub B:	382742	74.3
1967: Std 1:	346262	67.2
1968: Std 2:	275784	53.5
1969: Std 3:	234407	45.5

Source: *Bantu Education Report* 1969, Table 4

5.13 Since the inception of the Department of Bantu Education very little progress has been made in reducing the drop-out rate in education for Africans, as the following tables show:

Table 2: DROP-OUT RATES IN AFRICAN SCHOOLS

Year	Sub-A entry	1 yr. later Sub-B	3 yrs. later Std 2	4 yrs. later Std 3	7 yrs. later Std 6	8 yrs. later Form 1	10 yrs. later Form 111	12 yrs. later Form V
1955	100	71.7	57.9	44.8	25.3	8.5	4.3	0.74
1956	100	78.1	57.1	44.0	25.2	8.7	4.6	0.76
1957	100	72.7	55.3	42.9	26.3	8.7	5.1	0.79
1958	100	72.3	55.4	42.5	23.9	9.4	5.5	0.81
1959	100	74.5	55.8	43.4	25.2	9.8	6.3	
1960	100	75.1	55.5	41.5	24.2	10.7		
1961	100	74.8	53.7	43.2	26.1	10.3		
1962	100	75.8	53.5	44.1	25.7			
1963	100	74.9	54.0	44.4				
1964	100	74.4	53.5	44.8				
1965	100	74.4	53.5	45.5				
1966	100	74.1	53.4					
1967	100	75.2						
1968	100	75.8						

Calculated from: *Bantu Education Report* 1968, Table 5a
Bantu Education Journal, June 1970

Table 3: DROP-OUT RATES IN AFRICAN HIGH SCHOOLS

Year	Form 1 Entry	2 yrs. later Form 111	4 yrs. later Form V
1955	100	54.0	5.4
1956	100	61.0	5.7
1957	100	43.3	5.4
1958	100	52.6	5.3
1959	100	51.0	5.3
1960	100	50.8	5.4
1961	100	55.7	7.5
1962	100	49.1	7.4
1963	100	54.8	8.7
1964	100	52.7	8.7
1965	100	58.4	9.1
1966	100	57.4	
1967	100	63.7	

Calculated from: *Bantu Education Report,* 1968, Table 5a
Bantu Education Journal, June 1970

5.14 Some slight improvement in the proportion of the school population reaching the high school is evident over the period of the last twenty-five years. As the following table indicates, however, this improvement is a good one only in the case of Indian pupils.

Table 4: DISTRIBUTION BY STANDARDS OF THE SCHOOL POPULATION FOR THE FOUR RACIAL GROUPS: 1945-1969

	Year	Grades	Standards 1 - 5	Standards 6 - 8	Standards 9 - 10	Unclassified
Whites	1945	20.8	49.9	21.6	5.3	2.4
	1957	20.6	49.2	22.3	5.7	2.2
	1967*	19.9	46.6	22.8	8.3	
Coloureds	1945	40.2	52.3	6.9	0.6	
	1957	37.0	54.0	8.0	1.0	
	1969	35.7	53.5	9.7	1.1	
Indians	1945	44.3	50.2	5.3	0.2	
	1957	32.7	57.3	8.7	1.2	
	1969	19.2	57.8	18.7	4.3	
Africans	1945	51.4	46.3	1.9	0.1	
	1957	46.8	49.8	2.9	0.2	
	1969	42.7	53.1	3.9	0.3	

*The latest available figures for whites are for 1967.
Sources: (i) *Statistical Year Book* 1964, Tables E 22, E23, E26, E30
(ii) *Statistical Year Book* 1968, Table E17
(iii) *Survey of Race Relations* 1968, p. 230 and p. 236

5.15 The Eiselen Commission declared that 'a Bantu child who does not complete at least Standard 2 has benefitted so little that the money spent on his education is virtually lost' (an opinion echoed by the Wilks Commission in respect of Indian children). Six million African children in South Africa started school between 1955 and 1968, but 3 million of them had dropped out before Standard 3, that is, before they became literate, even in their mother tongue.

5.16 In Table 4 comparisons were made in the distribution of pupils over the school standards for the four racial groups in South Africa. It can be seen that in 1969 only 4.2% of African pupils were in high schools, a percentage which has taken 24 years to double. In contrast, Zambia had 3.5% of its school population in secondary classes in 1964, but had doubled this to 7% in 1970 *(6a)*.

See Recommendation 1

(iii) Unequal per capita expenditure

5.17 In 1968 the per capita expenditure on children in African schools was about R14.48. Expenditure per white child in the same year was R191 in the Transvaal, R244 in the O.F.S., R266 in the Cape, and R288 in Natal. Taking the number of white pupils in each province into account, this represents R228 per pupil, or fifteen times as much as for the African child. *(Hansard,* February 1970). These figures are useful as a general indication of the relative states of education in the two groups with the Coloured and Indian groups falling between these extremes. The gap in per capita expenditure must be progressively and rapidly narrowed. But equal per capita expenditure cannot be an immediate aim in educational reform. Even with a commitment to the principle of equal provision it would be very many years before per capita expenditure could be equalised. Most African children are in the lower primary school and most leave before Standard 3. White children, with compulsory education to the age of 16, are spread fairly evenly over primary and secondary classes. Lower primary education for all groups is relatively cheap; secondary education is relatively expensive. Only when the distribution of African children over primary and secondary levels approximates to that of the whites can per capita expenditure be expected to rise towards the same level.

See Recommendations 14 and 15.

5.18 Furthermore, teachers are usually remunerated according to their qualifications. In the case of white teachers salary scales improve according to the number of years of study after matriculation that the teacher has undertaken. The minimum course of training is three years

but more and more white teachers are following four-year courses. Most African teachers now in service, however, started their professional training after completing Standard 6 or Standard 8. This training lasted for only two years. In 1968, 19.4% of all African teachers lacked professional qualifications *(7)*. It is no longer possible to commence training with a Standard 6 certificate, but older teachers with such meagre academic qualifications will remain in service for many years. Teachers now qualifying with a Standard 8 academic qualification will still be in service for fifteen years beyond the turn of the century. It can therefore be seen that it will be many years before the qualifications of white and African teacher will be approximately equal. It also follows that, even on the basis of equal pay for equal qualifications, the average remuneration of African teachers will for a very long time be lower than that of white teachers. This too will delay the development towards more equal per capita expenditure.

5.19 It is clearly necessary to raise the standard of entry to professional training for African teachers as soon as possible. At the same time, teachers in service who have low qualifications should be urged and assisted to improve their academic and professional qualifications. In this connection, the efforts currently being made by the Department of Bantu Education to provide in-service training for African teachers are noted with appreciation.

See Recommendations 22 and 23.

(iv) Unequal pupil-teacher ratios

5.20 An unacceptable practice which is a further delaying factor in the equalisation of per capita expenditure is the high pupil-teacher ratio in African schools of 60:1, in contrast to the ratio of 21:1 in white schools (Hansard, 1970, Col 1196/8). The Eiselen Commission proposed in 1951 that the pupil-teacher ratio in African schools should be maintained as it was in 1949, i.e. at 42:1. It was calculated that there should be 33,000 teachers in the service in 1959 for the 1,391,000 pupils expected in that year. Although the projected number of pupils for 1959 proved to be accurate (1,404,000), the number of teachers was only 26,110. The Eiselen Commission recommended that teacher training facilities would have to be more than doubled, with 7,200 teacher-trainees in 1951, 8,600 in 1953, 10,400 in 1955, 12,500 in 1957 and 15,000 in 1959. These goals were not realised. It can be seen in Table 5 that pupils increased by 137%, the number of teachers by 87%, and the number of teachers- in-training by 6.5%.

Table 5: INCREASE IN PUPILS, TEACHERS AND TEACHERS-IN-TRAINING: BANTU EDUCATION 1955-1968

Year	Pupils	Teachers	Teachers-in-Training
1955	1008011	21974	5899
1959	1403769	26110	5656
1962	1680584	28849	3842
1965	1953288	34810	4548
1968	2390871	41011	6281
%increase 1955 - 1968	137%	87%	6.5%

Source: *Bantu Education Report* 1968, Tables 2 and 5a

5.21 The shortfall in the number of teachers being trained forces the authorities to continue to use double sessions. It partially explains the increase in the number of unqualified teachers who made up 19.9% of the teaching force in 1960. Although the percentage had dropped to 7.2% in 1961, it had risen again to 19.4% in 1968 (excluding the Transkei). This means that in 1968, 6500 teachers with neither matriculation nor any professional training were employed. These teachers received a fixed salary of R34 (for men) or R27 per month (for women).

5.22 A crash programme of teacher training is urgently necessary, even if only to restore the unsatisfactory 42:1 pupil-teacher ratio found by the Eiselen Commission. We realise that such a programme will only be possible with considerable expansion of secondary education for Africans (see paragraph 5.9), and will have to be coupled with a substantial increase in salaries to make the profession more attractive. See Recommendations 17, 22 and 23.

(v) Use of double sessions

5.23 The term 'double session' refers to the system in African schools in which one teacher is responsible for two successive groups each of about 50 children, whose school day is shortened from 4½ to 3 hours. This system applies to over 80% of African children in their first two years at school (classes Sub-A and Sub-B). African children are handicapped already by their deprived home circumstances, and by the fact that they are admitted to school at a later age than other children. Needing more from the school than other children, they are given less.

5.24 The system of double sessions in African schools should be phased out as quickly as the necessary additional teachers can be trained.

5.25 Shortages of accommodation have led to the use of the 'platoon system' in Indian and Coloured schools. In this system the same classroom is used for two successive groups of children, who are taught by different teachers. This system is being progressively abandoned in Indian schools, but is increasing in Coloured schools.

Table 6: USE OF PLATOON SYSTEM IN INDIAN AND COLOURED SCHOOLS

Year		No. of Schools	No. of teachers	No. of Pupils
1966	Indian	113	865	28,513
	Coloured	80	363	13,431
1969	Indian	80	541	13,047
	Coloured	312	922	30,531 *

Sources: (i) *Survey of Race Relations* 1967, pp. 251, 257
(ii) *Survey of Race Relations* 1970, pp. 221, 227
*This figure had risen to 41,350 in 1970

See Recommendation 18.

(vi) The need to employ privately-paid teachers in African schools

5.26 The inadequate provision of state-paid teachers in African schools has led to the employment of supplementary teachers paid by funds collected from parents. Without the employment of such privately-paid teachers the pupil-teacher ratio would be considerably higher than it is at present. Many of the unqualified teachers mentioned in paragraph 5.21 are found amongst these teachers.

The percentage of privately-paid African teachers increased from 6.4% in 1961 to 17.2% in 1968 (church schools excluded).

See Recommendation 16.

(vii) Inequalities in the provision of text-books and library books

5.27 It is unacceptable that the parents of the poorest group of children, the Africans, should have to pay for most of their text-books while these are supplied free to children of the wealthier groups.

5.28 The recent decision that all Coloured and Indian pupils throughout the country are to receive free text-books is to be warmly welcomed, as is the supply of certain text-books to African secondary school pupils. The limited provision of text books in African primary schools is shown

by the expenditure of R356,000 for this purpose in 1967. This works out to just under 20 cents per pupil, compared with an average allocation of R3.40 per pupil in Transvaal white primary schools. The per capita expenditure on school books by the State has recently been calculated to be: whites R6.3, Coloureds R2.4, Indians R2.6, Africans 46 cents (Hansard 8, September 1970, col. 3659).

5.29 Although there was an increase in the expenditure on library books in African education during 1966 and 1967, the amount of R85,000 in the latter year for 1.9 million African pupils compares ill with some R800,000 spent by the Transvaal Education Department on library services for its 350,000 white pupils.

See Recommendation 30.

(viii) Inadequate adult education, particularly in literacy

5.30 In view of the high drop-out figures in African primary schools (see paragraph 5.12 et seq.), the incidence of illiteracy is probably very much higher than is sometimes officially stated *(8)*. It has been calculated that the functional literacy rate in 1967 for Africans aged 13-22 was 57.5% *(9)*. The overall figure for the entire African population is, of course, much lower; the 1960 census found that 62% of the economically active African population had had no schooling at all. A substantial percentage of the remainder would not have had enough schooling to become literate, while only 3 out of every 1,000 economically active Africans had completed a secondary education (a total of about 13,000 persons out of a total African population of eleven million *(10)*.

5.31 Illiteracy is a severe handicap to work-seekers and a bar to practically all advancement in commercial and industrial employment. It is also a disability to migratory workers and their families as it prevents communication by letter. The closing of night schools which served both industrial workers and local domestic servants in white areas was a deplorable and backward step. A vigorous adult literacy campaign would enrich the lives of those involved and also increase the productivity of the labour force. It has been calculated that a worker with four years of schooling is 43% more productive than an illiterate one *(11)*.

See Recommendations 32 and 33.

(ix) The salaries and conditions of service of non-white teachers

(a) Salaries

5.32 Teachers' salary scales are based on the length of their academic and professional training. The salary scales of whites at every level of training are, however, higher than those of Coloureds and Indians with

equal training, and these in turn are higher than those of Africans. This differentiation on grounds of race classification alone is unacceptable. It is also unsatisfactory that when salaries of white teachers are increased the salaries of non-white teachers are improved only after considerable delay.

5.33 The disparity in salary structure is an inheritance from the days when the differences between cultural groups in South Africa were much more marked than they are today. All these groups are, however, becoming more and more urbanised, all are absorbed in the common South African economy, and all have to pay prevailing market prices. Salary differentials based on race are therefore less and less excusable. Table 7 illustrates the present extent of the differential.

Table 7: SALARY SCALES BY RACE FOR TEACHERS OF COMPARABLE QUALIFICATION (MATRIC. PLUS 4 YEARS TRAINING)

	Men	Women
African	R1260 - 2610	R1140 - 2160
Indian) Coloured)	R2010 - 3480	R1740 - 3000
White	R3360 - 5100	R3000 - 4440

Sources: *Bantu Education Journal,* Nov. 1970 (one notch has been added in Table 7, to reflect a recent increase).
Education Bulletin, Administration of Coloured Affairs No. 28, 1970 (one notch has been added in Table 7).
Transvaal Education Department Circular 2/71.

The discrimination in salaries occurs throughout all levels of the education system. For example, the salaries offered for the post of head of a division in an Indian technical college are R6000 - R6600, for a white, and R4080 - R4560, for an Indian *(12).*

See Recommendation 26.

(b) Conditions of Service

5.34 Conditions of service of teachers of the different population groups now differ invidiously for no apparent professional reason. For example, African teachers outside the African homelands which have their own education department are employed by and subject to dismissal by local School Boards, though their salaries are paid by the State, whereas teachers of other groups are employed by the State. Leave conditions and civic rights of teachers vary widely in the different population groups.

See Recommendation 25

(x) The refusal to grant aid to African church schools

5.35 In 1954 the churches were given the option of transferring their African schools to the Bantu Education Department or of eventually losing their state grants. The schools so affected were amongst the most efficient of all schools for African children. The Anglican Church withdrew from African education, closing its schools, the Methodists handed their schools over, and the Roman Catholic Church maintained those of its schools which it could in the face of increased financial difficulties.

5.36 The refusal of the state to subsidize church schools for Africans is invidious on both educational and religious grounds. Church schools for Coloureds and whites have not been affected in this way.

See Recommendation 48.

(xi) Provision of school buildings by levies on African parents

5.37 It is unacceptable that African parents should have to help bear the costs of school buildings while this expense is provided from General Revenue in the case of the other population groups. The financing of the erection of primary and lower secondary schools in urban areas is now the responsibility of urban local authorities who are expected to impose a levy on all African heads of families to help meet the costs involved *(13)*.

See Recommendation 14.

5.38 Finally, it should be noted that education has declined in relative importance in terms of government spending in South Africa. Expressed as a percentage of total spending by both central and provincial governments, ordinary expenditure on education deteriorated from 25.78% in 1930 to 17.47% in 1967. In contrast, expenditure on 'security and public order' rose from 12.5% in 1960 to 20.7% in 1967.

Table 8: EXPENDITURE ON EDUCATION AS A PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURE

Year	(a) Government Expenditure on Education R ('00's)	(b) Total Government Expenditure R ('00's)	(a) as percentage of (b)
1930	18316	71044	25.78
1940	24008	106658	22.51
1950	67226	337308	19.93
1960	145467	711350	20.45
1967	260054	1488221	17.47

Sources: *Statistical Yearbook* 1968: Tables T6, T14, 1964: Tables E28, R5, R11.

While the percentage of the national income spent on education cannot be calculated with the same realiability it is significant that the figure has increased considerably in many countries during the past two decades, while it has remained static in South Africa.

Table 9: PERCENTAGE OF NATIONAL INCOME SPENT ON EDUCATION

Country				
Australia	1956:	2.8	1966:	4.4
Canada	1961:	6.1	1966:	9.6
Kenya	1954:	2.5	1965:	5.6
Netherlands	1955:	4.6	1965:	7.6
South Africa	1953:	4.0	1961:	4.0*
United Kingdom	1961:	5.3	1966:	6.8
United States	1955:	4.0	1966:	6.4
Zambia	1960:	2.6	1966:	7.8

Source: *UNESCO Statistical Yearbook 1968*, Table 2.18

*The Human Sciences Research Council estimates the figure for South Africa for 1961 to have been 3.48 per cent. It also estimates the expenditure on education as a percentage of South Africa's gross national product in 1970-71 to be 3.5, with a projection of 3.7 for 1990-91 (HSRC Newsletter, February, 1971).

B. ACCESS TO EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES

(xii) Inadequate development of secondary education, particularly for urban Africans

5.39 Table 10 reveals the very slow growth of the proportion of African pupils in secondary classes since the creation of the Department of Bantu Education. With the rapid growth of the economy, and of the involvement of Africans in it, over the last fifteen years, expansion of secondary education for Africans should have been given great priority. This need has been comonly recognised in other African countries undergoing rapid development. In South Africa there is a serious back-log to be overcome and a crippling shortage of African recruits for teaching and other professions, as well as for technical and clerical work.

Table 10: PROPORTION OF AFRICAN SCHOOL ENROLMENT IN SECONDARY CLASSES

Year	%
1955:	3.5
1960:	3.2
1965:	3.4
1969:	4.2

Sources: Horrell: *Bantu Education to 1968*, p. 53
Horrell: *Survey of Race Relations 1970*, p. 211

5.40 In contrast to this slow development, in the fifteen years from 1935 to 1950 the proportion of secondary enrolment to the total school-going African population increased six-fold, from 0.5% to 3.1%. If this rate of growth had been maintained, the proportion of African secondary enrolment would now be about 7%.

5.41 Secondary education is vital for economic and social development, and thus, whatever political solution is envisaged for South Africa, a great and sustained effort to increase the provision of secondary education for Africans is urgently required.

5.42 The percentage of children of other groups in secondary classes is: Coloured 11.14; Indian 23.89; White 32.53 *(14)*. There is thus obviously a need for expansion in secondary education in respect of all the non-white groups in the country.

See Recommendations 2, 5 and 9.

(xiii) Inadequate educational provision for African children in 'white' rural areas

5.43 African children in white farming areas are dependent upon 'farm schools' for their primary education. There were, in 1968, 253,500 African children in farm schools and the great majority (88.1%) were in lower primary classes. Most of the remainding 12% were in higher primary classes. The only way in which these children can obtain secondary education is to attend a secondary school in an African homeland *(15)*.

5.44 The education of a widely scattered rural population requires hostel accommodation and boarding subsidies for poor children. Boarding fees are beyond the means of most African rural families and many African rural children are thus deprived of education beyond the lower primary level (up to Standard 2).

See Recommendations 6 and 9.

(xiv) The power of white farmers in preventing rural schools being established

5.45 A farm school may only be registered if there are 12 or more children. In some cases children from neighbouring farms must be found to make up this number. These children must obtain the written consent of the farmer on whose land they live, and also of the owner of the land on which the school is situated. A land-owner may at any time withdraw his consent, thus jeopardising the future education of the children. In addition, landowners may refuse school sites on their farms. In 1961 the Secretary for Bantu Education stated that only 25 per cent of African children between 7 and 16 who were living on white-owned farms were actually attending school *(16)*. In 1967, 151 new farm schools were opened, while 52 were closed.

See Recommendations 5 and 6.

(xv) The siting of African universities and teacher-training colleges

5.46 The African universities are sited in remote rural areas. This applies to the new universities of the North (18 miles east of Pietersburg) and Zululand (at Ngoye), as well as to the long-established University of Fort Hare at Alice. In contrast, the universities for Coloureds and Indians and the new universities for whites have been established in major centres of population.

5.47 Since African students may be admitted to 'white' universities only in exceptional circumstances and with ministerial permission, the great majority of full-time African students have perforce to attend the African universities (2011 out of a total of 2181 in 1970).

5.48 It has become clear that the Africans, like other South Africans, must prepare for a future of urbanisation and industrialisation. Like the whites, the Coloureds and the Indians, they should have access to urban universities. Their remote siting makes the African universities inaccessible to potential day students who could not afford boarding fees, and also to part-time students like articled clerks, teachers anxious to improve their qualifications, and various clerical, administrative and commerical workers. An urban setting provides advantages to a university and its students. With accelerating African development, the inaccessibility of African universities must become more and more frustrating.

See Recommendations 3, 4 and 11.

5.49 Much of what has been said above about the siting of universities applies also to training colleges. A very substantial part of teacher-

training - whether in teachers colleges or in university education departments - should be city-based, since only in cities are there enough schools within reach to provide large numbers of students with adequate practical teaching experience. In the past there were a number of African teacher-training institutions in the 'white' urban areas, run by the churches. The majority of these have now been transferred to the African homelands. Reference has already been made to the serious shortfall in the number of African teachers being trained *(17)* and to the low qualifications of the majority of African teachers (see paragraph 5.18 et. seq.).

See Recommendation 4.

(xvi) The inadequacy of vocational and technical teaching

5.50 Non-whites make up 75 per cent of all workers in South Africa's economy, but their educational preparation is grossly inadequate. Vocational education for non-whites should be vastly expanded to enable them to contribute more effectively to the work of the Republic and to share more equitably in the product of their labour.

See Recommendations 28 and 29.

5.51 Vocational training for Africans has shown little progress in two decades. The Eiselen Commission, reporting before the great industrial expansion of the 1950's and the '60's, recommended that the number of places in industrial training schools be stepped up from 2170 in 1949 to 6000 in 1959. By 1970 not even half of the figure had been achieved, and some of the courses had been downgraded from three years to two years in duration. As vocational preparation for life in South Africa's integrated industrial economy, the provision is inadequate; as preparation for 'separate development' for 15 million people it makes virtually no contribution to the need.

5.52 The latest report of the Department of Coloured Affairs (R.P. 22/1969) gives the number of apprentices attending classes in vocational schools or continuation classes as 2383, with 130 boys attending secondary commercial or technical courses and 651 girls taking domestic science and housecraft courses at state-aided church vocational schools, and much smaller numbers in courses for seamen, hotel workers and farm workers.

This means that a very much greater proportion of the Coloured than the African school population is being given some form of technical training. Similarly, Indian children have greater opportunities for obtaining technical or vocational training than have Africans. Private initiative started this training for Indians both at school and post-school levels in Durban and other parts of Natal. State assistance for this training

has been growing, particularly over the past ten years. Legislation during the 1960's provided for technical and commerical education in Coloured and Indian secondary schools. The Commission welcomes this step and looks forward to its rapid implementation.

(xvii) (a) The inadequate secondary school provision for Coloureds and Indians in rural areas, particularly the lack of boarding schools and hostels

5.53 The education of African children in rural areas has been dealt with under sub-section (xiii). Provision for Coloureds is reasonably adequate in Natal, where compulsory education for them has been in force since 1942 (see paragraph 5.11).

5.54 The distribution of pupils in Standards 6 to 10 in Coloured secondary and high schools over the whole country in 1967 and 1970 was as follows:

Table 11:

	Std. 6	Std. 7	Std. 8	Std. 9	Std. 10
1967	17,675	10,420	6,354	2,439	1,496
1970	26,276	15,418	9,851	3,900	1,975

One reason for the heavy secondary wastage indicated by these figures is the inadequacy of secondary education provision in the rural areas. Similarly, Indian pupils in rural communities, particularly in the Transvaal, have difficulties in obtaining secondary education without being sent to distant towns.

See Recommendations 2 and 29.

(xvii) (b) The influx control problem facing African children studying at rural boarding schools

5.55 African children entitled to reside with their parents in African townships adjoining white cities are officially encouraged to attend secondary schools in the homelands. Many such children have been refused permission to return to their families in the townships after completing their studies because regulations may have been misunderstood and not complied with, or because documents of identification have been lost *(18)*.

See Recommendation 5.

C. AIMS AND CONTENT OF EDUCATION

(xviii) The language burdens placed particularly on African children

5.56 African children begin the study of their home language and also of the two official languages of the Republic in their first year at school. In the secondary school some non-examination subjects have to be studied through the medium of the African home language. Half of the other subjects must normally be studied through the medium of English and half through the medium of Afrikaans.

5.57 This would seem to be a linguistic burden unique in the history of education. The Transkeian (Cingo) Commission (1963) condemned it as contrary to 'sound educational principles'. They recommended *inter alia* that the learning of the second additional language be postponed until the third school year and that only one official language should be used as supplementary medium in secondary classes. Both proposals were rejected by the South African Government as 'inconsistent with the principle of equal treatment for both official languages'.

5.58 Before the introduction of the system of Bantu Education, the official language to be used as medium of instruction in the secondary school was gradually introduced as the medium in Standards 3 to 6. Following the recommendations of the Cingo Commission, this practice was re-introduced by the Transkei Government in 1969. The late introduction of the official languages as media of instruction has resulted in a deterioration in African pupils' proficiency in those languages. Since the Joint Matriculation Board allowed African candidates to offer both official languages on the Lower Grade, the percentage offering English on the higher grade has dropped from 96% in 1962 to 18% in 1969. (Calculated from 1969 Bantu Education Report, Table 3F). While this lower standard of English improves candidates' chances of passing Standard 10 examinations (1967 pass rates: English A - JMB 10.1%, NSC 35.8%; English B - JMB 82.9%, NSC 98.3%), it must handicap all those who intend studying at a university or college where the medium of instruction is mainly English.

5.59 It is agreed that as long as South Africa forms one national polity both official languages of the Republic should be taught, in the framework of a curriculum constructed on sound educational principles, in all South African schools. What the position of the two languages should be in the schools of the African 'nations' which are to have 'separate freedom' would appear to be a matter of decision by those 'nations' alone. It appears, however, from experience in the Transkei, that the South African government is unwilling to adhere to this principle (see paragraph 5.57).

5.60 A detailed discussion, and a survey of available international evidence on the question of mother-tongue instruction, was presented as a working paper to the Education Commission. The Commission acknowledges its indebtedness to Professor L.W. Lanham in this regard. It is only just that children who understand only one language must be taught in that language, at least until they have made extensive progress in another. It is apparent that current research, academic debate and empirical evidence have not, as yet, resolved the issue of mother tongue as opposed to world language as medium for teaching general subjects from the higher primary school upwards. There is, however, no support in the literature for the simultaneous introduction of two foreign languages for African pupils as subjects in the first year of the lower primary school and, in particular, the sudden change to the use of both as media of instruction in the secondary school.

See Recommendations 20 and 21.

(xix) The growing tendency towards centralisation of control and administration

5.61 Until 1954, provincial education departments were responsible for the primary and secondary education of South African children of all ethnic groups. In the Cape Province, the same inspectors supervised all schools. In other provinces, one group of inspectors supervised white, Indian and Coloured schools, and separate inspectors, chosen for their knowledge of the local African language, supervised African schools. Where there was a common inspectorate there were common syllabuses, common examinations and examination standards, and persistent endeavours to raise the level of achievement of the more backward groups to that of the more advanced.

5.62 Starting in 1954, in pursuance of the policy of separate development, control of education for each non-white race group has gradually been transferred to separate central government departments, each concerned with only one group: the Department of Bantu Education, the Department of Indian Affairs and the Department of Coloured Affairs. There is an emphasis, which is most apparent in Bantu Education, on separate development and on preparation for each group's ascribed place in an apartheid system. Centralisation has been part of the whole machinery of apartheid.

5.63 *The Commission believes that if pupils are kept too long in cultural isolation they become group-centred, distrustful of other groups and not sufficiently concerned with the total South African society.* The Commission also finds it regrettable that education for different racial

groups should have completely separate administrative systems. In years to come the educational needs and problems of Whites, Africans, Coloureds and Indians in a particular region are likely to have more in common than, say, the educational needs of Whites in a small agricultural town and a large metropolitan area, or those of Indians in a small Transvaal town and of Indians in Durban. The control of education should be decentralised so that the education of all children in a region is controlled by one authority. This regional authority should have sufficient autonomy so that its educational practice need not be identical with that of another region with different educational problems.

See Recommendations 19, 41 and 42.

(xx) The lack of pre-school education, particularly for Africans

5.64 While pre-school education is desirable, especially for all culturally deprived children, it could not be regarded as a priority for the immediate future in view of the limited number of teachers who would be available. On the other hand this kind of provision could be initiated by private individuals and organisations. Pilot schemes for nursery schools would have great value.

5.65 It is universally recognised that even where educational facilities are of comparable quality, children from culturally deprived homes or communities need extra help in order to overcome these handicaps to educational progress (compare, for example, Operation Headstart in the U.S.A. *(19)* and the relevant recommendations in the Plowden report in Great Britain).

5.66 Such help is even more urgently needed in South Africa where the formal educational facilities provided for children of the various population groups, as shown earlier in this chapter, are definitely unequal. It is regrettable that the government has placed limitations on the activities of those whites who wish to organise, for example, creches and nursery schools, which could help to overcome this problem.

See Recommendation 34.

(xxi) Inadequate provision for correspondence tuition

5.67 Correspondence education can play a more significant part in South African education than it does at present. Where there is a highly developed educational system, correspondence tuition plays a relatively subordinate role. In developing countries, however, such tuition forms an integral part of the whole educational system, particularly from Standard 8. Many adults in developing countries obtain their education only through correspondence, particularly when pupils must leave school at an early

age, even though facilities for further education may be available, in order to earn an income. In such cases, they can improve their educational qualifications only through correspondence study.

5.68 The situation outlined above is applicable to the non-white sector of the South African population with a further additional factor, the need to educate and train teachers. For the reasons indicated, in the vast majority of cases this is only possible through correspondence tuition. Correspondence education in South Africa should, therefore, be utilized to develop a 'third arm' in the educational system on a par with state schools and institutions of higher learning. Moreover, it is possible to view correspondence tuition in South Africa as a viable system, bridging the gap between the standard at which scholars are compelled, for economic reasons, to leave school and the higher education provided by the University of South Africa.

See Recommendation 31.

Chapter Six

THE POSITION OF CHURCH AND OTHER PRIVATE SCHOOLS

6.1 Any discussion of church and other private schools in South Africa must be seen in relation to two factors:

(i) There is enormous diversity within this group of schools. Some with high fees cater for wealthy whites; some of these are church schools and others are not. Others, such as the large number of Roman Catholic schools, keep their fees as low as possible with the aim of attracting the children of all Catholic families into them. There are others again which serve the African, Coloured and Indian populations. Even within the schools for one religious denomination or one racial group there are great differences of ethos. Church and other private schools, as is the case with State schools, reflect much of the general social climate of the country. Pupils, staff, governing bodies, and parents will be likely to reflect the full range of attitudes which can be found amongst other South Africans. With this diversity, any generalization about church and other private schools must be made with care.

(ii) As a result of Government policy, many of the restrictions placed on State schools are equally applicable to church and other private schools. For example, the admission of pupils to these schools is not free from control. Although different regulations apply in the different provinces, the general pattern is one of restricting a school to a single race group. Exceptions to this pattern require permission which is usually difficult to obtain. Another example of control imposed by the State is that African Catholic schools may admit Catholic children only. The 'independence' of the church and other private schools is therefore to some extent spurious.

Justification for Private Schools

6.2 Parents choose to send their children to private schools for many reasons.

Some white parents are anxious that their children should learn in a school which is committed to a particular religious denomination. Others send their children to private schools to follow a family tradition. Others do not want their children to be taught through syllabuses which they believe reflect Christian National Education philosophy or by teachers who are adherents of such a philosophy. These parents may desire a more liberal education for their children. Some look for better teaching or smaller classes, while others are more concerned with the 'useful' contacts their children will make. Yet others hope that their children will imitate acceptable accents or receive good games coaching.

6.3 In mission schools for the other racial groups high fees are not normally charged. Many of the same reasons for choosing church schools, however, also apply to parents in these groups.

6.4 No evaluation of private schools can be made without recognising that where high fees are charged entry is limited to children of wealthy parents, and that there is a very real danger that these schools will perpetuate class and racial divisions within our society. The Commission is aware of the implicit inequalities of a private school system and that some of the reasons behind parental choices do not provide sufficient justification for private education. On the other hand, the Commission can see a place for private schools as part of the acceptable order of society.

6.5 The Commission feels that private schools can be justified only if:

(i) parents wish their children to have a religious upbringing and to receive denominational instruction which would not be given in schools which are entirely dependent upon State funds. This would be the main justification for church schools;

(ii) the school can act as a model of good educational practice. For example, a private school should be one in which educational experiment is encouraged in syllabuses, subject matter and techniques of teaching. Such demands can also be made on State schools and have been made in other parts of this report. Because of their relative independence, however, the private schools are likely to be freer to experiment.

6.6 The continued existence of private schools in South Africa can also be seen in another light. Before an acceptable order of society is achieved, white private schools have a special responsibility to redirect

the attitudes of their pupils. This can be done through the selection of staff, the selection of content, and an emphasis on service to others.

6.7 In the Commission's view these are the only justifications for the continued existence of the private schools. These schools must all meet the demands made previously that they do not uphold the unacceptable principles numbered (iii) to (vii) listed by the Commission (see Chapter 4).

6.8 The Commission recognises that some teachers in private schools are aware of the demands implicit in a private school system and of the special responsibilities placed upon them in South Africa. Too often, however, because of the lack of contact between schools, good work done by individual teachers cannot be emulated or receive support. Lack of communication between schools of different denominations and schools for different races makes the formulation of positive and effective policies common to them all quite impossible. There is communication between a group of white Protestant-oriented schools and others without a specific religious connection within the Headmasters' and Headmistresses' Conference. Likewise the Catholic schools are all represented on the Roman Catholic Education Council, and the South African Jewish Board of Education has under its aegis a dozen or more schools. But there is no effective communication between these three bodies. Other schools exist in complete isolation from each other (see Recommendation 49). This diversity in principle and practice can be an advantage. The Commission would not want to see uniformity imposed upon private schools. However, in our task of investigating the private schools, the lack of readily available information made it very difficult to produce concrete examples of both acceptable and unacceptable practices in these schools. Our comments on unacceptable practices are therefore couched in vague terms. The Commission would like, however, to indicate that it feels strongly that private schools need to examine their policies in a much more critical frame of mind if they are to make a better contribution to South Africa's needs.

Unacceptable Practices in Private Schools

6.9 As has been stated, private schools for whites can reflect reactionary or prejudiced attitudes on the part of members of staff, boards of governors, parents and ex-pupils. Many of these people are able to oppose any form of change and exert pressure for the 'school tradition' to be continued unbroken. Any form of re-direction of attitudes might be bitterly opposed. For example, even if pupils from other racial groups could legally be admitted to these schools, there can be no confidence that their admission would not in many cases be resisted. There is at

least one known instance of this having happened. It must be remembered in this context that in the past, and in some cases as late as the 1920's, some of the oldest and best-known church schools admitted children of all races, while white children attended mission schools until after the end of the nineteenth century *(20)*.

6.10 Nevertheless, the Commission recognises that at the present time there is a fear of introducing integration to the schools. This fear was summed up by one headmaster as follows: 'I am fairly convinced that if we tried to integrate our schools now, we would provide the government with the excuse, that many of its supporters seek, to destroy us completely'. Such fears are expressed more indirectly, as, for example, in the statement by another headmaster: 'I do not believe that a positive attempt by the church schools to acquire African pupils at this stage would benefit either the schools or the African pupils'. This kind of argument reveals a fear of integration because of educational, social or political consequences. Further, the use of an expression like 'at this stage' avoids the necessity of contemplating when change should begin and the argument may cloak a much more basic although possibly unconscious unwillingness to allow of any change in racial attitudes. Private schools can too easily cloak a reluctance to change in a variety of excuses for not changing.

6.11 In their fear that they will lose the support of parents or of ex-pupils, or of benefactors, private schools may pander to the prejudices of these people. Because many of them operate on small financial margins, they are vulnerable to such pressure. A chairman of a board of governors of one school said: 'If only 20 per cent of the parents... withdrew their sons because we had integrated the school, we would have to close down'. These fears can be extended to stifle any moves to re-direct pupils' attitudes. Some schools are reluctant, for example, to introduce even educated and informed members of other racial groups as speakers or preachers. In a specific case brought to the attention of the Commission, a traditional practice in a school linked to a Church was broken when the holder of the highest office in that Church was not invited to conduct confirmation at that school. The breaking of the tradition coincided with the appointment, for the first time, of an African to this office.

6.12 The private school system also mirrors the unacceptable practice in the State system of differentiating between racial groups on financial grounds. The financial resources available to church schools for African, Coloured or Indian pupils are far more limited than those available to church schools for white pupils.

6.13 In general, church schools employing African, Coloured and

Indian teachers pay them on State salary scales, or on even lower scales where financial resources are inadequate. Since these salary scales discriminate between teachers of equal qualifications on racial grounds (see Unacceptable Practice No. (ix) in Chapter 5), church schools in this as in other matters previously mentioned follow the prevailing social and economic practices of the apartheid society.

Chapter Seven

RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 In previous chapters of this report an acceptable order of society in conformity with the implications of the Message, and principles and practices which contradicted it, were outlined. In this section the Commission presents its recommendations which arise from a consideration of the four preceding chapters of this report. The Commission has made clear that it regards the organisation and provision of education in the present apartheid society as unacceptable. Nevertheless, it is from this position that changes will have to be effected, and for this reason many of the recommendations have had to be framed with the present position in mind. In Chapter 8 we shall indicate three possible patterns of future action, and shall list those recommendations which are appropriate to to each pattern.

7.2 In presenting these recommendations we make reference to the principles and practices from which they arose. Where they have particular relevance to church and other private schools, this has been indicated. We have also classified our recommendations according to the two broad principles which were elaborated in Chapter 2 on the acceptable society. The first of these is equal educational opportunity; and the second is a liberal approach to knowledge. At the same time, our recommendations can be considered in four other ways:

(a) whether their implementation depends upon State or private initiative;

(b) whether they require State or private finance, but do not involve heavy manpower demands to implement;

(c) whether in conjunction with increased expenditure, greater manpower is implied and so would require both careful planning and a longer time to implement;

(d) whether their implementation involves neither increased financial nor manpower provision.

7.3 We are anxious to show that considerable action can be undertaken by private individuals or organisations before a basic change in governmental policy occurs, which is the reason for our inclusion of category (a). We believe that finding extra financial support for education will be easier than finding extra manpower. This is why we distinguish between recommendations falling into categories (b) and (c). Finally, we have assumed that action of the type of category (d) will be the easiest of all to implement once it has been accepted as State policy.

I. EQUAL EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY

7.4 The recommendations which have been made under this heading can be further subdivided into four groups. The first of these concerns access to education. Then follows a series of recommendations which should improve the quality of education. The third group consists of recommendations on improvements in teacher quality and the fourth improvements in educational facilities.

A. ACCESS TO EDUCATION

1. That within one year of the acceptance of this recommendation, the parents of an African, Coloured or Indian child who has attained the age of seven years *(21)* and is resident within three miles of the nearest school shall send such a child regularly to school for the periods set out in paragraphs (a) and (b) below, and shall be liable to prosecution for any failure to comply with such law.

(a) Any child enrolled in any year in any class shall continue to attend school regularly until the end of that school year, unless granted exemption by an inspector of schools.

(b) Any child enrolled in Sub-A in the first year of implementation of this recommendation shall attend school until the completion of Sub-B; in the second year of implementation shall attend school until completion of Standard 1; in the third year of implementation shall attend school until the completion of Standard 2; in the fourth year of implementation shall attend school until completion of Standard 3; in the fifth year of implementation shall attend school until completion of Standard 4.

(See Unacceptable Practice (i), paragraph 5.3 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving both finance and manpower)
(Applicable also to church mission schools)

2. That greater attention and resources be devoted to expanding secondary education for African, Coloured and Indian children.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xii) and (xvii), paragraph 5.39 et seq. and paragraph 5.53f)
(State initiative, involving both finance and manpower demands)

3. That extension classes at the tertiary education level (e.g. technical, vocational and University classes) be made available to Indian, Coloured and African students in those urban areas where such facilities are not available.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xv), (xvi), paragraph 5.46 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

4. That facilities for teacher training be considerably extended and that due regard be had to the steadily increasing urbanisation of our population and to the desirability of basing such teacher training whether in universities or training colleges, in the cities, where necessary.

(See Unacceptable Practice (xv), paragraph 5.49)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

5. That the policy of directing urban African children to high schools in the homelands be reconsidered, and that in the interests of economy as well as maximum accessibility secondary education for all qualified applicants be provided as near as possible to their homes, whether these be rural or urban.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xiii), (xv) and (xvii)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

6. That special attention be paid to the provision of education for all races in 'white' rural areas.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xiii), (xiv) and (xvii))
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

7. As long as schools are provided for separate racial groups, that where the majority of parents of children in a school request that a school admit children of other language and race groups, the education authorities accede to such a request, provided it does not seriously affect the social adjustment of the children at school and their ability to profit from the learning situation.

(See Unacceptable Principle 1, paragraph 4.3)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to church and other private schools)

8. That private individuals and organisations be encouraged to contribute to bursary schemes for under-privileged children, especially those of high academic promise, and that the State encourage such contributions through tax concessions.

(See Unacceptable Practice (ii), paragraph 5.12 et seq.)
(Private initiative, involving finance)
(Applicable also to church and other private schools)

9. That while the provision of schools for Indian, African and Coloured children is restricted in certain areas, a generous scheme of State-provided boarding bursaries be instituted, and increased hostel accommodation be provided.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xiii) and (xvii)
(State initiative, involving finance)

10. That a generous State scheme of bursaries be provided for tertiary education for all racial groups.

(See Unacceptable Practices (xv) and (xvi))
(State initiative, involving finance)

11. That the right to admit academically qualified applicants, irrespective of race, should be restored to the former open universities and this right be available to any South African university wanting to use it.

(See Unacceptable Principle (i), paragraph 4.3 and Unacceptable Practice (xv), paragraph 5.46 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving limited finance and manpower demands)

12. That while schools are provided for separate racial groups, regulations should be flexible enough to permit the admission of some children who do not belong to the dominant racial group attending the school in cases where their exclusion would cause hardship (for example, where the family is classified into different racial groups).

(See Unacceptable Principle (i), paragraph 4.3)
(State initiative, involving neither finance nor manpower)
(Applicable also to church and private schools)

13. That higher priority be given in government expenditure to all forms of education.

(See Allocation of Resources, Chapter 4, paragraph 5.38)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

B. IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION

14. That the provision and maintenance of State schools for all groups be financed from general and local taxation, and that the principle

of expecting the African population to pay for any extension of their own education be abandoned.

(See Unacceptable Principle (ii), paragraph 4.4. and 4.16, and Unacceptable Practice (xi), paragraph 5.37)
(State initiative involving finance only)

15. That education facilities, as long as they are provided separately, should in principle be of equal standard, and that the advance towards equality should be pursued with all practicable speed.

(See, for example, Unacceptable Practices (iii), (iv), (v) and (vii)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

16. That all teachers regularly employed in African Community Schools be paid from State funds.

(See Unacceptable Practice (vi), paragraph 5.26)
(State initiative, involving finance only)

17. That the present pupil-staff ratio in African schools of 60:1 should not be allowed to increase and that improvements in the provision of teachers should be planned with the utmost urgency, so that this unsatisfactory ratio may be reduced.

(See Unacceptable Practice (iv), paragraph 5.20 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving financial and manpower demands)

18. That provision be made as soon as possible in all African primary schools for a school day of 4½ hours in the sub-standards to replace the present 3 hour-day arranged in double sessions; that where possible different teachers be provided for each of the double sessions while there is still a shortage of accommodation; that the extent of the platoon system in Indian schools continue to be reduced; and that the building programme for Coloured schools should be even more vigorously pursued in order to combat the increasing use of the platoon system in Coloured education.

(See Unacceptable Practice (v), paragraph, 5.23 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

19. Although it is recognised that the immediate educational and social needs of the different groups of people in South Africa may require, at different times and in different places, variations in educational control, provision and administration, plans should be made for the indivisible control of education on a regional basis by one authority.

(See Unacceptable Practice (xix), paragraph 5.61 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance and manpower demands)

20. That the wishes and requirements of the local community and the educational needs of the child should be taken into account in determining the stage at which each of the official languages of South Africa is to be introduced as a subject and as a medium of instruction, especially for those children whose home language is neither of the official languages.
(See Unacceptable Practice (xviii), paragraph 5.56 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving neither finance nor manpower demands)

21. That excessive language demands should not be made on African children at the beginning of the primary school and the beginning of the secondary school.
(See Unacceptable Practice (xviii), paragraph 5.56 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance and manpower demands)

C. IMPROVEMENTS IN THE QUALITY OF TEACHERS

22. That urgent attention be given to improving both the entry qualifications and the standard of teacher training for all racial groups in the country, but particularly for African, Coloured and Indian students.
(See Unacceptable Practices (iii) and (iv), paragraph 5.18 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving both finance and manpower demands)

23. That increasing attention be given to planning in-service courses on the academic content of teaching subjects and on teaching methods for all teachers, but particularly for those with low qualifications; and that teachers be released from school duties to attend such courses.
(See Unacceptable Practices (iii) and (iv), paragraph 5.18 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving both finance and manpower demands)

24. That greater encouragement be given to teachers to improve their qualifications.
(See Unacceptable Practice (iv), paragraph 5.19 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving both finance and manpower demands)

25. That the conditions of service of teachers irrespective of race are made the same.
(See Unacceptable Practice (ixb), paragraph 5.34)
(State initiative, involving finance)

26. That salary differentials between teachers with the same qualifications but in different racial groups should not be widened in future salary increases, and that a policy be adopted for simultaneous revisions of teachers' salaries which will progressively reduce the differentials and eliminate them as soon as possible.
(See Unacceptable Practice (ixa), paragraph 5.32 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving finance)

D. IMPROVEMENTS IN EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES

27. That a Commission of Enquiry be set up to examine the aims, methods and the financing of Bantu Education.

(See, for example, Unacceptable Principles (ii), (v) and (vii), and various Unacceptable Practices)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance and manpower demands)

28. That technical and vocational education for Africans, Coloureds and Indians be considerably expanded, and that the kinds of training given reflect local as well as the country's needs.

(See Unacceptable Practice (xvi), paragraph 5.50 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

29. That the development plans outlined in Parliamentary Acts and in official statements made in regard to Coloured and Indian education be implemented.

(See, for example, Unacceptable Practices (i) and (xvi)
(State initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

30. That text-books and all school materials be supplied on the same basis to schools for all racial groups.

(See Unacceptable Practice (vii), paragraph 5.27 et seq.)
(State initiative, involving finance)

31. That in view of the various kinds of training needed by people in remote areas and in full-time employment, correspondence education be used as effectively as possible.

(See Unacceptable Practice (xxi), paragraph 5.67f)
(State and private initiative, involving both finance and manpower)

32. That night-schools and continuation classes especially for adult Africans be considerably expanded and situated in areas where there is greatest demand for them.

(See Unacceptable Practices (viii) and (xvi)
(State and private initiative, involving finance and manpower demands)

33. That large-scale employers of labour extend their training programmes for Africans, Coloureds and Indians to include literacy training.

(See Unacceptable Practice (viii), paragraph 5.30 et seq.)
(Private initiative, involving private finance and manpower)

34. That private individuals and organisations be encouraged to provide supplementary educational and cultural activities for underprivileged groups until these are supported by state finance (for example,

the provision of extra tuition facilities and pre-school enrichment programmes).

(See Unacceptable Practices (viii) and (xx)
(Private initiative, involving private finance and manpower)

II. A LIBERAL APPROACH TO KNOWLEDGE AND THE CONTENT OF EDUCATION

7.5

35. That the content of education should provide children with greater opportunities to study social systems other than apartheid.

(See Unacceptable Principles (iv) and (vi)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

36. That a permanent reviewing commission representative of all race groups be set up to examine all text-books and other school material to ensure that the content does not damage but fosters inter-group harmony.

(See, for example, Unacceptable Principles (iv) and (v) paragraph 4.17)
(State initiative involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

37. That in the absence of State action in regard to recommendation No. 36 such a reviewing commission be created by private initiative.

(Private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)

38. That education departments, churches, universities, teachers' associations, schools, other organisations and individuals prepare and select teaching material which does not damage but fosters inter-group harmony.

(See Unacceptable Principles (iii) and (v))
(State and private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

39. Since the attitudes of teachers tend to reflect the attitudes of the community from which they come, that initial teacher training and in-service training should stress common human values and should include guidance on handling inter-group relations.

(See Unacceptable Principles (iii) and (v))
(State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)

40. That education departments, churches, universities, teachers' associations, schools, other organisations and individuals actively discourage young people from using offensive group names.

(See Unacceptable Principles (iii) and (vi)
(Private and State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

41. That teachers' organisations explore ways of inter-racial discussion between teachers on educational problems common to all race groups.

(See, for example, Unacceptable Principles (iii), (v), and (vii))
(Private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)

42. That inter-racial meetings of pupils on equal grounds be encouraged (for example: debates, concerts, or working on joint projects).

(See Unacceptable Principles (iii) and (v))
(State and private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

43. That while racial divisions persist, each racial group should in principle be directly involved in determining the content of the curriculum and syllabuses used in its schools and in administrative decisions about the organisation of schools.

(See Unacceptable Principle (vii) and paragraph 4.19)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to church mission schools)

44. That education have as its aim both the inculcation of a cultural identity, and a common loyalty to South Africa and the whole of humanity.

(See Unacceptable Principle (iii)
(State initiative, involving negligible finance and manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

45. That throughout the curriculum attention be paid to the moral development of children and that the moral education of children should prepare them for necessary social change.

(See Unacceptable Principle (v). See also Chapter 3 and Appendix (i))
(State and private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

46. That religious instruction be regarded as one of the most important means of promoting moral development in children. It should, as at present, be based upon a syllabus acceptable to and agreed upon by

at least the major Christian denominations, always provided that non-Christian pupils may, if their parents so desire, be withdrawn from this instruction and that no teacher shall be compelled against his conscience to give this instruction nor be disadvantaged in his profession by his refusal.

(See Chapter 3 and Appendix (i))
(State initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)
(Applicable also to private schools)

47. That programmes of adult education include the consideration of moral values and deal systematically with sound inter-racial relations.

(See Chapter 3)
(State and private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower demands)

48. That the system of state-subsidization for church schools for Africans be restored on the same basis as for other groups.

(See Unacceptable Practice (x), paragraph 5.35f)
(State initiative, involving finance)

49. That the Headmasters and Headmistresses Conference and the Roman Catholic Education Council should jointly organise a conference to explore ways and means of bridging racial barriers. The Conference should be concerned with skills and techniques to assist attitudinal change.

(See Chapter 6, paragraph 6.8)
(Private initiative, involving negligible finance or manpower)

Table 12: TABULAR SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

	Initiative State	Initiative Private	Finance State	Finance Private	Requiring Manpower	Negligible Finance of Manpower	Applicable to Private Schools
1. Phased introduction of compulsory education	+		+		+		+
2. Expansion of non-white secondary education	+		+		+		
3. Expansion of non-white tertiary education in urban areas	+		+		+		
4. Extension of teacher-training especially in urban areas	+		+		+		
5. Greater provision of African and Coloured secondary education near pupils' homes	+		+		+		
6. Extension of educational provision in White rural areas	+		+		+		
7. Parental option for integrated schools	+					+	+
8. Creation of privately sponsored bursary schemes		+		+			+
9. Generous State boarding bursaries for all races	+		+				
10. More State bursaries for tertiary education	+		+				
11. Opening of universities to all who are academically qualified	+					+	
12. Flexible schools' admission policy	+					+	+
13. Higher priority to spending on all education	+		+		+		
14. Increased financing of African education from general revenue	+		+				
15. Equality of educational standards for all racial groups	+		+		+		

Recommendation	Initiative State	Initiative Private	Finance State	Finance Private	Requiring Manpower	Negligible Finance of Manpower	Applicable to Private Schools
16. All African teachers paid from State funds	+		+				
17. Reduction of African pupil: staff ratio	+		+		+		
18. Eventual elimination of double sessions	+		+		+		
19. Regional devolution of authority	+					+	
20. Media of instruction determined by local conditions and needs	+					+	
21. Fewer language demands on African pupils	+					+	
22. Higher qualifications for teacher-training	+		+		+		
23. More in-service teacher-training	+		+		+		
24. Teachers encouraged to improve qualifications	+		+				
25. Equalisation of teachers' conditions of service	+		+				
26. Reduction in teachers' salary differentials	+		+				
27. Commission of enquiry into Bantu Education	+					+	
28. More non-white technical and vocational education	+		+		+		
29. Implementation of plans for Coloured and Indian education	+		+		+		
30. Equal provision of school materials	+		+				
31. Extension of correspondence tuition	+	+	+	+	+		
32. Extension of adult education, especially for Africans	+	+	+	+	+		
33. Literacy training by large-scale employers		+		+	+		

34. Cultural enrichment programmes		+		+	+		
35. Teaching systems alternative to apartheid	+					+	+
36. Reviewing commission on educational material	+					+	+
37. Private reviewing commission on educational material		+				+	
38. Educational material to foster group harmony	+	+				+	+
39. Teachers trained in inter-group relations	+					+	
40. Discouraging abusive group names	+	+				+	+
41. Inter-racial co-operation between teachers' organisations		+				+	
42. Inter-racial co-operation between pupils	+	+				+	+
43. Eachgroup responsible for own educational decisions	+					+	+
44. Inculcation of common loyalty as well as cultural identity	+					+	+
45. Moral education to prepare for social change	+	+				+	+
46. Religious education to promote moral development	+	+				+	+
47. Adult education in inter-racial relationships	+	+				+	
48. State subsidies for African church schools	+		+				
49. Private schools conference		+				+	+
TOTALS:	43	14	25	5	18	21	14

While most of the changes recommended require state initiative, a considerable number can be undertaken privately. Nearly half the recommendations do not require significant extra manpower or finance.

7.6 *The goal of the recommendations*

The preceeding 49 recommendations have as their goal an education system in which the following four principles operate:

(i) *Primary education* shall be compulsory for all children, and shall be free. Where schools, for geographical reasons, are racially homogeneous, education authorities and teachers shall ensure that children of different racial groups meet in social, cultural and sporting contacts.

(ii) *Secondary education* shall be equally available to all on merit, and shall be free to the same age limit for all pupils. Such education shall be of equivalent quality wherever it is provided and shall include vocational, technical and commercial high schools open to all pupils educationally qualified to enter them.

(iii) *Teacher training* shall, as far as possible, be conducted in colleges and universities open to all qualified educationally to enter them, and shall be of equivalent standard. Special attention shall be given to instructing teacher trainees in the promotion of inter-group tolerance and understanding in schools. There shall be no discrimination on the grounds of race in the salaries or conditions of service of teachers.

(iv) *University education* of the highest quality available in South Africa shall be accessible equally to all persons qualified by academic criteria to receive it.

Chapter Eight

PATTERNS FOR THE FUTURE

8.1 The Commission believes that the recommendations of the previous chapter could not be fully effective in a period shorter than fifteen years, even if their acceptance by white South Africans were complete. Because in the present climate of opinion there will be resistance on the part of many whites to the principles which underlie these recommendations, we have decided to examine three possible patterns of future development:

1. Resistance to the changes outlined in this report
2. Acceptance by white South Africans of the principles for a society acceptable to Christians
3. Sudden changes brought about in unforeseen circumstances.

1. RESISTANCE TO CHANGE

8.2 This, in practice, is the most likely for the immediate future. Our classification of a group of recommendations which could be carried out by private initiative was made because those in power can be expected to resist change in the direction of a non-discriminatory society. We believe, therefore, that this group of recommendations should be emphasised as the starting point for changed attitudes. Although these are relatively few in number (14 out of 49), the Commission feels that their effects if implemented should not be under-rated. If all South African Christians accept this limited number of recommendations and act upon them a significant leavening force in the South African social situation will have been created. If they accept in principle all the recommendations made by this Commission - although restrained from acting upon all - then forces for change will be all the stronger.

8.3 The acceptance of these recommendations assumes that Christians should contribute their skills and energies in the present social system. The Commission recognises that some South Africans of all colours are concerned because they feel any ameliorative work they can do within the system helps to perpetuate it. A trained teacher, for example, might feel that in conscience he could not work for a State Department of Education which inevitably follows official government policy. Should he withdraw, however, his influence would be lost altogether.

8.4 The Commission earnestly recommends that all Christians work within the system as far as their consciences will allow. They should nevertheless be constantly aware of the ultimate goals of an acceptable society and should choose those areas of action which could most quickly and effectively help to bring it about.

8.5 Included in the recommendations of Chapter 7 there are a number which, if implemented, would lead to a more just society, although one which is still separated on racial grounds. Even those who resist change towards a non-discriminatory society should be able to accept these recommendations.

8.6 Although these recommendations do require some changes in present policy they do not affect the basic ideology of the separation of races. The following are the recommendations which seem to the Commission to fall into this category:

1. phased introduction of six years of universal compulsory education
2. expansion of non-white secondary education
3. extension of tertiary education in urban areas for Indian, Coloured and African students
4. extension of teacher-training, especially in urban areas
5. greater provision of African and Coloured secondary education near pupil's homes
6. extension of educational provision in white rural areas
8. creation of privately sponsored bursary schemes
9. extension of generous boarding bursaries to all races
10. extension of state bursaries for tertiary education
13. higher priority to spending on all education
14. increased financing of African education from general revenue
15. equality of educational standards for all racial groups
16. all teachers in all African schools to be paid from State funds
17. reduction of pupil-staff ratio in African schools

18. improvements in and eventual elimination of double sessions and platoon system in schools
20. media of instruction determined by local conditions and needs of children
21. fewer language demands on African pupils
22. improvements in entry qualifications for teacher training
23. extension of in-service teacher training
24. encouragement to teachers to improve qualifications
25. same conditions of service for all teachers
26. reduction in salary differentials for different race groups
27. commission of enquiry into Bantu Education
29. implementation of existing educational plans for Coloured and Indian pupils
30. provision of all school materials on same basis for all pupils
31. extension and improvement of correspondence education
32. expansion of adult education, especially for Africans
33. industrial training to include literacy programmes
43. responsibility for own educational decisions by each racial group
46. religious education used to promote children's moral development
48. State subsidies for church schools for Africans.

Of these recommendations numbers 20, 21, 43, and 46 require negligible finance or manpower demands, while 8, 9, 14, 16, 25, 26, 30 and 48 require the provision of finance but have small manpower demands.

8.7 Everyone who calls himself a Christian should be able to accept these recommendations. It is incumbent therefore on Christians and others who can accept the moral implications of this report to work so that these recommendations can be effectively implemented in practice. It should, nevertheless, be recognised that when these have been fully implemented social conditions will have been created which will lead to still further change.

2. ACCEPTANCE BY WHITE SOUTH AFRICANS OF THE PRINCIPLES FOR A SOCIETY ACCEPTABLE TO CHRISTIANS

8.8 The likelihood of success of this pattern would be greater if four conditions were present:-

(a) if there were an agreement among all groups about the basic constitutional framework and the rights of each group guaranteed within it;

(b) if there were not a great discrepancy in the levels of economic, technological and scientific development of the groups;

(c) if linguistic, religious, class and political differences cut across one another and did not follow racial divisions;

(d) if there were a close agreement on the basic values of man in society.

8.9 It should be noted that the second and fourth of these conditions can be created by education and that education would have an indirect part to play in the creation of the first and third conditions.

8.10 In the first pattern of change which was described, an aim of action advocated was to bring about a more fluid situation within the apartheid structure. In the second pattern fluidity could be developed unhampered by the restrictions inherent in apartheid thinking. Nevertheless, a carefully worked out programme of changes would need to be planned. The implementation of this second pattern might go through four stages:

(i) The present situation would be the starting point;

(ii) a stage during which State restrictions on individual choice and private initiative regarding education would be removed and in which opportunities would exist for education authorities to make exceptions to apartheid rules and create a more fluid situation;

(iii) a stage in which State finance would be used to encourage those educational institutions which did not perpetuate separate racial divisions;

(iv) the final stage at which all State institutions would cater for all people.

Stage (i)

8.11 This first stage would correspond to the present position described in the first pattern - a resistance to change. It therefore follows

that the educational recommendations which were suggested for this pattern would apply to this stage. As has already been argued, their implementation would prepare the way for stage (ii).

Stage (ii)

8.12 The second stage, involving the removal of State restrictions on individual choice and private initiative in education, would allow the implementation of recommendations which would not be acceptable to apartheid thinking. In a suggested order of priority these are firstly a series concerning changes in the structure of educational provision -

11. opening of universities to all who are academically qualified
7. possibility for parental option for integration of language or racial groups
12. flexible schools' admission policy across colour line to avoid hardship cases
28. expansion of technical and vocational education for Africans, Coloureds and Indians
34. privately-sponsored cultural enrichment programmes for under-privileged children.

8.13 Secondly, there is a series of recommendations which concerns attitude changes and the content of education:-

35. teaching of systems alternative to apartheid
36. reviewing commissions on educational content to foster group harmony
37. private reviewing commission
38. preparation of educational material which fosters group harmony
39. teachers trained in inter-group relations
40. discouragement of abusive group names
41. co-operation between teachers' organisations for different racial groups
42. co-operation between pupils of different racial groups
44. inculcation of common loyalty as well as cultural identity
45. moral education which prepares pupils for changes in society
47. promotion of adult education dealing with inter-racial relationships
49. private schools conference on attitudinal change.

All these recommendations, with the exception of 28, involve negligible finance and manpower demands.

Stage (iii)

8.14 The third stage, in which additional State support would be given to institutions which were not racially segregated, would begin at a time when white people were more prepared to accept change. In this stage the principles upon which practice could be built can be stated in terms of the positive educational goals of the acceptable order of society described at the end of Chapter 7 (paragraph 7.6). It is at this stage that primary and secondary education shall be available for all children under the same conditions, and that tertiary education, including teacher training, shall be open to all on merit. At this stage also, Recommendation 19 (indivisible control of education on a regional basis) should receive priority in planning.

It is to be expected that both in the second and third stages private schools, especially for whites, will emerge, even if temporarily. These will provide education for children of parents who are unwilling to accept the concept of integration. It will be remembered that the Commission feels that private schools reflecting a particular philosophical orientation must be allowed. Such schools, however, must in the light of Christian principles foster a common South African patriotism; must reject the concept of white domination; must positively eschew patterns of group division; and must teach alternatives to the apartheid doctrine. (See paragraph 4.6 et seq.).

Stage (iv)

8.15 By this stage the State system of education caters for all without discrimination on the grounds of race, language, or creed. The activities of the private schools will have the same limitations which were imposed in stage (iii).

3. SUDDEN CHANGES BROUGHT ABOUT IN UNFORESEEN CIRCUMSTANCES

8.16 In the South African situation this possibility cannot be ignored. It is, however, clearly impossible to foretell the circumstances under which change might occur or the conditions which might exist afterwards. It is sufficient to say that in such circumstances recommendations for educational action might need to be very different in their form and order of priorities.

We believe, however, that the goals of the acceptable society (as outlined in this report) and the educational principles which are part of them would still be applicable.

Chapter Nine

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

9.1 Although this report is addressed primarily to Christians, the Commission believes, however, that all people should be able to examine it in the light of broad and commonly accepted moral principles and be able to approve of it.

9.2 Our investigation has shown that many of our educational principles and practices in South Africa cannot be reconciled with Christian teaching on the nature of man and society. We have discussed many of these principles and practices, and made a large number of recommendations aimed at bringing about change; we are well aware that there are many other educational problems which we have not discussed.

9.3 In the past there have been a number of appeals to white South Africans to develop more effectively the education of other racial groups, using the argument of enlightened self-interest based upon the country's economic needs. The Commission recognises this approach as one justification for educational change in South Africa.

9.4 The Commission is convinced, however, that the prime concern of all Christians in South Africa must be to live out their Christian convictions. This demands that education must be so organised as to provide for the development of the full potential of each child, regardless of his race, and the creation of attitudes which will allow such development to occur and which are consistent with the Christian ethic. Our primary concern is thus the moral imperative placed upon us rather than economic considerations.

9.5 Only energetic and persistent action in the moral, social and economic fields can solve the problems we have commented on in our Report. Most of our recommendations have been addressed to white South Africans. It should be remembered, however, that African, Coloured and Indian Christians have a responsibility to take energetic and persistent action to improve education in their own communities. The Commission recognises earlier and present efforts which bursary and building funds, teachers' societies and cultural bodies have already begun in this direction.

9.6 We earnestly appeal to all who read this Report, whatever their views on political or social questions, to take effective action so that at least all those recommendations which we have listed as possible within the pattern called 'Resistance to Change' are implemented. The effects of these changes are likely to be far greater than we can now envisage. Most of this can be begun at once, given the necessary will to press for action and to act.

9.7 We have tried to suggest those changes which are necessary in order to reform education in the light of Christian principles. Differences on matters outside the sphere of education can too easily become an excuse for failing to carry out possible improvements in education. Every Christian, whatever his or her views on broader issues, should be able to accept at least some of our recommendations and the need for action to bring about change in at least some of the areas we have dealt with in our Report.

9.8 We remember Chesterton's words: 'Christianity has not failed; it has never been tried'.

This Report outlines plans for action which all Christians in South Africa can try - if they have the will to do so.

SIGNATORIES TO THE REPORT OF THE EDUCATION COMMISSION

MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION, signing in their individual and personal capacities, and not on behalf of any institution.

M.J. Ashley	lecturer in education, Rhodes University
F.E. Auerbach	past president, Transvaal Teachers' Association
C.H. Brigish	former chairman, Witwatersrand Central School Board
O. Britzius	principal of a correspondence college
C.B. Collins	general secretary, University Christian Movement
M. de Lisle	headmaster, St Martin's School
A.P. Hunter	professor of education, University of Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland
A. Jennings	director of studies, Department of Christian Education and Youth, Methodist Church of South Africa
Richard Luyt	principal, University of Cape Town
M.T. Moerane	editor, *The World*
R.K. Muir (secretary)	lecturer in education, University of the Witwatersrand
R.S. Naidoo	president, South African Indian Teachers' Association
N.E. Nuttall	past principal, Natal Training College
R. Tunmer (chairman)	senior lecturer in education, University of the Witwatersrand

CONSULTANTS

Professor W.M. Kgware
Professor L.W. Lanham
Dr E.G. Malherbe
Dr W.G. McConkey
Mr C. Nettleton
Professor F.K. Peters
Mr G.W. Tabor

FOOTNOTES

1. For a detailed treatment of the events surrounding the publication of the Message, see *The Message in Perspective* (de Gruchy and de Villiers): S.A. Council of Churches, 1969.
2. 'Out of a total population of 15,982,664 (1960 census), 11,578,636 (nearly 12 million or 72%) profess Christianity. 8,673,039 or 75% of the professing Christians in South Africa are non-White. Christianity is professed by 94% of whites, 91% of Coloureds, 7% of Asians and 67% of Africans'. Cawood: *The Churches and Race Relations in South Africa* (SAIRR 1964 p.8).
3. Transvaal Education Ordinance 1953.
4. Other educational theorists in South Africa have also suggested that use be made of general school subjects to foster certain attitudes in children. We feel, however, that these attitudes are fundamentally different to those we have put forward in this chapter. Nevertheless, their importance is so great that we have devoted Appendix (ii) to an examination of these attitudes as revealed in Christian National Education policy.
5. See evidence given in Appendix (ii). See also Auerbach F.E.: *The Power of Prejudice in South African Education,* Balkema 1965.
6. Dr G.H.A. Steyn in 'Main Features of Educational Development in the Republic of South Africa, 1910-1967': *1968 Statistical Yearbook.*

6a. Molteno, R.: *Zambia: The Educational and Student Scene,* paper of the School of Humanities, University of Zambia, 1970. p.11.

7. *Bantu Education Report* 1968.
8. The Annual Report of the Department of Bantu Education for 1968 stated that 'the literacy figure for the Bantu population in the 11 to 20 years age group is ... about 85%'.
9. *Transvaal Education News,* April 1970: article by F.E. Auerbach.
10. Malherbe, E.G.: *Bantu Manpower and Education* (SAIRR 1969) p.7.
11. Ibid. p. 14.
12. Advertisement in the *Star,* 9.2.71.
13. Horrell, M. *A Survey of Race Relations 1970* (SAIRR), p.206.
14. *Survey of Race Relations* 1970 p.220, p.227 and p.232.
15. In the total African school-going population in 1969, 69.99% were in lower primary classes (*Survey* 1970,p.211).
16. Quoted in Horrell: *Bantu Education to 1968,* p. 67.
17. According to the Minister of Bantu Education, of a total of 47,409 African teachers in 1970 only 717 had a degree and a professional qualification and only 4731 had matriculation and a professional qualification. *(Rand Daily Mail,* 19.2.71).
18. For details of such cases see Memorandum on the Application of the Pass Laws and Influx Control, published by the Black Sash.
19. Operation Headstart: a pre-school child development programme, which in 1969 provided special classes taught by trained teachers for half a million disadvantaged children under the age of six.
20. See Horrell, M.: *The Education of the Coloured Community in South Africa 1652 to 1970,* (SAIRR 1970) p.14.
21. As there is progress towards greater equality of provision it would be hoped that the conditions of entry for non-white pupils would be made the same as for white. In practice most white children now start their formal schooling between the ages of 5½ and 6½.

Appendix One

NOTES ON MORAL EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

These brief pointers on the relation between school subjects and moral education arise particularly from the discussion on Moral Education in Chapter 3. Whereas it is obvious that in Religious Instruction there is opportunity for providing moral teaching, other subjects in the curriculum can be used for this purpose as well. Moral goals which can be achieved in a variety of subjects are indicated below.

Literature

Identification with character (empathy); discussion of the social setting of literature about people in times and places removed from the pupil in the classroom; moral aspects of the inter-action between characters; the value of truth, honesty, compassion and commitment; the power of emotions and the use and misuse of emotions.

Language

Awareness of the power of words to inform and to move; persuasion and deception; the responsibility of weighing one's words.

History

'To foster an appreciation of certain fundamental values and ideals such as justice and liberty, through the study of men and nations over a long period of time' (Transvaal Matriculation History Syllabus 1968); 'If the teacher ignores moral issues in history, he inculcates the view that human decisions can be taken without regard to such issues - and that is in itself a moral judgement' (Sir Robert Birley).

The balancing of conflicting interests by statesmen; awareness of the dangers of chauvinism.

Civics

Awareness of responsibility of the citizen; the consequences of indifference: 'All that is necessary for the triumph of evil is that good men do nothing' (Edmund Burke). Helping others, especially those less fortunate than ourselves, as a prime moral duty in citizenship.

Geography

Understanding of the influence of climate and environment on the modes of life of people; appreciation of man's responsibility for keeping the earth beautiful and productive for posterity, appreciation for one's country.

Science

The role of science in improving living conditions; moral responsibility of the scientist, e.g. nuclear discoveries, pesticides, medical science and its relation to social and moral problems, e.g. drugs.

Arithmetic

Rational approach and application of logic, implications of statistics; honest interpretation.

Commerce

Distribution of wealth; consequences of economic action, both public and private, on the lives of people; social costs of economic growth, e.g. industrial pollution.

Appendix Two

CHRISTIAN NATIONAL EDUCATION

The Commission felt that a full understanding of South African education could only be obtained after attention had been paid to Christian National Education. It seemed, for instance, that some of the principles and practices which we had described as unacceptable might be related to this particular educational philosophy. In particular, we had questioned whether racially differentiated education systems, enforced mother-tongue education, and the attempts to make Africans largely responsible for their own education provision, might not reflect Christian National Education theories.

In this Appendix, we examine the origins and history of the movement; the theory and practice of C.N.E.; the extent to which C.N.E. theory has been implemented in practice; C.N.E. theory and Christian principles; and finally we give a brief summary of those aspects of C.N.E. which we feel to be educationally objectionable.

1. ORIGINS AND HISTORY

The origins of C.N.E. are to be found in the Church-oriented education of the 16th - 19th centuries. Education then was seen as part of the function of the Church, and one of its main functions was to produce orthodox Christians of a particular sect. This concept came to South Africa from Holland and the other European countries, including England. It survived amongst the Dutch-speaking section right into the 20th century, despite world-wide changes in the 19th century towards a State-controlled system of education. All attempts to secularize education at the Cape

had been strongly resisted by some people. The opposition to De Mist's ideas at the Cape in 1803 - 1805 was the first manifestation of such activity in South Africa.

With the second British Occupation in 1806 '... the new school system became in fact a State system, neutral, liberal and English in spirit and direction'. (Coetzee J. Chr.: 'Christian National Education' in African Studies Programme 4, Witwatersrand University 1968). As a reaction to this an embryonic movement was begun among Dutch-Afrikaner leaders which was aimed at preserving the religious and national character of the people. This was expressed in the move towards Dutch private schools in the 1830's. The ideas of the movement were taken by the Trekkers to the interior from 1838 onwards.

At the Cape, education had been organized into a State and secular system by the end of the 19th Century. In the Transvaal there had been a move towards secularization during the time of Thomas Francois Burghers (1872 - 1877) and the period of English rule (1877 - 81). There was, however, a reaction against 'Cape liberal' ideas, when the Rev S.J. du Toit became superintendent of Education in the Transvaal in 1881.

Embodied in his ideas on provision for education were the traditional ones of the parents being responsible for the education of their children, the Church being responsible for religious education, and the State participation in education being limited to financial provision and the maintenance of standards of efficiency. Dutch was established as the sole official language of the Transvaal Republic, and as the medium of instruction in the state schools. These ideas about education, the Uitlanders, who poured into the Transvaal in the 1880's and 1890's, found unacceptable. In opposition to the Transvaal system they organized private, English-medium schools.

After the Boer War and the defeat of the two Republics, Milner attempted to anglicize the Boer children by restricting education through the medium of Dutch in the state schools to five hours per week. His new system was also highly bureaucratic and swept away the function of the Church in state education. The strong desire of the Dutch-Afrikaners to retain their culture and national identity in the face of a policy designed to anglicize them, and their dislike of a secular education system, found expression in the establishment of some 200 private C.N.E. schools in the Orange Free State and the Transvaal. At these schools Dutch was the medium of instruction for most subjects at the primary level, although in the C.N.E. high schools in towns English continued to be the main medium of instruction. In all C.N.E. schools there was a strong emphasis on Christian teaching according to Calvinist doctrine. The majority of Dutch-Afrikaner children were sent to these schools.

After the granting of Representative Government to the ex-Trekker

republics, the 'Smuts Act' of 1907 for the Transvaal and the 'Hertzog Act' of 1908 for the Orange River Colony significantly modified educational provision in the territories, in that they guaranteed mother-tongue instruction up to Standard 3, stipulated that every school day should open with prayer, and made religious instruction a daily compulsory subject in the primary school. Under these conditions, the C.N.E. schools agreed to be taken over by the State.

The concept of neutral or secular schools was still opposed by a number of influential Afrikaners. There was also dissatisfaction with the provision for language media, in that English was a compulsory part of the curriculum for Dutch-speaking children, whereas Dutch was optional for English-speaking children. The attitude of these Dutch-Afrikaners to what others regarded as a reasonable compromise was expressed at the time by Mr J. Kamp of the Theological School at Potchefstroom, who raised three objections to the C.N.E. schools being amalgamated with the State schools:-

(i) the State school was based on a lie and a presumption for it placed the State between God and the parents.

(ii) It was a steady but certain poison for all true religion.

(iii) It could never give Dutch-Afrikaner children a national education.

These two objectionable elements of the State system of education (it was secular, and it sought a compromise between English and Dutch national cultures) were to be repeated at intervals up to the present day.

This dissatisfaction with the 1907-8 acts was expressed, for instance, as late as 1962 in a lecture by Professor H.J.J. Bingle, the rector of the Potchefstroom University for Christian Higher Education, and vice-chairman of the National Education Council: 'The Smuts Act of 1907, and especially the preparation for it, *pretended* that everything was being retained that was in force in the Republic. In reality the whole trend of this law was humanistic, with a thin layer of religious veneer on top'.

In succeeding years the ideals of C.N.E. were kept alive and propagated in small informal groups, the most important of which was centred in Potchefstroom. During the First World War the Association for Christian National Higher Education was founded: its main achievement was the conversion of the Potchefstroom Theological Seminary into the Potchefstroom University College for Christian Higher Education. This institution was based on the C.N.E. philosophy. It would, however, be incorrect to speak of a widespread movement for C.N.E. at this stage, or even of a systematic theory.

The next major step was a Volkskongres in 1939 at Bloemfontein, organised by the Federasie van Afrikaanse Kultuurvereniginge (F.A.K.).

This took place immediately after the centenary celebrations of the Great Trek, and the concept of C.N.E. was given impetus by the resurgence of Afrikaner national consciousness at the time. The main topic of the Congress was C.N.E.; a committee was elected to formulate a detailed policy of C.N.E.; and an Institute for C.N.E. was founded.

This Institute published its well-known pamphlet on C.N.E. policy in February 1948. The pamphlet carried a preface by Professor J.C. van Rooy, chairman of the F.A.K., Rector of Potchefstroom University, and Chairman of the Broederbond, a secret Afrikaner organisation. In this preface, he stated that renewed vigilance had become necessary as the '... old outworn dual-medium idea was once again raised in 1937-8 in a renewed attempt to anglicise our children ...' Further statements made in the preface are these: 'After nearly ten years of silent work the policy can go out into the world ... various drafts were considered by all the directing bodies of the F.A.K. ... therefore the policy in its present form has been approved by the whole of Afrikanerdom in so far as it is represented by the F.A.K. ... We want no mixing of languages, no mixing of cultures, no mixing of religions and no mixing of races. We are winning the medium-struggle. The struggle for the Christian and National school still lies before us'.

Apart from clergymen and professors of education, the signatories to the policy statement included Mr H.J. Greijbe, for twenty years chairman of the largest teachers' association in South Africa, the Transvaalse Onderwysersunie, Dr E.G. Jansen, subsequently Governor-General of the Union, and Dr T.E. Dönges, later Minister of Finance and State-President-Elect. As was claimed in the preface to the policy statement, it was probably true that C.N.E. was supported by the majority of Afrikaners. It certainly had influential support, which it still enjoys.

It must, however, be remembered that the private C.N.E. Schools set up after the South African War were not single-medium institutions, so that there is no justification for the present practice of single-medium instruction in the early C.N.E. Schools.

2. THE THEORY AND PRACTICE OF C.N.E.

Introduction

At its most naive level, theory may be no more than rule of thumb, or firmly-held opinion based on personal experience. At a second level, an educational theory is a unified and systematic set of statements which are logically related, and which are developed to justify practical activity. At a third level, educational theories may be somewhat like scientific theories, which are based on an hypothesis which can be verified by observation, or on several logically connected hypotheses.

In a consideration of C.N.E. it is theory of the first two kinds with which we have to deal. One of the difficulties is to determine the limits of the theory, because the statements of it are at different levels of conceptualization. Some are at the first level - a set of rules, or a guide to desired practical activity. The Movement for *Vrye C.N.O.* adopted ten articles in 1903 which are at this level of theory making. The policy statement of the Institute for C.N.E., published in 1948, is at the second level, as also are the expositions of some C.N.E. protagonists like J. Chr. Coetzee (see, for example, his article *Christian National Education in South Africa* in the 1957 *Year Book of Education).*

There is difference of opinion about the degree to which state education in South Africa is determined by the theory of C.N.E. The 1967 Education Policy Act, for example, which lays down the policy to be pursued in educating white children, is sometimes regarded as an expression of C.N.E. theory. This was denied in Parliament. The statements which compose the Act are certainly devoid of the systematic formulation which is found in explicit statements of C.N.E. policy. But the Act does contain some of the main tenets of that theory - that education should be organised on a Christian and national basis, and that it should be given in the mother tongue of the child. The statements of the Act are not inimical in any way to C.N.E. theory. They offer broad guidelines for the practice of education and do not go beyond the first level of theory-making described above.

It is therefore impossible to answer satisfactorily the question whether the Act can be regarded as the implementation of a C.N.E. theory of education. There is no logical relationship between the broad general statements of the 1967 Act and the detailed ones of the 1948 C.N.E. policy statement. There often is in fact no logical relationship between the terms of any educational theory and any practical programme of educational activity. It is possible to establish the most efficient technique of teaching, quite independently of the broader theories or values in education. Gilbert Ryle makes the point that practice is not the stepchild of theory, that both can be conducted independently, and that just as there can be an intelligent or unintelligent approach to practice, so there can be good or bad theorising.

It an analysis of the theory and practice of C.N.E., therefore, it cannot be expected that there will be a logical inter-connection between the two. What one must do, rather, is analyse the theory and then describe some of the practices which appear to have been adopted because they support it. Exactly how theory and practice are connected cannot be completely determined.

A framework for the analysis

O'Connor (1957) suggests that educational theories contain statements

of three kinds, which can be identified by the kind of proof which is offered for them.

Firstly, there are metaphysical statements which concern the nature of reality: what man is, what the world is, whether there is a transcendental will, are examples of such concepts. If a transcendental will is recognised, it can be spiritual or material (as in the thinking of those who elevate the state to a position of primacy). Metaphysical statements cannot be proved or disproved. Their truth cannot be demonstrated by empirical observation, by deductive or inductive reasoning, or by any means which is capable of an objective check.

Secondly, there are statements which are judgements of value, concerning the rightness of our procedures, the rights and wrongs of individual life and social organisations. These statements are obviously capable of great divergency of opinion about the goals to be sought, and here again no infallible proofs can be offered for their rightness or wrongness. The best that can be offered in the way of proof is the universal or near universal acceptance of their value, and their coherence with other values.

Thirdly, there are empirical statements which recommend particular educational practices. These statements can be supported by the efficiency with which the procedures work. Although a theory may support their adoption, their success is pragmatically determined, and teachers can use the method without understanding the theory at all. The project method of teaching can, for example, be used without accepting Dewey's theory of instrumentalism.

Since there is no necessary logical connection between the three kinds of statements - metaphysical, judgements of value, and empirical - C.N.E. practice will not be clearly associated with its theory.

Metaphysical statements in C.N.E. theory

The metaphysics of C.N.E. is based upon an interpretation of Calvinism, largely by such theologians as A. Kuyper and some Dutch Reformed theologians in South Africa. This interpretation inclines towards a fundamentalist acceptance by faith of the Bible as the authority for the way of life to be adopted by the Afrikaner.

This understanding of Calvinism highlights election and predestination and tends to apply them in our situation to the Afrikaner *volk*. It also stresses the concept of original sin, and its interpretation of this is such that it produces a negative understanding of a person's ability to learn through experience and stresses discipline, narrowly conceived, as an essential and basic means of education.

Judgements of value in C.N.E. theory

These are concerned with the will of God for his people. This would

appear to be that the Afrikaner must survive as a separate volk or nation, with its own language and with a special divinely-ordained role as trustee for all the peoples of South Africa. The duty of the people is to love and honour God.

The national values for life are that children should be educated according to their own nature and the nature of the group to which they belong (volksaard) and that they should love what is their own, that is, their distinctive identity. If this does not happen they will lose their identity, and they will become superficial people, confused and soulless.

Empirical statements

There are few purely empirical statements in C.N.E. theory. The statement that education should be based on the thorough knowledge of the child and on time-tested practice is one example. It might also be argued that the principle of instruction through the mother tongue is an empirical statement and not simply one of value. Most of the principles laid down for the practice of education, however, are based on theoretical statements of the two kinds given above, rather than on an empirical basis.

Some of the practices which are adopted because they seem to support the theory of C.N.E.

C.N.E. demands that the curriculum, organisation, method and discipline of the school should be steeped in the principles of C.N.E. The religious spirit should permeate all subjects and the entire school, and all aspects of teaching in the school should promote the national principle: love of one's own language, history and culture. Article 6 of the 1948 policy statement says '... all teaching must be Christian-national; in no subject may anti-Christian or non-Christian, or anti-national or non-national propaganda be made'.

This and the following quotations are translated from the 1948 pamphlet issued by the Institute for Christian National Education.

The sub-sections of Article 6 describe the content of education. The curriculum is to include Bible Study and religious teaching; mother-tongue instruction; civics interpreted to the child as the need to preserve the Christian and national character of home, school, church and state; geography to give a thorough knowledge of one's own country; and history, interpreted as the gradual realisation of God's will and emphasising the place of the nation in that will. A study of history is regarded as the best means of cultivating the love of one's own which is nationalism.

Article 8 deals with control of education and with the relationship between the social organisations concerned in education - the home,

church, school and state. This relationship is more fully examined in the work by Coetzee already referred to.

An important principle is that there are to be separate schools for Afrikaans-speaking pupils, with Afrikaans only as the medium of instruction. English-speaking pupils are likewise to have their own separate schools with English as the medium of instruction.

Articles 10 to 13 refer to the provision and organisation of education at different age levels, at each of which the Christian-national principle is to play its part. Articles 14 and 15 are devoted to the education of the other racial groups. The principles that seem to be espoused for the 'Coloured' and 'Native' groups are as follows:

(i) acceptance of the C.N.E. viewpoint

(ii) acceptance of group separateness

(iii) acceptance of the Afrikaner group as a senior or trustee group

(iv) acceptance that the other groups must be financially responsible for their own education

(v) acceptance of the principle of mother tongue education

(vi) acceptance of the principle that each group must provide its own teachers.

The relationship between C.N.E. theory and current practice in the state schools

The logical independence of different kinds of statements contained in a theory, including that of C.N.E., makes it difficult to answer the question as to how C.N.E. theory is implemented in current educational practice. It can easily be argued that C.N.E. theory is not applied as the official educational policy of South Africa, especially since there is considerable confusion about what constitutes the theory, and since statements of the theory can be made at different levels of complexity and can be juggled about to serve the political purposes of the moment.

The current policy for education in South Africa does, however, bear some very significant marks of C.N.E. thinking. It seems necessary to analyse critically the many and varied ways in which C.N.E. has permeated the state system of education since 1948, without becoming bogged down in fruitless speculation as to the precise degree of correspondence between theory and practice.

3. STATE EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND C.N.E.

The National Education Policy Act of 1967 obviously bears some of those 'very significant marks of C.N.E. thinking' mentioned in the previous paragraph, as, for example, in its insistence on mother tongue instruction, and in its attempt to base education for all white children on a Christian and national foundation. Some people have regarded the introduction of this Act as the culmination of attempts to permeate all education in South Africa with C.N.E., but, for the reasons previously given, it seems fruitless to debate this.

An attempt will now be made to discuss specific aspects of C.N.E. policy, to show how and where they have been implemented or foreshadowed in legislation, and to comment on how these accord with educational principles and practices, as generally accepted in the Western world.

Religious teaching

Article 6 (2) states: 'By religious teaching we understand instruction chiefly in Bible history ... and instruction in Christian doctrine (geloofsleer). Religious teaching must accord with the faith and convictions of the parents ... as it is expressed in the creed which the parents have adopted. For Afrikaans-speaking children this means that the instruction must correspond with the creeds of our three Afrikaner Churches'.

Four examples can be given of practices in state education which seem to follow C.N.E. policy in regard to religious teaching:

(i) The Transvaal High School syllabus in religious instruction (1968) is based on a draft prepared by the three Afrikaner churches. Their draft was modified by the syllabus committee of the Transvaal Education Department, but it still proved unacceptable to the 'English' churches. As a result of strong representations from the latter, the syllabus was further modified in its English versions, so that for the first time a syllabus differs slightly for children of the two language groups.

(ii) The final (Afrikaans) version of the syllabus, although modified from the original draft submitted by the churches, was described by Professor C.F. Gunther of Stellenbosch as basically Calvinist in character. Much of what was included in it, he said, belonged more properly to the 'catechism class and Sunday school' than to public schools (Article in *Die Unie*, official organ of the Suid-Afrikaanse Onderwysersunie, Cape).

(iii) Difficulties similar to those mentioned in the first example were experienced when a draft syllabus in religious instruction, prepared for the former Union Education Department in accordance with the tenets of the three Dutch Reformed Churches, was deemed undesirable by the

Christian Council and was subsequently withdrawn from English-medium institutions.

(iv) The basic structure of the Transvaal high school syllabus is in fact that suggested by Professor Bingle (an enthusiastic protagonist of C.N.E.) in his book, *Metodiek van Godsdiensonderig op die Middelbare Skool.*

Such examples seem to accord with the permeation of the public school system by 'our Christian and National task and direction' demanded in Article 7 of the C.N.E. pamphlet. This conflicts with the generally accepted principle that in public schools, supported by the taxes of all citizens, a Christian spirit should mean 'commitment to the universal faith of Christians' rather than the more specific formulation of a Christian spirit in the light of a specific creed peculiar to one denomination. This is more appropriate in private schools run by different churches or communities. This is the only sound principle in a heterogeneous country where all people, whatever their church or national or racial group, contribute, through direct and indirect taxation, to public funds which pay for state education.

The content of religious instruction in public schools is a matter of difficulty in other countries as well. The crucial question in South Africa is not whether there should be religious education in public schools, but whether that education should be shaped basically by the proposals of the Dutch Reformed Churches, or whether it should be based on proposals agreed on, after consultation, by all the major Christian denominations in South Africa.

Mother tongue instruction

Article 6 (3) states: 'The mother tongue shall be the only medium in the teaching of all other subjects except other modern languages. Bilingualism cannot be set as the aim of teaching'. And Article 15 applies this principle to African education: 'The mother tongue shall be the basis of native education'.

There are three situations which seem to reflect this aim:

(i) While previously mother tongue instruction was compulsory for white children to the end of the primary school, this has now been extended so that children are compelled to attend schools teaching through the medium of their mother tongue to the end of compulsory education, which generally means the end of Standard 8.

(ii) In Natal, where the choice of medium has always been with the parents, the National Education Policy Act of 1967 has now forced mother tongue instruction as well, irrespective of the wishes of the Natal

Provincial Council or of the parents of the children.

(iii) In African education, in which mother tongue instruction was previously applied to the end of Standard 2, it has now been extended to the end of Standard 6, the end of the higher primary school. After this, 'half the subjects not taught through an African language must be taught through the medium of English and the other half through the medium of Afrikaans. Exemptions might be granted if teachers were unable to do this'. (M. Horrell, *Bantu Education to 1968*, p. 59).

Arguments against the rigid implementation of the principle of mother tongue instruction have been presented in Chapter 5, (xviii) and recommendations 20 and 21.

Civics

C.N.E. policy is expressed as follows in Article 6 (4): 'Every pupil must be formed into a Christian and National citizen of our country ... Civics must be taught so that each in his turn shall preserve the Christian and National character of home, church, society and the state'.

There are three possible ways in which this viewpoint can be implemented: in syllabuses, in textbooks, and through the exhortations of educational leaders.

As regards syllabuses, there are indications that attempts to give these a specific C.N.E. interpretation and to make a Senior Course compulsory in the Transvaal have, so far, failed.

There are several examples in textbooks where pride in one's language and cultural group is stressed above a South African patriotism embracing all people in the country. One such example is contained in *Voorligting vir Standerd 8*, by Bekker and Potgieter: 'We are Afrikaners ... we cannot be Afrikaners in the true sense of the word if we are not also Christians ... Inter-marriage between people of different language backgrounds should be discouraged'.

Innumerable speeches by educational leaders and articles in educational journals emphasise the need to inculcate a national consciousness as Afrikaners in Afrikaans-speaking children; rarely is a common South Africanism advocated. Three examples may suffice to illustrate this:

(i) 'When we, as the Afrikaans nation (volk), speak of our national holidays, we mean those holidays which we have adopted as our own through our history and our own national life'. (Opening sentence in an editorial in *Educa*, June 1964, entitled 'The Child and our National Holidays').

(ii) '... in education, Afrikaans-English integration has progressed so far that it is difficult today precisely to distinguish what was original

from Afrikaans and what from English. The people of South Africa call on the teachers to end the integration process ... Schools will have to reflect anew on how the child can be made conscious of his nation and tradition, devoted to his church ...' (Address to the Transvaalse Onderwysersunie conference by D.P. Goosen, January, 1965).

(iii) 'As far as the national ideal is concerned, we believe that the children must be educated through the medium of the mother tongue in their own people's culture (volkskultuur) and in everything that belongs to his own so that as an adult he, in his own turn, will make his contribution to the language, culture, character and calling of his people (volk). The aim of education must thus be the purposeful forming of the individual from a state of non-adulthood to adulthood, in accordance with generally accepted norms and principles as they have found their own expression (neerslag) from Christian-Western civilisation and the Christian National life- and world-view of the Afrikaner'. (From Mr Krog's Presidential address to the Natalse Onderwysersunie, 1966).

The main objection to viewing citizenship in this light is simply that it places loyalty to Afrikanerdom above loyalty to South Africa as a whole, and thus fails to foster national unity. This conflicts not only with the viewpoint of the Message to the People of South Africa, but also with that of the Transvaal Education Ordinance, 1953, as expressed in Article 3: 'Provincial education policy shall be ... so planned as to foster national unity and promote racial co-operation In South Africa'.

Geography

C.N.E. policy with regard to the teaching of geography is expressed in Article 6 (5): 'Every nation is rooted in its own soil allotted to it by the Creator ... every citizen of our country must have a sound knowledge of our soil ... this knowledge must be communicated to the pupil in such a way that he will love our own soil, also in comparison and contrast with other countries ...'

Increased study time for South African geography was found in the geography syllabuses for Standard 6 to Standard 8 introduced in the Transvaal in 1959, with countries outside South Africa being studied in one and three-quarter years instead of two and a half years (out of three) as previously. Subsequent syllabus revision has adhered to the 1959 pattern. In some syllabuses, a study of 'Children of Other Lands', once a feature of junior school work, has now been omitted.

Without neglecting knowledge of our own country, we ought to see to it that in the latter decades of the twentieth century our children learn more, not less, of other lands, which we can now reach in a matter of hours, and from which we hope to, and in fact do, gain increasing numbers of visitors and settlers.

Besides, the Afrikaner shares the soil of South Africa with many other groups of the South African population. To imply that God allotted South Africa, or even that part of it outside the African Reserves, to the Afrikaners alone, is historically false, morally wrong, and, from the Christian viewpoint, intolerably arrogant.

History

Article 6 (6) states: '... God has willed separate nations and peoples and has given each separate nation and people its particular vocation ... each nation can only fulfil its vocation and task to the glory of God when it labours in everything in subjection to the Word of God in all things ... Youth should ... acquire through instruction in history, a true vision of the origin of the nation and the nation's cultural heritage and of the content of the good direction in that heritage. We believe that next to the mother tongue the history of the fatherland is the great means of cultivating love of one's own'.

There has been steady, and in several cases successful, pressure to confine primary school history teaching to South African history only. Protagonists have also successfully campaigned against the subject Social Studies which was abandoned in the Transvaal in 1966. While Social Studies, a combination of history, geography, and elements of other subjects, was taught, its syllabus was constricted both geographically and historically to an undesirable extent.

The main section of the latest Transvaal primary school history syllabus (1966) deals with South African history only, except in Standard 3 where the main section is introduced by a study of 'attempts to find a sea route to India' and of 'dangers of land routes, Marco Polo, Tycho Brahe, Copernicus and Galileo'. This wording excludes the voyages of Columbus and Magellan, which are presumably considered irrelevant as an introduction to South African history.

In addition to the main section, there is in each standard a general section in which such topics as 'persons who have served mankind' and 'aspects of ancient civilisation' may be studied on a selective basis. But the main aim of C.N.E. policy, of confining the primary school syllabus to 'vaderlandse geskiedenis' has been achieved, though with concessions to other viewpoints. (This subject is more fully analysed in Auerbach: *The Power of Prejudice in South African Education).*

There has been a persistent campaign to make history compulsory in the high school to Standard 10 (for white children). In the Transvaal it is compulsory to Standard 8, but the Director of Education has, so far, resisted pressures aimed at forcing pupils to take the subject for the public Standard 10 examinations irrespective of ability in the subject. The former minister of National Education was responsible for making

it compulsory to Standard 8 in Technical and Vocational schools when these were under his jurisdiction.

There has been much concern at the waning popularity of history in Afrikaans-medium schools in Standards 9 and 10, where it is an elective subject, and this has been used as a form of pressure to achieve the subject being made compulsory in those standards.

The Afrikaner's 'interpretation of history' has been frequently discussed (see, for example, a book of that title by Professor F.A. van Jaarsveld). There can be little doubt that certain textbook series, as well as much teaching in Afrikaans-medium schools throughout South Africa, foster the view that of all the Christian people in Southern Africa, only the Afrikaner has a Divine Mission. Two examples of this may suffice.

The first is from Dr P.J. Meyer's book, *Die Afrikaner* (1940), which was one of the first in a series of opinion-forming books in the Tweede-Trek series printed during the Second World War: 'The Great Trek, the First and Second War of Independence, the acceptance of Afrikaans as a national language, and the 1914 Rebellion were the missionary deeds of Boerdom in which the meaning and nature of its nationhood (volksskap) came into expression ' (p. 53).

The second is from *Geskiedenis vir Standerd 6,* the first of a three book series by Havinga, Otto and Roodt widely used in Afrikaans-medium schools in the Transvaal: 'Then the Lord planted a new nation at the southern tip of Africa ... this people was to stand on the verge of being wiped out in many cases and yet was to be saved in a wonderful manner' (p. 65). The final sentence in this textbook reads, 'From the political clashes of this new nation, its special characteristics will become apparent - its striving for freedom and race purity' (p. 149).

Separate development is now a compulsory section in the Standard 8 syllabus; this is striking evidence of teaching about 'the good trend in that heritage'.

Problems of historical interpretation are not confined to South Africa. Professor Keppel-Jones summed it up succinctly when he wrote, 'In South Africa we are in the peculiar position that the distortions which occur in our domestic history take the form which in other countries is taken in international distortions. They take the form of encouraging group pride and animosity against other racial and national groups which happen to be all inhabiting the same country. That makes the distortions of history in South Africa more immediately dangerous than perhaps in most other countries'.

The specific contribution of the C.N.E. philosophy to historical interpretation is to see South African history as the unfolding of God's plan with the Afrikaner nation. Perhaps the comment of Professor Vincent in *Aids to History Research* is apt here:- 'There are still people who

see the hand of an angry God in the misfortunes of their neighbours, but this assumes a confidential relationship to the Creator which oversteps the bounds of modesty. With the greatest goodwill and reverence one may hesitate to announce or predict the course of Providence' (p. 9). Particularly, one might add, when the neighbours involved (or their descendants) are fellow-citizens and usually fellow-Christians in a common fatherland.

It is to be noted that while textbooks with varying interpretations are available, syllabuses apply to the children of both language groups. Thus a restricted world view reflected in increased emphasis on local at the expense of general history in a school history syllabus, affects not only the children of those who accept the C.N.E. interpretation of history, but all children compelled to attend public schools.

Biology

This subject is not specifically mentioned in the C.N.E. policy statement, but it is well-known that it is due to the pressure exercised by believers in C.N.E. that evolution is not included in the Transvaal high school biology syllabus. The suggestion that it should be taught was once described publicly as 'shocking' by an inspector of education subscribing to C.N.E. views.

The Teacher

Article 9 states: 'The teacher should be a man of a Christian view of life, without which he is nothing less to us than the most deadly danger'.

The steady removal of the Conscience Clause is relevant here. When the clause was omitted from the University of Potchefstroom Act, it was stated that as this was a university for Christian Higher Education, it was a special case. Yet attempts were made a few years ago to modify or scrap the clause in the University of the O.F.S. Act. These were unsuccessful. Yet the clause is absent from the Acts of the Universities of Port Elizabeth, the RAU, and those at Belville (Coloured), Durban (Indian), Fort Hare, Turfloop and Ngoya (African). It has been replaced by one in which staff and students are expected to subscribe to the Preamble to the South African Constitution, which affirms the hand of God in the destinies of nations and people.

No legal attempt has, so far, been made to apply a religious test, though complaints about questions on church affiliations made by school committees recommending the appointment and promotion of teachers in Afrikaans-medium schools, are often heard.

Non-white Education

Articles 14 and 15 state: 'The Coloured man ... must be educated according to Christian National principles ... only when he has been Christianised can he and will he be truly happy and secure against his own heathen and all kinds of foreign ideologies which promise him sham happiness, but in the long run make him dissatisfied and unhappy.

'With regard to the national principle, we believe that the coloured man can be made race-conscious if the principle of apartheid is strictly applied in education just as in his church life.

'The financing of Coloured education must ... not occur at the cost of white education.

'The task of white South Africa to christianise the native and to help him on culturally ... has already found its closer focus in the principles of trusteeship, non-equality and segregation. Hence native education must be grounded in the life-and world-view of the whites, more especially of the Boer nation as the senior white trustee of the native.

'Native education must ... not occur at the cost of white education'.

The division of education into White, Bantu, Coloured and Indian is clearly foreshadowed above, and so is the principle of restricting the money contributed to African education from General Revenue. (The problem of mother-tongue instruction is referred to in detail in the full article 15, but has already been discussed).

It is self evident that to set out deliberately to make the Coloured man 'race-conscious' and to apply strict separation in church life is in conflict with the Message to the People of South Africa - so is educational separation as a religious *principle,* though it may be desirable as a matter of, one hopes, temporary practice because of geographical, linguistic and cultural considerations.

The injustice of forcing the Africans to finance most of their own education while not developing the higher education which would raise earnings and therefore their tax-paying capacity has often been stressed. It is still true that fewer than 50 per cent of those African children who start school reach Standard 3, the minimum level considered necessary to achieve literacy. This percentage has not significantly altered in over a decade. Progress in proceeding with compulsory education for all Coloured and Indian children is also slow, largely because the State restricts spending on this education so that it 'will not take place at the cost of white education'.

4. C.N.E. IN RELATION TO CHRISTIAN PRINCIPLES

We have already suggested that the 'Christian National' concept, as used in South Africa, has an exclusivist sense. In essence, it suggests

that it is specifically Christian to adopt a life-view which recognises the existence of separate nations, peoples and cultures as part of the eternally unchanging will of God. Nationalism thus becomes something holy, and the love for and preservation of one's 'own' a Christian virtue. It is claimed that this viewpoint is based on the Scriptures and is taught in the three creeds of the Reformed Churches.

The Christian National ideal is of a country in which the various peoples will form separate nationalities. Whatever wider meaning may be given to the word 'Christian', the term 'Christian National' suggests the conviction that the Christian faith can only be preserved and handed down within a framework of nationalism. Apartheid is both the starting point and the end - objective of C.N.E. There must be separation of English- and Afrikaans- speaking pupils, while the education of Africans and Coloureds, in separate schools, is seen as part of the missionary function of the whites, with the aim of convincing the other racial groups that their happiness and welfare lies in their very separateness and in separate Christian nationalities.

Six major criticisms can be levelled against these concepts in the light of Christian teaching:

1. The Christian faith is in its very nature supra-national and not national. In some minor ways the Christian Church adapts itself to different cultures and environments, but this remains secondary to its main task which is to establish God's kingdom on earth. The meaning of the gospel is in fact contradicted if such adaptations are not seen as a means to the end, which is the coming of God's kingdom, but as ends in themselves. There is no divine sanction for the differentiation and perpetuation of separate nationalisms.

2. In South Africa a major political party is based on the concept of nationalism and of the preservation of a particular 'nation'. The danger exists that, where the concepts 'Christian' and 'National' are combined, Christian sanction may be given to this or similar parties. Domination and tyranny practised by one group can thus be justified in terms of Christian faith. Intolerance and coercion in the name of Christ are the inevitable consequences. The whole concept of divinely ordained separate nationa*lisms* is nowhere taught in the Scriptures or in the Reformed creeds.

3. It is part of the Christian faith that the whole world should be brought under the liberating rule of Christ. The Christian Church naturally regards the school as one of the most important social institutions for its christianising function, but the matter is complicated because the school is a public institution and because South Africa, like most other countries, has a variety of faiths and denominations. One faith thus cannot claim to provide the foundation for public school instruction.

Alternatives to such an approach are outlined in Chapter 3 and we have made recommendations in Chapter 7.

4. The Christian National concept not only claims sole authority for the Reformed creeds, but also often misinterprets these by concluding that apartheid as taught and practised in South Africa, has to be obeyed as a divine commandment. This misinterpretation arises from the insistence on separate nationalisms. The emphasis on one's own group, however, leaves little room for the recognition of other groups. This is clearly seen in South Africa in the way in which the world- and life-view of the 'Afrikaner', who at present holds political power, is forced on to the other population groups through the education system, whether they concur or not, or whether it agrees with their own Christian convictions or not. The gospel is explicit that the reconciling work of Christ has made differences between peoples, languages and cultures merely relative and not absolute (see Phil. 3:1-8).

5. When love of one's own country is implied as a specifically Christian virtue because God predestined the habitation of each of his peoples, then it is more heathen than Christian (see Article 6.5 of C.N.E. policy). The Christian faith is founded on the revelation of God's kingdom on earth and on the universal brotherhood of all men. This determines the Christian's attitude towards his country. He loves it, because God loves it; he loves it, not because it is in contrast to the rest of the world, but because it is a part of that world which God created, loves and redeems. Ideally the Christian does not overemphasise his own country, 'for here we have no permanent home, but we are seekers after the city which is to come'. (Hebrews, 13:14).

6. It is true that a 'philosophy of history' can be constructed from Biblical revelation. There can be no theological objection against the Christian National idea that history must be judged as the struggle between the kingdoms of God and darkness (see Article 6.6 of C.N.E. policy). From an eschatological viewpoint, the whole of history unfolds to the ultimate revelation of God's kingdom on earth. It is characteristic of this view that all history tends towards universality. Everything which God has done and does is aimed at making all of one flesh and God in all. The choosing of Israel was not an end in itself, but is explained in the Scripture in relation to the universal plan of God. Christ is his gift to the world, and with the release of the Holy Spirit all national and language barriers are broken down. The Scriptural revelation reveals more and more the unity of all things in heaven and earth, under one lord in Christ (Eph. 1:10). In spite of everything that seems to contradict it, this is also the clear tendency in the world's history. Eschatologically, this growing reality of the unity of the world must not be feared

as an evil and a threat, but it must be welcomed as being in agreement with the revealed plan of God.

The C.N.E. idea that God has given each nation its own particular function in the fulfilment of his plan thus conflicts with a Biblical view of history as well as with the nature of the Church.

5. A BRIEF SUMMARY OF EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIONS TO C.N.E.

The two major criticisms of C.N.E. from an educational point of view are firstly that it is an authoritarian doctrine, and secondly that the doctrine is exclusivist and chauvinistic, but has been allowed to permeate the State educational system for all the people of South Africa. It promotes division between the peoples of the country, and enforces acceptance of the doctrine by authoritarian methods.

In amplifying these criticisms the following two points can be made:

(i) The authoritarianism of C.N.E. needs to be contrasted with a Christian liberal approach to knowledge. The essence of this approach to knowledge is to be uncommitted in the search for truth. Commitment to belief in Jesus Christ as the Son of God and our Redeemer is the mark of a Christian, with the result that a Christian is inevitably a committed person. But the nature of this commitment in no way prevents the believer from testing knowledge by whatever means are available, and from accommodating belief to demonstrated knowledge. A Christian can adopt a spirit of free enquiry in the pursuit of truth. C.N.E., on the other hand, does not allow this.

(ii) The authoritarianism of C.N.E. suggests to children that a political and expedient man-made pattern of apartheid society is sanctioned by God. Apartheid is presented in the schools as the only possible pattern for society in South Africa. In that the doctrine of apartheid is not presented as a possibly fallible arrangement, the rightness of which cannot be proved, our children are being submitted to political propaganda in the guise of God-given truth.